PROCEEDINGS
INTERNATIONAL SCIENTIFIC CONFERENCE “WESTERN BALKAN INFORMATION AND MEDIA LITERACY”
WBIMLC 2021

Epistemology: Opinion, Belief and the Reality

&

10th INTERNATIONAL SUMMIT OF THE BOOK 2021

9-10 December 2021

Bihac 2021
Saracevic, Tefko Ph.D., Keynote speaker, USA
Serageldin, Ismail Ph.D., Egypt
Singh Jagtar, PhD, Former Head, Department of Library and Information Science, Punjabi University, Patiala, India
Sobot, Pero M.A. IZUM, Institute of Information Sciences in Maribor, Slovenia
Soylu, Demet Ph.D., Research Assistant Department of Information Management Yildirim Beyazit University, Ankara, Turkey
Stankovic, Beba Senior Librarian, National Library of Serbia, Belgrade, Serbia
Telman, Fariza M.A. Nazarbayev University, Astana, Kazakhstan
CONTENTS

Introduction .................................................................................................................................................. 7

Keynote speakers, guest speakers and panel discussion participants ......................................................... 11

Christine Susan Bruce
Towards Ethical IL: A thought journey ...................................................................................................... 15

Elli Georgiadou, Kerstin Siaka, Harjinder Rahanu, Ratko Knezevic, Margaret Ross, Geoff Staples
Towards narrowing the socio-digital divide during and post the COVID-19 pandemic ....................................... 23

Demet Soylu, Mehmet Bilge Kağan Önaçan, Tunç D. Medeni, Tolga Medeni, Ratko Knezevic
A study on the identification of the perception of the undergraduate students towards plagiarism in the department of information management ................................................................. 37

Ali Demiröz, Tunç D. Medeni, Demet Soylu, Ratko Knezevic
Social services and information systems: an inquiry into turkish context ..................................................... 53

Tunç Durmuş Medeni, Ali Demiröz
An action research into and model development for social services provision ........................................... 71

Marwiyah, Labibah, Nur Riani & Thoriq Tri Prabowo
Evaluating the information literacy teaching using class action research approach: a case study at the department of Islamic history Un Sunan Kaliaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia .................................................................................................................... 87

Joseph Yap, Kevin Conrad T. Tansionco, Agnes Hajdu Barat
Digital Civic Engagement and Youth Participation: A Survey Research .................................................... 103

Amela Čolić, Nikola Findrik, Ratko Knežević, Božana Tomić
Linguistics training as a part of lifelong learning for law professionals ..................................................... 115

April R. Manabat
We’re getting engaged! Fostering student engagement in a virtual library instruction ...................................... 121
In 2012, the Limerick Institute of Technology (now Technological University of the Shannon-TUS) Library, Limerick, Ireland with colleagues from the University of Bihać, Bosnia and Herzegovina were instrumental in establishing a major annual International Conference in the Western Balkan region entitled the Western Balkan Information and Media Literacy Conference (WBIMLC) which now takes place in Bihać, Bosnia and Herzegovina each year. Prior to this intervention, the term Information Literacy was almost unknown within library and academic circles in Western Balkan universities. The Western Balkan Information and Media Literacy Conference (WBIMLC) is supported, inspired by and dedicated to the work and achievements of European Union Capacity Building in the Field of Higher Education (CBHE) project 561987 Library Network Support Services (LNSS): modernizing libraries in Western Balkan countries through staff development and reforming library services, as a sustainability of the project. This is a unique, pioneering European Union funded project which aims to reinforce and modernize libraries and improve the level of competencies and skills of library staff in the Western Balkan countries by developing innovative libraries as a support to education and lifelong learning. CBHE is the European Union’s program which aims to support the modernization, accessibility, and internationalization of higher education in the Partner Countries in regions such as Eastern Europe, Central Asia, the Western Balkans and the Mediterranean region, mainly through university cooperation projects. The wider objective of the LNSS project is to reinforce and modernize libraries and improve the level of competencies and skills of library staff in the Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) and in Society by developing innovative libraries as a support to education and lifelong learning. The specific objectives of the project are to implement English for Specific Purposes (Libraries and library terminology) training for all target groups; to undertake in depth training needs detection and assessment with competency mapping; to implement an innovative Train the Trainers program as part of an LNSS Curriculum incorporating a suite of quality, relevant and modern library staff development modules addressing the most urgent training needs of 21st century librarians and library staff in the Information Age. The project will develop and implement IL and Research Skills training programs in libraries and in HEIs to help learners identify, locate, evaluate, and effectively and ethically use information in their daily lives for lifelong learning and the Knowledge Economy. Other key objectives are to hold Library Training Seminars and Workshops involving all Stakeholders for exchange of experience to improve the competencies and skills of Librarians. Strategic planning issues are also addressed such as the development of a Consortium Strategic Plan for the effective future development of libraries in both Regions and to implement this plan. The project will also develop initiatives to ensure access to and democratization of libraries for people with disabilities. Development of Frameworks for Library Collection Development Policy to meet the needs of academic staff and students in each Institute/University in the project are also a key goal. There were more projects that derived from this action such as LNSS in Armenia, Moldova and Belarus https://lnss-projects.eu/amb/, as well as the DIREKT project Developing trans-regional IL for lifelong learning and the knowledge economy in Europe and Asia https://direkt-cbhe.com/ The Conference takes its inspiration also from previous European Union projects such as Tempus Project 517117 Developing information literacy for lifelong learning and knowledge economy in Western Balkan countries. This was a unique, pioneering European Union funded project which developed information literacy for lifelong learning in the Western Balkans during the period 2011-2015. More recently, the Conference has placed increased emphasis on the area of democratisation of education for people with disabilities. Partners involved in the landmark CBHE funded Developing Services for Individuals with Disabilities (DECIDE) project which will foster the right of individuals with special needs in Uzbekistan, Tajikistan and Kazakhstan to access education and enjoy the right of participation in everyday society and will combat discrimination by instilling awareness and acceptance in society as in line
with the Bologna Process and the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities actively participated in the Conference this year. This year, WBIMLC was also delighted to host a Pre-Conference Workshop for the first time on the topic of 3D printing support service for innovative citizens (INNO3D) EU project which is funded under the ERASMUS+ Strategic Partnerships for Higher Education funding programme.

The Western Balkan Information and Media Literacy Conference is now listed among the most important Information Literacy Conferences of the World. This year, WBIMLC which was held in fully hybrid format for the first time, with delegates participating both online and in person in Bihać, has again attracted delegates from all over the world. Apart from the representatives coming from Bosnia and Herzegovina there were delegates for example from Australia, Egypt, India, Ireland, Indonesia, South African Republic, Norway, Greece, Romania, Hungary, Slovenia, Croatia, Serbia, Turkey, Saudi Arabia, United Arab Emirates, Bangladesh, Iraq, United Kingdom, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Portugal, Thailand, USA etc. As a result of the involvement of leading international experts in the IL field in WBIMLC, the concept of Information Literacy which prior to WBIMLC was almost completely unknown in the Western Balkan region has firmly taken hold and is now embedded in many universities in the Region.

This conference presents Conference papers in two sections. First presented are those papers by the Keynote and Guest Speakers. Later in the proceedings are the papers of those representatives from many other parts of the world who recognise that the Western Balkans due largely to the work of this CBHE project and previous projects is now becoming an important centre and champion of information literacy globally. The conference emphasises the positive influence of European Union funding programmes in regions such as the Western Balkans in accelerating strategic engagement with IL in the region making Information literacy a high priority for both educators and learners in the Western Balkans into the future. We must be mindful also that Information Literacy is no longer a university or even library centric phenomenon as commentators such as Paul Zurkowski have already proposed. Now a more universal approach is needed across all sectors and affecting all citizens and society in general. This has been highlighted by the Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals (CILIP) in the UK and their high-level definition of Information Literacy (April 2018): Information Literacy is the ability to think critically and make balanced judgments about any information we find and use. It empowers us as citizens to reach and express informed views and to engage fully with society.

Amalgamation of International Summit of the Book with WBIMLC 2021.

This year, the International Summit of the Book was held in conjunction with the Western Balkan Information and Media Literacy Conference (WBIMLC) for only the second time. Owing to unprecedented challenges encountered with Covid 19, during 2020 and 2021 we decided to amalgamate these two important international conferences for the second consecutive year. Inspired by the famous and highly influential inventor and engineer Nikola Tesla (1856-1943), who was born not far from Bihać, the theme of his years' Summit was Of all things, I liked books best, taken from Tesla's own writings.
Despite this dreadful worldwide pandemic which continues to pose significant challenges, these two important and far-reaching events (WBIMLC and the Summit) still took place in December 2020 and took place again this year in 2021. We continue to fight to keep the International Summit of the Book, now in its 10th year, alive and thriving despite trials and tribulations in Beirut, Lebanon in 2019 when the Summit unfortunately could not take place owing to the political situation in Lebanon at that time and the more recent, unprecedented challenges presented by the pandemic in 2020 when both WBIMLC and the Summit were held virtually for the first time.

In 2021, we continued the momentum and tradition of holding this fantastic Information and Media Literacy conference in Bihać, Bosnia and Herzegovina, which was one of the few International Library or Information Literacy conferences that took place in 2020 or 2021. At WBIMLC and the International Summit of the Book 2020, Online was the main expression of both conferences. This year, saw delegates joining us in person in Bihać, on the banks of the beautiful River Una for the first time since pre-pandemic times in 2019, for these momentous and historic events in what was another memorable year for the library community and all humanity.

About the International Summit of the Book.
The “International Summit of the Book” is a US Library of Congress initiative. The Summit discusses the development of books into electronic formats and its impact on reading; the challenges facing books and the publishing industry, as well as the role of books and reading in societies. The Summit also discusses key issues on technology and manuscripts, including the role of translation in the preservation and transmission of culture, and books as an important tool in cultural exchange. In previous years the Summit has been held across a number of continents and cities that have a global cultural impact in countries such as the United States, Singapore, France, Egypt, Ireland, Romania, Azerbaijan, and as highlighted, the Summit has been held in Bosnia and Herzegovina for the past two years (2020 and 2021).

Pre-Conference INNO3D Workshop.
This year’s WBIMLC also featured a Pre-Conference Workshop for the first time, on the important topic of 3D Printing in libraries in association with the 3D printing support service for innovative citizens (INNO3D) EU funded project. The workshop featured contributions from various INNO3D project partners including Romania, Greece, Spain, Portugal, Ireland, and Slovakia. The workshop was focussed on giving participants an appreciation, awareness and an introduction to key practices and concepts in the area of 3D Printing in libraries including areas such as 3D printing services and competencies in Academic Libraries, Best practices for 3D Printing in Libraries, Library makerspaces, 3D Printer usage in teaching. The event also featured a lively and informative Roundtable Discussion on the topic The Future of 3D Printing in Libraries and Information Literacy. The INNO3D project aims to develop tools to train Librarians in using 3D printing so that they have the skills to train library users to use 3D Printing effectively. This is a dedicated service offered in libraries by librarians who as a result of the training that the INNO3D project will provide, will be able to instruct all citizens whether students, members of the public or anyone who is interested in the use of 3D printing. The project will enhance the quality and relevance of knowledge and skills of librarians to teach people in the area of 3D Printing leading to the reshaping and re-imagining of library services in EU countries. This truly ground-breaking project is led by LIT Library. The project also has partners from Romania, Greece, Slovakia, Spain, and Portugal and is the first project of its kind to be implemented in Europe. The project is designed to improve and diversify the services offered to users of university and other libraries by offering these library users key skills and the opportunity to develop 3D printing competencies. This will be achieved by training librarians who will then train library users, students, staff, and citizens in general to use 3D Printing services.
Keynote Speakers and Honoured Guests.
We were honoured also to have some world-renowned figures from the world of libraries and information literacy as well as pioneering figures in the development of the Internet as Keynote Speakers. The opening speech was delivered by H.E. Myles Geiran, Ambassador of Ireland in Slovenia accredited to Bosnia and Herzegovina. The keynote and guest speakers were Ismail Serageldin the Emeritus Librarian of Alexandria, and who was the Founding Director of the Bibliotheca Alexandrina, the New Library of Alexandria (2001-2017) in Egypt, Vinton G. Cerf, Vice President and Chief Internet Evangelist for Google and co-designer of the architecture of the Internet and Tonia Arahova - IFLA President-elect. Other Keynote Speakers included Christine Bruce, Dean, Graduate Research at James Cook University, Australia, Sanda Erdelez, Chair-elect for the iSchools Organisation and a Professor and Director at Simmons University School of Library and Information Science, Frode Alexander Hegland- software developer who is creating augmented text software for macOS and Editor of ‘The Future of Text’ book as well as Dr. Dilara Begum, Associate Professor and Chairperson, Department of Information Studies and Library Management and Librarian (In-charge) at East West University, Dhaka, Bangladesh.

We were privileged also that Information Literacy founder and visionary Paul G. Zurkowski could join us as our Keynote Speaker for the Western Balkan Information and Media Literacy Conference (WBIMLC). We were truly delighted and honored that Mr Zurkowski who was the first President and General Counsel of the Information Industry Association and who famously coined the phrase ‘Information Literacy’ in his paper ‘The Information Service Environment: Relationships and Priorities’ could join us again at WBIMLC where he delivered a keynote speech on the topic of ‘Disruptive technology: from the Book to Information Literacy’. This year’s event also featured a fascinating Roundtable Discussion on ‘The Future of Text’, hosted by Ismail Serageldin (Egypt), Frode A. Hegland (UK) and Vinton G. Cerf.

WBIMLC together with the 10th International Summit of the Book was another unforgettable event which highlights that this Western Balkan region continues to be an important centre and champion of information literacy and libraries globally.

Editorial Board WBIMLC 2021 & 10th Summit of the Book.
Ismail Serageldin

Ismail Serageldin is the Emeritus Librarian of Alexandria, and was the Founding Director of the Bibliotheca Alexandrina, the New Library of Alexandria (2001-2017) in Egypt. Before that he was the Vice-President of the World Bank (1993-2000), and Chairman of the Consultative Group for International Agricultural Research (CGIAR), Founding Chairman of The Consultative Group to Assist the Poorest: A micro-finance program (CGAP), and the Global Water Partnership (GWP). He currently serves on many advisory boards and committees for academic, research, scientific and international institutions and civil society efforts, including as Co-Chair of the Nizami Ganjavi International Center (NGIC). He is also a Patron of the International Science Council (ISC).

He has received many awards including the Order of the Rising Sun of Japan, The Pablo Neruda Medal of Chile and is a knight of the French Legion d’Honneur and a Commander of Arts and Letters of the French Republic.

He graduated from Cairo University and holds a PhD from Harvard University. He was a distinguished professor at Wageningen University and the College de France in Paris. He has lectured widely, published more than 100 books and 500 articles, and has received and 40 honorary doctorates from all over the world.

Paul G. Zurkowski

Information Literacy founder and visionary Paul G. Zurkowski became the first president and general counsel of the Information Industry Association (IIA) with offices in the shadow of the US Capital, Washington, DC from 1969-1989. He coined the phrase “information literacy” in 1974 in his landmark Related Paper Number Five addressed to the National Commission on Libraries and Information Science for the National Program on Library and Information Services titled The Information Service Environment Relationships and Priorities in 1974. In his paper he famously called for the Commission to establish “…a major national program to achieve universal information literacy…”

Mr. Zurkowski received his undergraduate degree from the University of Wisconsin-Whitewater and his law degree from the University of Wisconsin-Madison Law School. Mr. Zurkowski was born in November of 1932 in the US state of Wisconsin. He has been married to Margaret “Peg” (Becker) Zurkowski for over 60 years. They have six children and eleven grandchildren.
Christine Bruce
Professor Christine Bruce is presently Dean, Graduate Research at James Cook University, Australia. Her research contributions focus on information literacy, higher education learning and teaching and higher degree research study and supervision, and research collaboration. She authored Seven Faces of Information Literacy, and Informed Learning, and was lead editor of Information Experience. She works with colleagues on the application of informed learning theory to research and practice, and on developing new theory emerging from this process; notably informed systems, information experience, informed learning design and information experience design amongst others form a significant research track.

Prior to 2018 she was convenor of the Queensland University of Technology Higher Education Research Network, and Academic Program Director – Research Training for the Science and Engineering Faculty. She served as Director and Assistant Dean, Teaching and Learning for the Faculty of Information Technology between 2001-2006. She was awarded an Australian Learning and Teaching Council Fellowship in 2008 to investigate the pedagogy of supervision in IT and Engineering, later expanded to the STEM disciplines. In 2015 she was appointed Senior Fellow of the UK Higher Education Academy for contributions around postgraduate study and supervision. Later in 2015 she was admitted as a Principal Fellow to the UK Higher Education Academy for learning and teaching impact, including around postgraduate study and supervision. In 2010 Christine received a Library Board of Queensland Award for contributions to information literacy research and education.

Her academic experience includes collaboration across multiple disciplines (health, education, engineering, information technology, built environment for example) as well as with industry partners, students and colleagues around the world spanning her academic career (33 years).

Dr. Sanda Erdelez
Dr. Sanda Erdelez is Chair-elect for the iSchools Organisation and a Professor and Director at Simmons University School of Library and Information Science.

She received her LL.B. and LL.M degrees from the University of Osijek Law School (Croatia) and Ph.D. in information transfer from Syracuse University.

She was also a faculty member at the University of Missouri, University of Texas at Austin and University of Osijek. Dr. Erdelez is a former Fulbright Scholar and recipient of The Texas Excellence Teaching Award and The ALISE Pratt-Severn Faculty Innovation Award.

Her research interests include human information behavior, human-computer interaction and usability evaluation in online environments.

She has been internationally recognized for her pioneering research in the areas of information encountering and opportunistic discovery of information. Her research has received funding from both corporate and government sources including Dell Inc., SBC Communication, Texas State Government, and NSF.

She is an active member of the Association for Information Science & Technology (ASIS&T), where she has served in numerous leadership roles including the chair of Special Interest Group on Information Seeking and Use (SIG USE) and member of the ASIS&T Board of Directors. In 2015, Dr. Erdelez received the Outstanding Contribution to Information Behavior Research Award from SIG USE and also became a member of the SIG USE Academy of Fellows.
Dr. Dilara Begum
Dr. Dilara Begum is Associate Professor and Chairperson, Department of Information Studies and Library Management and Librarian (In-charge) at East West University, Dhaka, Bangladesh. She has completed her Ph. D. from Punjabi University Patiala, India. She was a former fellow of IFLA, ALP (Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand). She has more than 20 years of experiences in research, teaching, and information management. Her research interest includes information management, digital library, information literacy, open access etc. She has been elected as Professional Division Committee Chair and Asia Oceania Regional Division Committee member of International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions (IFLA) for 2021-2023. She has acted elected Secretary of Information Literacy Section of IFLA. Beside these, she has served in numerous significant and diversified roles including General Secretary, DLNetSA, Country Coordinator of Information Literacy Consortium sponsored by UNESCO, Standing Committee Member of ECIL in 2013 to till now, elected Senior Vice President and Women Affairs Secretary of Library Association of Bangladesh (LAB) from 2009-2014. She was also the President (Acting) of Library Association of Bangladesh (LAB) in 2011. She has more than Fifty (50) national and international publications. She is considered one of the pioneers of Digital Library building in Bangladesh and as well as an international expert on the mentioned field. She has been awarded with the prestigious award, "Prof. Indira Parikh 50 Women in Education Leaders" on 05th July 2018 in Mumbai at the World Education Congress recognizing her contribution in education.

Vinton G. Cerf
Vinton G. Cerf is vice president and Chief Internet Evangelist for Google. With Robert Kahn, Vint is the co-designer of the architecture of the Internet. In 1997 they received the U.S. National Medal of Technology and in 2005, the Presidential Medal of Freedom and the ACM Turing Award. In April 2008 they shared the Japan Prize for their work and in 2013, the Queen Elizabeth Prize for Engineering. He is a member of the US National Academies of Science and Engineering and the Legion d'Honneur.

Vint Cerf served as chairman of the board of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN) from 2000-2007 and he has been a Visiting Scientist at the Jet Propulsion Laboratory since 1998. He holds a Ph.D. in Computer Science from UCLA and twenty-nine honorary degrees.
Tonia Arahova
Tonia Arahova is IFLA President-elect, and will serve as IFLA President from 2023 to 2025. She is the President of the General Council for Libraries of Greece, a post she has held since June 2021. Previously, she has been responsible for the organization of the Library of the President of the Hellenic Republic, as well as Chief Operating Officer at the National Library of Greece. She holds a bachelor degree in Greek Literature from the National and Kapodistrian University of Athens, MRA (Master in Public Management & Public Policy) from the Department of International and European Economic Studies of Athens University of Economics and Business and Ζ's (Master in Communication and Mass Media in the Field of Political Communication) from the National and Kapodistrian University of Athens with thesis on cultural diplomacy, social media and presidential libraries. She has participated in many international conferences and has published articles on strategic management, marketing, cultural heritage promotion and cultural diplomacy.

Frode Alexander Hegland
Frode Alexander Hegland is a software developer creating augmented text software for macOS, Editor of The Future of Textbook and host of the annual Future of Text Symposium. https://futuretextpublishing.com
https://www.augmentedtext.info
ABSTRACT
In this paper I reflect on the conference topic of Epistemology, opinions, beliefs and realities, and propose that two complementary elements, values and ethics deserve additional close attention, as the conference elements could be seen as contributing aspects of an Information Literacy Ethics Framework. The development of an IL Ethics Framework is an important progression for the IL agenda as scholars and practitioners increasingly deepen and extend that domain. The IL Ethics Framework I propose assumes understandings of information literacy that permeate all aspects of disciplinary, professional, organizational, social and economic pursuits. It assumes information and other professionals developing IL programs in a range of contexts, seeking to activate information empowerment in others as well as in themselves.

I present for consideration some possible elements of an IL Ethics Framework, including a) the central principles of being other focused and empowering, b) the actions of creating programs that are grounded in beliefs and c) some suggested personal values that might underpin IL programs and personal activity. Each of these elements is discussed and an invitation extended to consider their development, adaptation or application in particular contexts. To conclude, I highlight some information literacy research and scholarship and professional activity which would seem to resonate with the ethical framework proposed.

Introduction
When I accepted the invitation to present the keynote address at this conference I was very taken with the theme of Epistemologies, opinions, beliefs, and realities. I could see that information literacy scholars have been interested in the question of epistemology for very many years, and have been consciously adopting an inclusive approach to knowledge, valuing the approaches to knowledge of many cultures and diverse groups. Only recently, Lisa Hinchcliffe captured this direction using the label of epistemology:

“...I am putting forth that we should adopt an epistemology of inclusion, equity, and social justice” (Hinchcliffe, 2018)

As I explored the meaning of knowledge, beliefs, opinions and realities, I came to see that our knowledge about Information Literacy (IL) is closely related to what we believe about IL and its many dimensions; these beliefs influence our actions, our personal actions and professional programming, which in turn create new realities for ourselves and others. Very closely linked to these ideas, are our values that guide our actions. Making explicit, and taking responsibility for these elements and how they influence what we do, is an ethical responsibility we have as information literacy professionals. A graphical representation of these ideas appears in Figure One, below. The arrows represent lines of influence.
While values and ethics are not explicitly present in our conference theme, I propose that considering them also, as part of a value driven ethical framework, is an important development for the information literacy agenda.

**Puddleglum on knowledge, beliefs and realities**

Let’s first look at the words in our conference theme, by considering a short story moment that I have extracted from C.S. Lewis’s children’s tale *The Silver Chair*. The background to this moment is that one of the characters, Puddleglum, and his friends, have strayed from the Overworld to the Underworld where trees, sun, moon and stars are no longer visible. They are being persuaded by the queen of the underworld that such things don’t exist. As they start to accept the non-existence of the Overland, Puddleglum intervenes:

> All you’ve been saying is quite right, I shouldn’t wonder. I’m a chap who always liked to know the worst and then put the best face I can on it. So I won’t deny any of what you said. But there’s one more thing to be said, even so. **Suppose we have only dreamed, or made up**, **all those things**—trees and grass and sun and moon and stars and Aslan himself. **Suppose we have, then all I can say is that, in that case, the made-up things seem a good deal more important than the real ones**. Suppose this black pit of a kingdom of yours is the only world. Well, it strikes me as a pretty poor one. And that’s a funny thing, when you come to think of it. We’re just babies making up a game, if you’re right. But four babies playing a game can make a play-world which licks your real world hollow. That’s why I’m going to stand by the play world. I’m on Aslan’s side even if there isn’t any Aslan to lead it. I’m going to live as like a Narnian as I can even if there isn’t any Narnia. So, thanking you kindly for our supper, if these two gentlemen and the young lady are ready, we’re leaving your court at once and setting out in the dark to spend our lives looking for Overland. Not that our lives will be very long. I should think; but that’s a small loss if the world’s as dull a place as you say."

—C.S. Lewis, *The Silver Chair*

Puddleglum *drew an experienced reality* that which existed in the Overworld he continued to believe in those things when they fell outside his experience in the underworld he held to his
Ethical IL ‘in flower’
I propose that we endorse Lisa Hinchcliffe’s epistemological suggestion, and step further to propose that we acknowledge our knowledges, beliefs, and values as driving our actions and consciously adopt an ethical stance to our IL agendas, programs and directions. Figure 2 below, represents some possible elements of an IL Ethics Framework, including a) the central principles of being other focused and empowering, b) the actions of creating programs that are grounded in beliefs and c) some suggested personal values that might underpin such activity.

Characteristics of Ethical IL
Let’s begin by looking at some possible elements of an ethical framework for IL. As we work through these you are invited to consider your own views and experience around each.

- The first central principle of Ethical IL is that it looks outwards, towards others. Information is used, programs are created for the benefit of others. For those of you familiar with the 7 Faces of IL, this is the Wisdom experience of IL (Bruce 1997, 2008). As information literate professionals and as information literate people we attend to and esteem the diverse knowledges, realities or cultures. This requires an ethical stance involving potential sacrifice of self-interest to benefit the wider world (Stoodley, 2009) and a social justice orientation (Bruce, 2008).

- The second central principle is that it is empowering. It represents the disenfranchised, bringing the needs of disempowered groups to the fore. Ethical IL represents contexts of concern to the people and identifies strategies to enable IL. (Bruce, 2008, p. 92)

- Ethical IL is
  - Inclusive, embracing different epistemologies,
  - Articulates its beliefs about important aspects,
  - Recognises its values and keeps them on the agenda,
  - Acknowledges diverse realities (contexts),
  - Creates new realities for others through its actions/programs.
In sum, we could say Ethical IL is about engaging in, understanding and bringing about information literacy experiences through a value driven, culturally aware, inclusive, social justice lens. Its discourses and programs celebrate a wide variety of forms of knowledge, and the knowledges of all peoples and cultures.

An invitation to consider what Ethical IL might look like in your context

You may wish at this point to take a moment to consider what Ethical IL might look like in your context.

- What is knowledge in your context(s)? What beliefs are important to others and to you?
  What do you value in general and about IL? How does this affect how you activate the (M)IL agenda?
- How could you adapt an existing program, by building in or making explicit relevant aspects?
- Could you modify the flower (see Figure 3 below) for your own context?
- What one thing could you do now, today or tomorrow to consolidate this direction?

![Ethical IL in Flower](image_url)

Figure 3: Ethical IL in new contexts

Ethical IL In Action

From our own experience there will be many examples of value driven, empowering programs we are aware of. It is a privilege to share a few that have been shared with me over time. Many others will be part of your experience, and much has also been shared at this conference.

- Kim Morrisson worked to empower students of color in US classrooms (Morrisson, 2017)
- Mary Somerville and Dana Echowhawk surfaced Latino/Hispanic memories through stories in formats traditionally disregarded (Somerville & Echowhawk, 2011)
- Wisnu Wijaya reports migrant workers being empowered politically and socially through social media (Wijaya, Watson & Bruce, 2018)
- Heriyanto reports libraries supporting social and economic needs of village communities (Heriyanto, 2021)
- Mary Somerville and colleagues report blending IL and systems design to empower students in Kosovo (Somerville et al, 2018)
- Barb Johnson, Western Australian chef, blends her knowledge of nutrition and flavour to create meals the elderly want to eat (The Examiner, 2018)
- Mandy Lupton developed the expressive IL Window, approaching information in terms of information nourishment (Lupton, 2017)
- Hilary Hughes worked with Food Rescue enabling leaders and volunteers to source and tech each other digital applications to maximise the impact of their work (Hughes, Wolf & Foth, 2017)
- Elham Sayyad Abdi and colleagues created an information literacy resettlement framework for skilled immigrants (Sayyad Abdi et al, 2019)
- Susan Gasson and Clarence Maybee, focusing on early career researchers developed ‘Informed Research’ (Gasson, Bruce & Maybee, 2020).

As we create realities for others through our actions and programs, we may find that others don’t see the world in the same way. While those of us in the IL community may have differing epistemologies, beliefs and values, our colleagues from other spaces will have yet others. Let’s challenge ourselves to understand our own ways of knowing, those of others, our beliefs and values about IL, based on evidence and experience; to work together to frame IL ethically in our contexts. Like Puddleglum, we are reaching for, and helping others reach for the sun, moon, trees and stars that may not always be visible. In our IL work we are visioning reality, creating futures and helping others do the same. Let’s be conscious of our ethical framework, making it explicit for ourselves and others as we do so.

References
- Lupton, M. (2017) Expressive IL Window, in Bruce, C.S., Andrew Demasson, Hilary Hughes, Mandy Lupton, Elham Sayyad Abdi, Clarence Maybee, Mary Somerville, Anita Mirijamdotter (2017) Information literacy and informed learning: conceptual innovation for IL research and practice futures. Journal of Information Literacy 11, 1, 4-22 jil.lboro.ac.uk.
- Somerville, M. M., Mirijamdotter, A., Bruce, C., Stoodley, L. & Pireva, K. (2018) From global theories to local practice and original knowledge: Learning the way through systems co-design. Information Literacy: From Practice to Research and Back Again - Library Theory and Research Section joint session with Information Literacy Section,
The International Scientific Conference of Librarians
Western Balkan Information and Media Literacy Conference 2021
& 10th International Summit of Book


Acknowledgements
I would very much like to thank the Western Balkans IL conference for the opportunity to consider these matters and develop this paper. I am also indebted to i-KM 2019, the 1st international Conference on Information and Knowledge Management held in East-West University, Dhaka Bangladesh, for making possible the consideration of sustainable information literacy, the relationship between IL and the Sustainable Development Goals which formed a precursor to the reflections I have brought to this conference. The inspiration provided by convenors of both these events and the inspiration provided by colleagues around the world have been important, precious and enabling as I have formed these thoughts. Of particular note is the contribution of Susan Gasson, who took the thoughts and transformed them into graphics which communicate more than a thousand words, and Dr Ian Stoodley who has directed my attention towards ethics and IL for many years.

Attachment. For reflective work
An invitation to consider what ethical IL might look like in your context
You may wish at this point to take a moment to consider what Ethical IL might look like in your context.

- What is knowledge in your context(s)? What beliefs are important to others and to you? What do you value in general and about IL? How does this affect how you activate the (M)IL agenda?
- How could you adapt an existing program, by building in or making explicit relevant aspects?
- What one thing could you do now, today or tomorrow to consolidate this direction?
- Could you modify the ‘flower’ for your own context?
TOWARDS NARROWING THE SOCIO-DIGITAL DIVIDE DURING AND POST THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC

Elli Georgiadou1, Kerstin Siaka2,3, Harjinder Rahanu1, Ratko Knezevic4, Margaret Ross5, Geoff Staples6

1 Middlesex University, London, UK
2 International Hellenic University, Thessaloniki, Greece
3 University of Vaasa, Vaasa, Finland
4 University of Bihac, Bosnia and Herzegovina
5 Solent University, Southampton, United Kingdom
6 British Computer Society, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT
The COVID 19 pandemic brought to light pre-existing social inequalities across the world and within countries. The disadvantaged groups of people suffered the most in terms of loss of life and loss of livelihood. The economic impact across the world has challenged even the most advanced economies. The negative impact on the economy as well as the quality of life, mental health and educational experience have been disproportionately higher in developing countries and among disadvantaged groups of people such as rural communities, refugees, the low-waged and the unemployed. Considering education and the sudden transition from the traditional face-to-face model to virtual delivery it has been seen that the pre-existing digital divide widened. In this paper we view the inequalities in educational opportunity as a socio-digital divide. Using an ethical approach embodied in the United Nations and UNESCO principles we propose a holistic method of analysis which led us to a set of mitigation strategies for addressing this divide in the short, medium, and long term.

Keywords: socio-digital divide, COVID-19 pandemic, ethics, mitigation strategies

1. INTRODUCTION
1.1. Impact of COVID-19 on Education
Williamson et al. (2020) stated in their paper "Pandemic politics, pedagogies and practices: digital technologies and distance education during the coronavirus emergency" that "The global pandemic is of course not only a serious public health emergency, but a political, economic and social emergency too".

The World Health Organisation declared the COVID-19 pandemic in March 2020. More than a year and a half later the number of deaths worldwide nears 6 million people (WHO<…). The disruption and socio-economic impact across the world have been immense. The education sector has been severely affected with closures or intermittent closures of schools, colleges, and universities.

"Education is the key to success for individuals and communities" U homoibhi, J., 2021). The Education for Sustainable Development (UNESCO, 2014) emphasises that "To create a world that is more just, peaceful and sustainable, all individuals and societies must be equipped with and empowered by knowledge, skills and values as well as be instilled with a heightened awareness to drive such change. There is now a growing international recognition of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) as an integral element of quality education and a key enabler for sustainable development."


Despite these noble aspirations, the sudden arrival and spread of COVID-19 revealed the lack of preparedness even by advanced economies. However, in the cases of lack of infrastructure and even no access to electricity migration to online teaching and learning was inevitably difficult and
in many cases impossible as is attested by many reports including several from Nigeria, Chile, and India (Uhomoibhi, J. (2021).

1.2. Traditional Distance Education and Crisis Distance Education

For the last 60 years there was considerable development of distance mode education (Georgiadou & Siakas, 2006) which became increasingly widespread mainly due to the proliferation of advanced internet technologies. Indeed, many universities in developed economies generated hybrid models of learning and teaching, often exporting such expertise and curricula to other countries in the form of exchanges, links, and franchises. Such developments were not possible in countries lacking basic availability of electricity, internet services and generally the infrastructure and required resources. In more recent years a proliferation of MOOCs (Massive Open Online Courses (MOOCs) offering learning conducted via the internet, and potentially accommodating large numbers (hundreds and even thousands) of learners (Rahanu et al., 2017). Such knowhow and experiences provide a strong steppingstone, and facilitate the migration from traditional distance mode education to crisis distance education (CDE).

Lily et al. (2020) investigated the difference between crisis distance education (CDE) and traditional distance education. They articulate that CDE is different from typical traditional distance education in several ways. The most important differences are:

- **Suddenness:** CDE is employed in schools without prior regulations or preparation.
- **Internationalisation:** CDE is applied across the world, without taking local requirements into consideration;
- **Popularity:** Conversations about CDE have rapidly scaled up. Google Trends demonstrates that the search frequency for the phrase *distance education* has increased enormously;
- **Expansion:** CDE has become an instructional means for all educational levels, from kindergarten to doctoral levels;
- **Imposition:** The use of distance education has shifted from being *good-to-have* to *mission-critical*.

CDE brings social and cultural implications, pedagogical and psychological implications, as well as procedural and logistical implications (Lily et al. 2020). Social and cultural implications urge us to tolerate, support, reject or subvert crisis distance education through agitation, rumour and humour. Pedagogical and psychological implication may compromise education through unreadiness and incompetence and preclude learners and teachers from learning and teaching. In addition, staying home may lead to other problems, such as pandemic-related stress, anxiety, depression, domestic violence, divorce, and pregnancy. Concerning procedural and logistical implications, some countries are digitally more ready than other. Additionally, some people may try to profit from the high demand of distance education either by ethical or unethical means. Lampropoulos et al. (2021) investigated and analyzed viewpoints, concerns and sentiments of the public through the collection, analysis and visualization of Twitter tweets regarding the effect of COVID-19 on online learning. Totally 274,109 tweets were retrieved during one year from January 2020. The results showed that 50.62% of the tweets were positive, 25.12% neutral and 24.26% negative. In total 27.47% of the tweets expressed trust in the crisis distance education, 20.17% anticipation (20.17%) and 11.465 fear. Totally 24.01% of the tweets were neutral.
1.3 The multi-layered impact on a child’s life and education

As it can be seen in figure 1 the influences on a child’s life, education, and opportunities (or the lack of them) are multi-layered starting from the immediate environment of the family and the community, extending to the School and Society at large. Many problems can shape their character and their ability to cope and engage in effective learning.

It must be emphasised that a child who lives in poverty and deprivation, with limited or non-available internet connection, limited living space, and/or whose parents are not able to help with home schooling will be at a disadvantage.

The erosion of social capital and central government funding impact on the ability of schools to offer the best education opportunities for the children of that community even in normal times was let alone under pandemic conditions. Deprived individuals, groups, and whole countries are vulnerable to disasters. Examples are countries in war zones such as Afghanistan and Syria, communities in Bangladesh who suffer regularly from floods, and communities in Africa who suffer from persistent droughts. The COVID pandemic is a disaster that hit the whole world. Inevitably the vulnerable social groups have been hit the hardest. For example, vast numbers of people in India, black and ethnic minorities in both the USA and the UK that suffered disproportionately higher death rates from COVID than the white people – a problem still under study.

Fig 1 – A multi-layered impact on a child’s world and opportunities or lack of them (source: Soylu et al, 2011)
1.4 The role of parents
Parents have usually taken a great interest in the children’s school achievements. Depending on
the level of education of the parents and on cultural practices parents are more or less involved in
the children’s home work. The COVID 19 pandemic and the worldwide imposed crisis distance
learning expected parents to actively help their children to suddenly learn in distance mode
without any face-to-face contact with their teachers or co-pupils.

Pre-COVID 19 studies had found the educational level of parents, family structure/marital status,
and income range has a positive influence on student's academic potential and achievement
(Gooding, 2001). The findings of a study including 1,784 first-time freshmen, who were enrolled
at Iowa State University (ISU) in 1998-1999, indicated that the educational level of parents,
family structure/marital status, and income range had a positive influence on student's academic
potential and achievement (Gooding, 2001). Students whose parents had higher educational levels
were found to perform better on standardized tests than students whose parents had lower
educational levels.

During the COVID 19 pandemic and in particular during the lockdowns there was very high
pressure both on parents, who were not limited to their daily routines, and on the learners, who
had difficulties to adapt to the new sudden way of learning at a time of fear and uncertainty.

In a study investigating Facebook groups from March 15th to April 25th 2020 in Jordan, a total of
248 Facebook posts and threads regarding the perceptions and viewpoints of parents
about the challenges of distance learning faced, were identified and thematically categorized in personal
barriers, technical barriers, logistical barriers and financial barriers.

1.5 The role of educators
In normal times the main responsibility of imparting knowledge and supporting the learners
whatever their stage of study is the responsibility of their teachers or lecturers. In the traditional
model, set up the educator plans, organises and delivers the curriculum face to face to the
learners. Any problems or difficulties whether academic or other can be seen, understood, and
dealt with.

With the sudden closure of educational institutions due to the spread of the COVID-19 virus the
educators were required to produce materials, notes, and exercises online within days. In many
cases especially university lecturers were required to record their lectures so that students who
were unable to attend live or had no access to the internet or other necessary equipment such as
laptops and computers could view the lectures at a different time. By far the most difficult
challenge was faced by many teachers in both the primary and the secondary education sectors
had no prior training or familiarity with the technologies and had to learn very quickly so that
they could support the learning of their pupils/students.

In 2020, an extensive study (Georgiadou et al, 2020) was carried out by 32 Higher Education
academics based in 26 countries from across Asia, Africa, Europe and the US reported the many
challenges faced especially during the rapid transition to the virtual model of education. In
addition many initiatives and innovations including animations, group discussions, and outdoor
meetings (in cases that was allowed) were used to continue the engagement of the learners.

2. The Ethical Right to Education
The right to Education is a fundamental basic human right. Article 26: Universal Declaration of
Human Rights declares (United Nations, 1948): “Everyone has the right to education. Education
shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages. Elementary education shall be
compulsory. Technical and professional education shall be made generally available and higher
education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit.”

The United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO), outline the
reasons as to why education is a fundamental human right, and in doing so, state that the
exercising of this right: ensures the development of a fully rounded human being; is a powerful tool in lifting socially excluded children and adults out of poverty and into society; and narrows the gender gap for girls and women (UNESCO, 2021). Rahanu (2021) argues that if all humans want to use this right then there must be equality of opportunity, universal access, and enforceable and monitored quality standards.

The US Content Subcommittee of the Impacts Steering Committee (Huff et al., 1995) advocated a framework presenting a set of traditional moral and ethical concepts that could be used to flag potential ethical issues in a given case. The committee recommended a number of traditional moral and ethical concepts that can be used examine the standards for the rightness and wrongness of actions. The ethical right to education can be understood, and substantiated, by looking at the following three moral and ethical concepts, as advocated by Huff et al., 1995), 1) Quality of Life, 2) Use of Power and 3) Equity and Access. The respective commentaries for these three moral and ethical concepts are presented in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Concept</th>
<th>Commentary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Life</td>
<td>Is faster, better, more, always an increase in quality of life for users of technology? Do designers' and decision makers' conceptions of quality of life correspond?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Power</td>
<td>Technology is not totally constrained by physical or mathematical principles, each design decision for that technology is an exercise of power. Need to understand the ethical choices that face both the powerful and the less powerful.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity and Access</td>
<td>Careful consideration needs to be given to the extent to which modern technology has divided us into those who have access to the power of technology and those who do not.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Commentaries for three Moral and Ethical Concepts

The declarations, presented above, by the UN and UNESCO, clearly show that they are imbued with the moral and ethical concepts of Quality of Life, Use of Power and Equity and Access. Thus, using an ethical approach embodied in the United Nations and UNESCO principles we propose a framework for addressing this divide in the short, medium, and long term.

3. SOCIAL INEQUALITIES EXACERBATED BY THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC AND THE NEED TO ADDRESS THE ISSUES

3.1 Social Vulnerability

all learners but importantly those of primary and secondary school age faced barriers to their education under lockdown and CDE solutions.

Social vulnerability refers to negative effects on communities caused by external stresses on human health. Such stresses include natural or human-caused disasters, or disease outbreaks. Reducing social vulnerability can decrease both human suffering and economic loss (Flanagan, et al., 2011).

3.2 Digital divide - Action by professional bodies

The need to address the social digital divide has been an inspiration for many years by various professional bodies. This is driven in part by the increase for potential skilled workforce in particular Industries. This problem is heightened by the increasing percentage of highly skilled experts moving into the latter part of their professional careers. In the STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics) and the medical professions, the current shortage of skilled practitioners has become particularly visible, especially in the science computing and medical sectors.

The need to move communications to the internet for education, employment and social reasons has demonstrated this issue. The digital divide has further identified not only the human, but the various technical shortages and problems already discussed. The professional bodies have for many years recognised the problems and participated in various investigations and reports. The relevance of those, since March 2020, at the start of the pandemic have become even more relevant.

The BCS, the Chartered Institute of IT, has for many years insisted that all the staff and active volunteers on the committees of the various subgroups of the BCS should undertake an Unconscious Bias training. This addressed the various forms of bias and considered how to minimise or remove the bias. In addition, all the subgroups whether the geographically based as Branches, or as International Sections based outside the UK or the various subject related Specialist Groups should have an Inclusion Officer role on their committee. These specific volunteer roles are looking at means to reduce or remove bias including the digital divide.

An example of this relevant to the problems experienced by much of the world population, especially in the third world nations, since the start of the pandemic. The BCS e-Learning Specialist Group (https://www.bcs.org/membership-and-registrations/member-communities/e-learning-specialist-group/) of the BCS change their fee paying, face-to-face annual conference INSPIRE (https://www.bcs.org/events-calendar/2021/june/webinar-e-learning-inspire-xxvi-conference/) to a totally online version with no cost for the authors and for the attendees. All of the papers, which were fully reviewed, were produced in an e-proceedings which again was free to anybody. The recent past proceedings from this INSPIRE educational conference were also added to the online BCS e-learning website to be freely available globally.

The subject global Specialist Groups are some that relate more to members with special interest such as proposed BCS Digital Divide Specialist Group. In addition to this activities, there are often webinars freely available to both BCS and non-BCS members relating to mental and physical disabilities, and to the problems of the digital divide. These events are often organised by the Inclusion Officer of the various committees who would also encourage speakers from different genders, ethnic backgrounds and disabilities. A positive aspect of the need to move/travel for physical meetings to webinars is the geographic location of both speakers and attendees.

In addition, the BCS has developed free classroom and online material for use in computing courses, from primary to secondary level, via Computing at Schools, (https://www.computingatschool.org.uk). These BCS initiatives aim to increase digital literacy, which in turn will help in the effort to narrow the socio-digital divide.
4. POLICIES AND ACTIONS

4.1 Short term and Medium Term Policies

In the turmoil of the pandemic everybody has been engaged in firefighting, adjusting to a new reality in the face of imminent danger to life. The World Health Organisation (WHO), UNESCO, the European Union and governments across the world rushed in policies, directives and laws restricting the circulation of as many people as it was possible. Lockdowns, curfews and other restrictions came into effect. Emergency budgets were made available. A notable example is the European budget for “fighting the coronavirus (COVID-19) and we are mobilising all resources available to help member states coordinate their national responses” [EU funding | European Commission (europa.eu)]. EU leaders have agreed on a number of priorities to coordinate the EU’s response to COVID-19 through limiting the spread of the virus, ensuring the provision of medical equipment, boosting research for treatments and vaccines and supporting jobs, businesses and the economy.

On 4 May 2020, the EU and its partners hosted an international pledging conference which has now raised €15.9 billion in pledges from donors worldwide to kick-start the global cooperation. This includes a pledge of €1.4 billion from the Commission of which €1 billion comes from Horizon 2020 [EU funding | European Commission (europa.eu)]. Similar initiatives have been launched across the world. However, the problems keep getting worse especially every time the virus mutates. With time pressures and limited resources, it has been necessary to act in the short term without a robust plan. Different political pressures on governments who are inevitably thinking of future electoral approval and success have for a while started throwing money at the problem. A reactive policy is always more expensive than a proactive policy, in essence prevention is always better than cure or corrective action after the event. So in the short term plans have been largely based on trial and error.

Nearly two years since the outbreak of the pandemic it is necessary to reflect on lessons learned, and to concentrate on systematic planning for the longer term and for the future.

4.2 Long term policies

Going back to first principles, we use the reflections of Rudyard Kipling (Rudyard Kipling [1865-1936]) in his poem Six Honest Men:

- I keep six honest serving-men
- (They taught me all I knew);
- Their names are What and Why and When
- And How and Where and Who.
- I send them over land and sea,
- I send them east and west;
- But after they have worked for me,
- I give them all a rest.

These fundamental questions point to first principles and focus on identifying actors and actions as well as strategies and justifications.

- The What identifies the nature of problem/barrier.
- The Why provides the reasons/causes of the problem.
- The When shows the timing of the problem.
- The How describes the way in which the problem manifests itself.
- The Where shows the location.
- And the Who shows who is affected/suffering from the problem.

Thus in the cells of the matrix (Tables 2a and 2b) the authors present the nature/categories of the problem and causes for the resulting problem. More importantly they identify who is responsible for implementing the proposed mitigations strategies.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>Economic Social</td>
<td>Ideological position</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td>Deprivation Anger Crime Diminished</td>
<td>Local regional</td>
<td>Individuals Communities Social classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td>Political decisions Human caused</td>
<td>Long term</td>
<td>engagement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>War</td>
<td>Political Social</td>
<td>Regional and international</td>
<td>Long-term conflicts</td>
<td>Loss of life Destruction of environment</td>
<td>Local Regional</td>
<td>All sections of society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ethical</td>
<td>interests Human caused</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td>Control of finite resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural disaster</td>
<td>Unexpected</td>
<td>Unpreparedness</td>
<td>Long term</td>
<td>Loss of life Erosion of the social structures</td>
<td>Local Regional</td>
<td>All, Vulnerable communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and sudden</td>
<td></td>
<td>Or unexpected</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of risk</td>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>Short-termism Political</td>
<td>Long term</td>
<td>No planned contingencies to mitigate risks</td>
<td>Local Regional</td>
<td>All, Vulnerable communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assessment</td>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td>Economic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of technical</td>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>Digital Divide. Lack of digital literacy. Prohibitive cost of technology.</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td>Limited access to educational programs and technology</td>
<td>Local Regional</td>
<td>Low socio-economic classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowhow</td>
<td>Political</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Demographic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of agility</td>
<td>Social Legal</td>
<td>Unaware/Poor application of</td>
<td>Long term</td>
<td>Ineffective provisions of services.</td>
<td>Local Regional</td>
<td>Vulnerable Individuals and Communities Social classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Agile philosophy</td>
<td>Or unexpected</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2b: A holistic view of Problems, Causes, Manifestations and Affected Communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of planning</td>
<td>Social Cultural Economic Legal</td>
<td>Unaware/ineffective oversight of Project Management principles, Unpreparedness</td>
<td>On going</td>
<td>Delays in delivery of services Increase in cost of delivering services.</td>
<td>Local Regional</td>
<td>Individuals Communities Social classes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of awareness</td>
<td>Social Cultural Economic</td>
<td>Political decisions, Poor education</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td>Reduction in the quality of life.</td>
<td>Local Regional Global</td>
<td>All Vulnerable communities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of legal protection</td>
<td>Ethical</td>
<td>Poor enforcement/application of relevant laws</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td>Reduction in the quality of life. Ineffective provisions of services.</td>
<td>Local National</td>
<td>All sections of society</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of ethical and moral commitment</td>
<td>Cultural Political</td>
<td>Poor coverage of ethics in education curriculum. Lack of political will to address issues.</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td>Reduction in the quality of life. Continued inequities in society Perpetuation of bias</td>
<td>Local Regional Global</td>
<td>Individuals Communities Social classes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. PROPOSED MITIGATION STRATEGIES
Based on the holistic analysis presented in Tables 2a and 2b the authors propose the following mitigation strategies in order to address the identified problems and prepare for future occurrences of disasters. The list is not exhaustive but provides a thinking tool as a basis of ongoing analysis and action.

- Aid agencies/charities to support the delivery of education in war zones.
- Government International aid budgets to be increased and to target ground support that assists in delivering education in regions affected by war and natural disaster.
- Local, regional, and national education authorities to develop Risk Assessment Plans, so that they have contingency plans to mitigate against natural/man-made disasters that affect the provision of education.
- Local and National Government/NGOs departments/organisations to adopt Agile methods/philosophy in order to rapidly respond to change in an ever more uncertain and rapidly changing world.
- Regional and National governments to offer free/subsidised access to digital literacy programmes, internet connectivity and digital devices. A particular emphasis on the provision of Life Long Learning (LLL) programmes should be made, thus helping to educate citizens from cradle to grave.
6. CONCLUSION
The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on students, educators and their families has inevitably been marked by adversity, inequality, shock, and a profound sense of collective grief at what has been lost. Well-documented challenges included digital poverty and marginalisation, assessment confusion, loss of community, motivational struggles, isolation and loneliness, digital distraction, and inadequate learning supports in places (Georgiadou et al, 2021).

The COVID-19 pandemic has resulted in considerable loss of life and disruption of the world economy. All spheres of activity have been on hold including education at all levels. After nearly two years since the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, more than half of the world’s pupils and students continue to be affected by partial or full school closures, fund over 100 million additional children will fall below the minimum proficiency level in reading as a result of the health crisis. Prioritizing education recovery is crucial to avoid a generational catastrophe as highlighted in a high-level ministerial meeting in March 2021. [UNESCO, Education: from disruption to recovery, 2020]

A rapid transition to online delivery and learning was achieved (especially in those countries with pre-existing infrastructure and knowhow) with varying degrees of success. This crisis hit the poorer people, communities and countries disproportionately. What was known as the digital divide has been exacerbated. The authors’ view is that the digital divide is in fact a manifestation of social, political and economic divides. We coined the term socio-digital divide in order to emphasise that such problems arise from social inequalities which need to be addressed.

Lack of planning and commitment by governments, authorities (local, regional, national and international) exacerbate existing socio-economic and socio-digital problems. The pandemic could be used as an opportunity for awareness and for corrective action. Unfortunately, as emphasised by Georgiadou et al, (2021) the lack of preparedness by governments should not be a surprise agreeing with Donahue et al,[2014) politicians underinvest in prevention because the electoral payoffs are higher for bringing in disaster funding through post-disaster declarations to provide help. The lessons learned from the COVID-19 pandemic show that ongoing preparedness is and will continue to be necessary in order to save lives and livelihoods. In the case of education, ongoing preparedness will ensure that the education activity continues, and the quality of education is maintained or even enhanced.

7. REFERENCES


global education and impact in emergencies using e-learning, 21-23 Jun 2021, Southampton. e-ISBN 9781999654955. [Conference or Workshop Item]


A STUDY ON THE IDENTIFICATION OF THE PERCEPTION OF THE UNDERGRADUATE STUDENTS TOWARDS PLAGIARISM IN THE DEPARTMENT OF INFORMATION MANAGEMENT

Demet Soylu  
Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Turkey, bunchnoble@gmail.com

Mehmet Bilge Kağan Önaçan  
İstanbul Okan University, Turkey, kagan.onacan@okan.edu.tr

Tunç D. Medeni  
Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Turkey, tuncmedeni@gmail.com

Tolga Medeni  
Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Turkey, tolgamedeni@gmail.com

Ratko Knezevic  
University of Bihac, Bosnia and Herzegovina, kratko1962@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
Plagiarism, which is one of the ethical problems of the era, is encountered in such different types of resources such as school assignment, article, scientific article, dissertation. This ethical violation, which hinders the qualitative aspect of academic studies, is the use of a product, an idea or knowledge belonging to the owner of the intellectual idea, without consent, approval or without any citation. Academicians and librarians have important responsibilities in finding solutions to this common problem at the global level. In this respect, it is of high ethical importance to provide concrete suggestions for solution by providing the identification of problems experienced in academic education. Accordingly, this study aims to determine students' personal experiences and knowledge about plagiarism and their perceptions about the causes of plagiarism. The survey has been applied in two state universities in Turkey. As a result of the study, it was found out that the majority of students in both universities have knowledge about plagiarism and have a high level of awareness and in addition the students have a high perception that the Plagiarism Detection Program will be effective in preventing plagiarism.

Key Words: Plagiarism, Science Ethics, Plagiarism Detection, Plagiarism Detection Program (PDP)

Introduction
In parallel with the increase in knowledge in the digital age, there is also an increase in quantity in terms of scientific studies produced worldwide. Concern about producing scientific output and work causes ethical violations to occur consciously or unconsciously. One of the ethical problems of the scientific research and writing process is plagiarism. Plagiarism, which is based on the Latin word "plagiarius" meaning to steal, to kidnap (Uçak, 2012: 174), is defined in different ways in different sources. Merriem-Webster Online Dictionary (2021) defines plagiarism (plagiarism) as "stealing and passing off the ideas or words of another as one's own and using another's production without crediting the source in literature, there are studies on plagiarism in particular, but it is seen that the studies that include the perceptions of students and/or teachers/instructors about PDP are quite limited. Especially in Turkey, there are very few studies (Ersoy, 2014; Uçak and Birinci, 2008; Önaçan and Güneri, 2020) on this subject. For this reason, in this study, it is aimed to determine how effective the PDP is to prevent plagiarism by
determining the personal experiences and knowledge levels of university students about plagiarism and the reasons for plagiarism.

**Literature Review**

Plagiarism, which is seen in different scientific studies such as homework, articles, thesis, and books, can occur in different types. Using another person's work as one's own work, using another person's work without reference to the owner of the work or idea, using the majority of another person's work without referencing it, using someone else's work by rearranging, misreferencing in one's own work may be shown as example of the types of plagiarism. Text plagiarism is frequently encountered in education and research. It is a type of plagiarism that is made word for word from the source text without showing the bibliography. The subtypes of text plagiarism are briefly described below (Roka, 2017).

- Intentional copy-paste/clone plagiarism: It is the use of one's own work by copying from other works with or without specifying the original source.
- Paraphrasing: Trying to use other people's ideas, expressions or work outputs in a different way by changing the sentence structures or grammatical structures of words.
- Mosaic / hybrid / patchwork plagiarism: It is the rewriting of other people's work using different grammar by typing synonyms of sentence structures and without citing the main source.
- Metaphoric plagiarism: In this type of plagiarism, too, metaphors are used to present other people's ideas clearly and better.
- Rewriting the Idea: It is the rewriting of an idea or solution proposal taken from different sources by using different expressions.
- Self-plagiarism/Recycling: The author's reuse of his/her own previously published work or ideas.
- Making a 404 Error: The author is referring to sources that are not valid.

**Research Method**

This study was carried out to determine the perception and awareness level of undergraduate students about plagiarism who continue their education in department of Information Management in two state universities. In the study, a descriptive research method was used. Questionnaire technique was used as a data collection tool. The questionnaire used in the study was adapted from the questionnaire used by Avarogullari (2012). The survey was applied both in print and online. The data collected through the questionnaire were analyzed with SPSS (Statistical Programming for Social Sciences 21). The study consists of four parts. In the first part of the study, the participants were asked questions about their personal experiences of plagiarism. In the second part of the study, the students were asked to state their opinions about the scenarios about plagiarism. In the third part of the study, there are questions about the use of PDP to prevent plagiarism in scientific articles, assignments and exams, and in the fourth part there are questions about the possible causes and sources of plagiarism. Totally 201 students, 87 from A university, 114 students from the B university attended the survey.

**FINDINGS**

Of the 201 participants participating in the study, 71% (n=143) were female and 30% (n=58) were male. 44% (n=87) are students of the Information Management Department of the A University. 57% (n=114) are students of B University More than half of the participants (53%, n=108) had a grade point average between 3.00-4.00. The least represented group belonged to the participants in the range of 0.00-2.00. (See Table 1)
Almost a quarter of the participants are in the 3rd (26%, n=52) and 4th (23%, n=47) classes with similar rates. The least numbered group belonged to the 2nd (18%, n=36) grades.

Table 2. Class Levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>32,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>17,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>25,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>23,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Average Grade

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Average Grade</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.00-2.00</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.00-3.00</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>43,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.00-4.00</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>53,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Personal Experiences of the Participants Related to Plagiarism

In this section, the participants’ personal experiences about plagiarism, when and how they encountered the concept of plagiarism will be presented.

Whether the participants have heard the concept of plagiarism before?

The participants were asked whether they had heard of the concept of plagiarism before, and it was determined that the majority of the participants (76%, n=152) had heard of the concept of plagiarism before (See Table 3).

Table 3. Have you heard the concept of plagiarism before?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>75,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>24,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
When did the participants hear the concept of plagiarism?
Participants were asked when they heard the concept of plagiarism. It was concluded that the majority (84%, n=168) heard about the concept of plagiarism at university (Table 4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Secondary School</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>14,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>83,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>201</strong></td>
<td><strong>100,0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. When did you hear the concept of plagiarism?

Using the assignment of friend as own
When the participants were asked whether they had ever used another friend's homework as if they had done it themselves, nearly half (48%, n=96) stated that they did not use it. Although the frequency of use of those who use it differs from each other, the fact that this rate is represented by more than half (52%) of the participants shows that scientific ethical behavior has not developed, albeit partially, and that there is not yet sufficient awareness about scientific ethics.

This underlines the need for students to be conscious of the rules regarding conducting scientific research within the framework of ethical rules.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>47,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>20,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twice</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>14,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequently</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>99,5</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5. Have you ever used a friend's assignment as yours?

II- Perceptions and Attitudes of the Participants related to the Plagiarism
Within the scope of the study, the responses of Information and Records Management undergraduate students to possible scenarios related to plagiarism were examined in order to reveal their perception, reaction and knowledge about plagiarism.
Scenario 1
Merve and Emin meet every week to discuss assignment problems. After creating the draft answers to the questions together, each writes and submits their own assignment using this (See Table 6)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 1</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made.</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>25,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>21,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made.</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>52,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>201</strong></td>
<td><strong>100,0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6. Scenario 1

In scenario 1, the student uses another student's ideas and/or work without citing to source. In addition, he presents the work he has done with another student as if he had done it himself. As a result, this scenario is plagiarized. However, as seen in Table 6, only 26% of the students were able to detect plagiarism in this scenario. Although this finding is in parallel with the findings of Avarogullari (2012), it shows higher rates in terms of awareness level, albeit partially. In the context of the data and findings in the scenario, it can be said that the students do not have sufficient knowledge and awareness about plagiarism.

When the students were evaluated according to the university, it can be said that nearly one quarter of the students from A University and B University were able to identify plagiarism. The rates are close to each other (See Table 7).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 1</th>
<th>A University</th>
<th>B University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>26,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>56,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>87</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7. Relationship between the Scenario 1 and University
Scenario 2
Emin gets sick for a week. Together with Merve, they prepare the draft answers. But Emin copies Merve's answers and submits his homework. Merve changes a few places to keep the assignments from being exactly the same.

In Scenario 2, the student uses another student's ideas and/or work without reference, and submits the work of another student as if he had done it himself, making minor changes. As a result, this scenario is plagiarized. The majority of the survey participants (74%, n=149) identified plagiarism. The fact that 26% of the students could not detect plagiarism indicates a lack of knowledge and awareness about science and research ethics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 2</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made.</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>74.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>10.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>14.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>201</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 8. Scenario 2*

Approximately half of the students from both two universities identified the plagiarism in Scenario 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 2</th>
<th>A University</th>
<th>B University</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>49.0</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>27.3</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 9. Relationship between Scenario 2 and University*

Scenario 3
In a geography lesson, students were given economic data about the economic situation of certain countries. Students must do group work but submit individual assignments. Emin enters the economic data of the country in question into the related software and sends the graphics he creates to his friends as an e-mail. They discuss the results among themselves and each writes their own assignment. However, they all use the graphics Emin made and they do not specify this either.
In Scenario 3, another student's ideas and/or works are used without reference, and the graphics produced by another student are delivered as if they were his own. As a result, this scenario is plagiarized. 81% of the participants identified plagiarism in this scenario. The fact that the rate of those who stated that there was no plagiarism and those who abstained from this issue (7%, n=14; 12%; n=24, respectively) indicates a high level of awareness about the subject and shows that students are aware that one-to-one copying is plagiarism in every situation (See. Table 10).

More than half (56%) of the 163 participants who stated plagiarism was made were students of A University and less than half (44%) were students of B University. In Pearson's chi-square test, it was observed that there was no statistically significant difference between the responses to scenario 3 according to the university ($\chi^2 (5) =0.581, p=0.748$).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 3</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>81,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>11,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>201</strong></td>
<td><strong>100,0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 10. Scenario 3**

In Scenario 3, another student's ideas and/or works are used without reference, and the graphics produced by another student are delivered as if they were his own. As a result, this scenario is plagiarized. 81% of the participants identified plagiarism in this scenario. The fact that the rate of those who stated that there was no plagiarism and those who abstained from this issue (7%, n=14; 12%; n=24, respectively) indicates a high level of awareness about the subject and shows that students are aware that one-to-one copying is plagiarism in every situation (See. Table 10).

More than half (56%) of the 163 participants who stated plagiarism was made were students of A University and less than half (44%) were students of B University. In Pearson's chi-square test, it was observed that there was no statistically significant difference between the responses to scenario 3 according to the university ($\chi^2 (5) =0.581, p=0.748$).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 3</th>
<th>A University</th>
<th>B University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>43,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>37,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>50,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 11. Relationship between Scenario 3 and University**

**Scenario 4**

*In a research paper, Merve finds relevant and useful information on a website, but there is no information about the author. Since it is not possible to access the author information, Merve thinks that she can copy-paste some parts without referring to the author.*

In Scenario 4, even if the student cannot access the author of the information on the subject on the website, he or she must refer to the relevant site and explain as a footnote that he has incomplete information about the author's information. It is considered plagiarism if the student thinks that he or she can use this data without permission by copy-pasting this important point. While the majority of the survey participants (66%, n=132) thought that Merve had plagiarized in the
relevant scenario, a substantial proportion of the participants (34.3%) remained indecisive on this issue (22%, n=45) or did not (11.9%) plagiarize (n=24). It is thought that the “copy-paste” action, which is considered as a frequently encountered problem regarding student homework in the literature, is considered as a normal situation according to student perception. In accordance with this information, the findings obtained within the scope of the research reveal the need for informing and informing students about the scope and framework of the concept of plagiarism (See Table 12).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 4</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>65.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>22.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>201</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 12: Relationship between Scenario 3 and University

While 47% of the 132 participants who stated that there was plagiarism were students at B University, 54% were students at A University. The Pearson chi-square test reveals that the answers given by the students to Scenario 4 differ statistically according to the university ($\chi^2 (5) = 16.942, p=0.000$) (See Table 13).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 4</th>
<th>A University</th>
<th>B University</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>53.8</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 13. Relationship Between Scenario 4 and University

Scenario 5

While scanning the literature for a research paper, Emin incorporates the complex ideas of a particular author. He begins by rewriting three paragraphs in his own words, but in the end he often copies the author’s ideas because he does not know what different words to use. It refers to and references the source from which it receives the information.

In scenario 5, the student mainly used the ideas of another author, reducing the personal contribution and originality of his work. Although the original source was cited, the majority of another person’s work was used. It is necessary to indicate the relevant parts of the citation in quotation marks. But he did not specify it. However, just citing the source does not mean that there is no plagiarism. Since his original ideas and contributions are not included in the study even though he cites the source and even quotes in quotation marks, it is considered as plagiarism.
Nearly 60 percent of the students (59%, n=18) stated that plagiarism was not made regarding this. In this regard, based upon the findings, it is thought that it would be beneficial to provide students with scientific ethics education (Voelker et al., 2011).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 4</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>25.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>58.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 14. Scenario 5

When Scenario 5 and University Relationship is examined, the rate of 118 students who stated that plagiarism is not practiced is more than half (52%) while they are students at B University, while nearly half (48%) are students at A University (See Table 25). According to Pearson's chi-square test, it was revealed that the answers given to scenario 5 differed statistically significantly according to the university $\chi^2 (5)=6.468, p=0.03$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 4</th>
<th>A University</th>
<th>B University</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism was made</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>44.2</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>22.6</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism was not made</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>48.3</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 15. Senaryo 5 ve Üniversite ilişkisi

Scenario 6

Merve needs to do a research and report the results. In addition to the results, she was asked to report the results of similar studies. Merve prepares a long list of research results and finally lists the sources where she found this information. However, it does not clearly indicate which of the research results were obtained by which author or researcher.

In scenario 6, the student made plagiarism because he did not include the author and researcher information correctly. While more than half of the participants (54%, n=109) stated that plagiarism was made nearly one-third (30%, n=62) of them have no idea. The findings show that the majority of the participants think that only citing the source used will prevent plagiarism.
Table 16. Scenario 6

Table 17 indicates that nearly half of the students from both universities agree with the idea that plagiarism was made.

Table 17. Relationship Between Scenario 6 and University

Scenario 7
A group of students complete a 6-week applied research paper and submit a joint report. This report also asks to indicate the relative contribution of each group member. All group members state that everyone contributes equally, although Emin made a small contribution.

In scenario 7, stating that equal contribution is made in cases where everyone does not contribute equally indicates the existence of an ethical problem. More than one-third of the participants (39%) stated that plagiarism was committed. However, the majority of the participants (60.7%) were either not sure about plagiarism or stated that plagiarism was not done. This shows that in collaborative projects, not specifying individual contribution rates is an unethical behavior that is not known by the students (Table 18).

Table 18. Scenario 7
Nearly forty percent of the participants from A university and more than half of the participants from B university agreed with the idea that there is plagiarism.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario 7</th>
<th>A University</th>
<th>B University</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, plagiarism made</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>38,5</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>45,8</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, plagiarism not made</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>46,0</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 19. The Relationship between the University and Scenario 7

**Use of Plagiarism Detection Software**

In this section, it is aimed to determine the opinions and perceptions of the participants about whether the use of a plagiarism detection program in scientific articles, exams and assignments will prevent plagiarism, and the participants were asked questions about the subject. When they were asked if there was a plagiarism detection program at school, whether this would prevent students from plagiarizing while preparing scientific articles and homework, they were asked to say “agree” (43%, n=88; 46%, n=93) and “strongly agree” (23%, respectively), n=47; 20%, n=41) can be associated with the fact that plagiarism detection programs have anti-plagiarism effects.

**If there is a plagiarism detection software, this would prevent the plagiarism while students are preparing scientific articles**

Within the scope of the study, the survey participants were asked about their opinions about the use of a plagiarism detection program at school, preventing students from plagiarizing while preparing scientific articles. It has been determined that more than forty percent of the participants (43.3%, n=47) think that having a plagiarism detection program can prevent plagiarism while preparing scientific articles.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I totally disagree</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I disagree</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>13,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>12,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I agree</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>43,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I totally agree</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>23,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 20. Use of a plagiarism program will prevent the plagiarism
Use of a plagiarism program in a university prevents the students from making plagiarism

One of the questions asked to the students within the scope of the study is whether the use of a plagiarism detection program in the school will prevent the student from plagiarizing while preparing the homework. Almost half of the students (46.3%, n=93) stated that having a plagiarism detection program at school would prevent plagiarism while preparing homework.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I totally disagree</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I disagree</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>13.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I agree</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>46.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I totally agree</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>20.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>200</td>
<td>99.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 21. Use of a plagiarism program will prevent the student making plagiarism in the assignments in the university

One of the other questions asked to students is whether using a plagiarism detection program will prevent students from plagiarizing in exams. It is seen that one third of the students (32.3, n=65) agree with this idea.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I totally disagree</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I disagree</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>22.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>27.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I agree</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>32.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I totally agree</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>201</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 22. Use of a plagiarism program will prevent the student making plagiarism in the exams in the university
Possible Causes of Plagiarism

In this section, it is aimed to determine the possible causes of plagiarism. Participants were asked to mark in the 1-5 reference range in order to determine their participation rate in the reasons given regarding the possible causes of plagiarism. In the table below (See Table 23), the averages of the values given by the participants between 1-5 were calculated. According to the table, it is seen that the highest participation rate belongs to the suggestions related to the problems arising from the education system and child-rearing culture, the desire for high grades, business life and social activities. The lowest rates belong to the suggestions of accessing more specific information from the Internet, lack of self-confidence, lack of social sanctions against plagiarism, and the effect of family and environment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possible Reasons of the Plagiarism</th>
<th>Grade Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Problems related with the educational system and childrearing culture.</td>
<td>4.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business life and social activities</td>
<td>4.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desire of a high points in courses</td>
<td>4.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of the assignments given by lecturers</td>
<td>4.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some environmental and demographical factors</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misuse of the time</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficiency of the disincentive punishments</td>
<td>3.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High number of the assignments given</td>
<td>3.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laziness</td>
<td>3.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence of enforcements/impact of the friends and colleagues</td>
<td>3.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficiency of information related to the plagiarism</td>
<td>3.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examination of the assignments insufficiently by the lecturers</td>
<td>3.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems encountered by students while accessing and identifying the resources</td>
<td>3.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence of self-confidence</td>
<td>3.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal characteristics of the lecturers and their attitudes towards the assignments</td>
<td>3.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of reading and research skills</td>
<td>3.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retrieval of more specific information in Internet</td>
<td>2.53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 23. Possible Causes of Plagiarism
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In today's information age, Information and Records Management undergraduate students, who are continuous and active users of information and knowledge, are expected to be more sensitive about the principles of science ethics. It is thought that informing students about plagiarism types, the concept of plagiarism and the scope of plagiarism is important in terms of serving to be an ethical information society. Academicians and librarians have important responsibilities in raising the necessary awareness about plagiarism to undergraduate students. Relevant faculty members who teach within the scope of undergraduate courses may request students to apply the ethical rules in their projects, assignments and exams, by observing the relevant ethical principles in the studies carried out within the scope of the course. In the undergraduate curriculum, the quantitative and qualitative aspects of elective and compulsory courses that deal with the concept of plagiarism and plagiarism can be strengthened, and it can contribute to the increase of students' knowledge level on this subject. Students can be informed about plagiarism detection programs and software. Videos and brochures can be prepared in order to raise the awareness of students.

Based upon the research findings it can be said that vast majority of students have knowledge and awareness about plagiarism. Considering that the majority of students hear about the concept of plagiarism at university, it is considered that it is necessary to inform students about this issue at younger ages. Because behaviors learned at a young age are permanent. The result of this study showed that knowing that a PDP is used in school will prevent the majority of students from plagiarizing. Hence, PDP has a deterrent role in preventing plagiarism.

Problems arising from the education system and child-rearing culture, business life and social activities, desire for high grades, the way the lecturers give homework are seen as the most important reasons of plagiarism. Efforts should be made to eliminate these reasons by conducting in-depth studies on these issues. As future work, it is planned to carry out studies on whether teachers will want to use PDP and how effectively PDPs are used in universities.
References
SOCIAL SERVICES AND INFORMATION SYSTEMS: AN INQUIRY INTO TURKISH CONTEXT


Ali Demiröz
Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Turkey, alisdemir33@gmail.com

Tunç D. Medeni
Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Turkey, tuncmedeni@gmail.com

Demet Soylu
Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Turkey, bunchnoble@gmail.com

Ratko Knezevic
University of Bihac, Bosnia and Herzegovina, kratko1962@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
This work provides information and insights on development and implementation of social support services with the use of information technologies with respect to Turkish context before the pandemic. The related discussions shed light on related issues with respect to interagency information sharing and information privacy of the beneficiaries. Accordingly we hope the resulting work be useful for the development of new generation services to address the emerging needs of a society in the post-pandemic era.

Key words: Social Services, Information Systems, Information Technologies

Introduction
After the Industrial Revolution, there has been enormous change at working and manufacturing style. Starting with the manufacturing in factories with a mass production style, working conditions and human labor have changed dramatically. This change has also affected social order and introduced a new point of view to the social and financial systems. Social order of the today has been formed by the Industrial Revolution at 19th century. Seyyar (2006, as cited in Özdamar, 2007) relates the economic activities and the result of those activities on the society. According to the Seyyar, as the science of the economy works on the financial activities and how income is distributed within the society; the social policy focuses on the policies and activities related with how the economic activities and the distribution of resulting income is fairly conducted. Definitions and issues concerned by the social policies, social sciences and their branches vary in a wide range and may change based on the country. Buğra & Keyder (2006, as cited in Özdamar, 2007) lists the context and the constituents of the social policy as, social protection and social security concerning unemployment and retirement, social services such as disability support, social care, health, education, food and shelter, policies for equality of opportunity and against discrimination, poverty and social exclusion, public health, working conditions, regulation of industrial relations, family and children policies. Pandemic which has emerged during 2020 has touched almost all that aforementioned branches of the social policy with a knock-on-effect; Firstly, health-care system has been overloaded, then, in order to protect the lives of citizens, governments had to declare curfew. This resulted in a dramatic slow-down about commercial activities of all kind. Finally, people have begun to lose their jobs if not their lives.
Indeed, social policy is very broad and comprehensive. It must be approached with a holistic approach, but, generally it is not possible to comprehend all related institutions under the same roof. Yet, the conditions introduced by pandemic have urged all institutions, particularly in the social area, to cooperate deeply both in terms of polices and information sharing.

Three Main Branches of Social Policies
In the context of this work, two main branches of social policies, social services and social assistance will be focused. These two branches of the social policies are in the task list of the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services [MoFLSS]. But, branches of social policies and related government institutions are far more than just two. Social services and social assistance are naturally related and base on the social security, health policies, justice and criminal/security issues. Under this title, three main branches are explained that are subject of interagency information-sharing processes of the MoFLSS before and during the pandemic.

Social Services
Social service is defined by International Federation of Social Workers [IFSW] (2018) as a practice-based profession and an academic discipline that promotes social change and development, social cohesion, and the empowerment and liberation of people. Principles of social justice, human rights, collective responsibility and respect for diversities are central to social work. Alşo Sütçü (2015) defines the social services as a complement of activities and services conducted by social services experts containing social, economic, psychological, supportive, formative and educative services besides the investigation of individuals within his/her family and environment and removal of domestic problems by providing access for citizens to the related organizations.

Historical bases of the social services lay beyond the Ottoman and Seljuk period affected by the religious factors imposed by Islamic tradition and rules such as protection of orphans and zekah (distribution of one fortieth of one's income as alms, one of the five pillars of the Islamic faith). In the Ottoman period, foundations such as Darül-ziyafe, Misafirhane, Tabhane, Şifahane, Darüşşafaka, Darül Hayr-ı Ali and Darül Eytam had been constituted for social welfare. During the construction of the modern Republic of Turkey leaded and founded by Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, Türkiye Himaye-i Ef tale Cemiyeti which will be named later as Child Protection Agency, has been founded by the directive of Atatürk in 1921. (Türkmen, 1987) Name of the Agency has been changed to Çocuk Esirgeme Kurumu in 1934. Even in the severe conditions of the Existence War of the nation, the importance of the children as a wealth and basic entity for the future of the nation had been clearly understood and paid attention.

The first legislation on child protection and related dormitories had been made on 1949 with law number 5387 by Ministry of Health and Social Assistance. (Saçan, 2010). Due to the insufficiency at details of implementing the service and lack of provisioning, the Law of Child to be protected had been issued in 1957 and kept active for 24 years. According to the Türkmen (1987), many other laws not directly related with child protection had also contained issues related with child protection during this period such as Village Law, Turkish Civil Law and Municipality Law.

The law for the establishment of the Social Services Institute was accepted in 1959 and lasted for 24 years. In 1983, child protection and social service related laws have been consolidated. Kartal (2008) states that The Law for the Social Services and Child Protection Institution was adopted on 24 May 1983 with law number 2828 in order to centralize the governance of diversity of institutions. Four institutions (Child Protection Associations, Social Services Directorate, Social Services Institute and the Turkish Child Protection Society) which had been administered separately until then have been unified. The name of the new institution became Social Services.
and Child Protection Agency (Sosyal Hizmetler ve Çocuk Esirgeme Kurumu), and with this law, capability to prepare its own regulations was bestowed, and budgetary regulation of the institution became independent.

It was also stated by Kartal (2008) that, despite the law 2828 was a step towards the centralization of social services, yet, budgetary status of the SSCPA had been structured as a supplementary budget supported by donations and businesses operated by Agency, apart from central budget. This situation has reflected the fact that the social services still have not completely regarded to be under the support of the government. But in turn, this statue has given independence in terms of decisions taken on the budget, yet, the institution is supposed to use its own resources primarily to finance itself.

Although the best known service type of the SSCPA is the protection of children by the means of institutional care, boundaries of services presented by SSCPA goes far beyond. Besides protection of the children by providing shelter, rehabilitation services and psychological support was given to the children as required. Additionally, children have been returned to their own families with economical support if possible. Protective Family Service model has been introduced in which volunteer families are assisted economically. Adoption of children by families is also coordinated and implemented by SSCPA.

Similarly, services to the disabled & old age people have been provided by SSCPA both as sheltering and also financial aid for families caring elders at home. Providing shelter for battered women has been another service of SSCPA.

Up to the foundation of Ministry of Family and Social Policies, institutions for policy making and conducting research on social policies, especially concerning social services had been structured as separate from those directly serving to the citizens. Family Research Institution founded in 1989 and later in 2004 became a directorate general for implementing law number 41 stating the importance of protection, prosperity and planning of the family and children. In 1997 Institution of Disabled People was founded for coordination and cooperation of organizations and institutions working for rehabilitation education, accessibility, employment and adaptation to the society. Directorate General Statue of Women (DGSW) was founded in 1990 in order to empower the women economically, cultural and politically at each level of society and gaining to the women the statue they deserve. With the foundation of MoSFP in 2011, policy and research based government institutions have been united with the ones that are directly serving to the citizens in order to increase the efficiency of the services presented to the citizens.

Social Assistance

Poverty is defined by Çetinkaya (2012) as the situation of nonexistence of income, salary or property for sufficient to make a living of individual with the family including wife, children and parents in the environment that they live, especially due to unemployment, disability, illness or oldness (p.6). Naturally, poverty and the social aid and assistance are very closely related with each other. Kalajın (2009) defines the notion of the social assistance as a set of public activities including public relief, financial aid and income generating funds/projects for supporting people in order to re-gain the power of maintaining the subsistence as soon as possible, to whom not capable of subsistence currently even at a minimum level due to the reasons that they do not have the control. One of the most notable key points stressed by the Kalajın (2009) is that final purpose of the social assistance is not only supporting financially but to provide the beneficiaries to get a point that they can get economic independence (p.218)

Social assistance and the social security are separated from each other with a key determinant. It is stated by Taş that, in contrast to the social security that is characterized by payment of insurance charge, mechanism of social assistance does not expect and include any payment back. Payments are funded by tax income and because of that sometimes called as non-insurance
premium, so it is conceptualized in relation with social protection. By this way, social assistance constitutes social protection together with social service (Taşcı 2007).

Historical roots of the institutions about social assistance in our country date back to the pre-republic era. In the Ottoman era, social assistance had been conducted by the foundations with an autonomous structure. In 1877 Red Crescent Society has been founded inspired by the Red Cross Society of European countries, primarily for assisting to soldiers and civilians that are wounded during war. (Baytal, 2009). Ministry of Health and Social Services (Muavenet-iictimaiye Vekâleti), which had been the most superior social aid institution of the state, have been founded at 1920 after the constitution of the Turkish Grand National Assembly during the War of Independence (Taşcı 2007). In the term of Atatürk, these three institutions had made social assistance in the form of shelter support, orphan children and widow women support, oldness supports, poor soldier family supports, payments to the martyr families and veterans. (Baytal, 2009) As can be seen clearly, continual wars up to the 1922 affected deeply the types and format of the social assistance for decades.

According to the Yılmaz, the first social assistance law issued by the Government is known as the 65 Age Pension in 1976 by law number 2022. Similarly with law number 1005 in 1980, civil servants died or disabled in public work has been given pension as a social assistance. But the first comprehensive social assistance law has been issued in 1986 with law number 3294, Social Assistance and Solidarity Incentive Act. (Yılmaz, 2006).

In the context of the law number 3294, a new fund called Social Assistance and Solidarity Fund has been founded in order to provide supply to the social assistance. Fund is managed by the Fund Council incorporated in Prime Ministry and leaded by the Prime Ministry Counselor or up to the 2004 (Doğan, 2008). Directorate General Social Assistance and Solidarity has been founded in 2004 with law number 5263, as an extension and transformation of Fund Council Secretariat in order to gain an organizational identity and empower the structure based on specialization for fighting against poverty (Biçer, 2009). For making use of the resources of the fund in social assistance activities all over the country and facilitating citizens for applying social assistance, Social Assistance and Solidarity Foundation has been founded in each and every county and province under the secretariat of Administrative Chief (Kalahan, 2009, p.217). Administration of the Foundations contained government managers, local administrates, beneficent citizens and non-governmental organization representatives (Kaya, 2009).

Kobak (2006) states that, in addition to the central government activities, local government institutions, primarily municipalities, also conduct many activities in the area of social assistance base on the law number 5216 published on 23.07.2004.

**Social Security**

Social security can be defined briefly as a system for making working people save the money that they earn for providing prosperity in their retirement term in addition to the labor safety and health services. In the definition of the International Labor Organization [ILO], social security is defined as a set of protection, health and child assistance services to the citizens in case of decrease of income based social and economic problems due to illness, birth, labor accident, unemployment, disability, oldness and death (1995, as cited in Baykara, 2014). Social security is considered as a tool of social policy for diminishing poverty and inequality of income distribution. In general basic characteristics of the social security can be listed as (Aydın, 1999, as cited in Altın, 2010):

- Providing economical assurance to the individuals
- Protecting all individuals against to the risks and minimizing and removal of negative result
- Providing improvement of personality
- Covering all individuals equally without any discriminations
According to the Dilik, up to the 1929, the year of the Economic Crisis, many of the European states had gained admission to social security system followed by Russia, US of America and South America and Japan. But World War 2 was a turning point for many other countries for constituting a social security system (1992, as cited Soydemir 2013).

In Turkey first social security related initiative has been founded with name Workers Union in Eregli Coal Basin in 1923 which would process within insurance methods in order to meet economic and social requirements of coal workers. (Ekmeç, 2005, as cited in Soydemir, 2013).

First government institution named as Workers Insurance Institution concerning social security has been constituted in 1945 by law 4792 which was later, in 1964, changed to Social Insurance Institution (SSK). Well-known Credit Union of Retirement (Emekli Sandığı) and Institution of Social Insurances and Occupational Pension Fund (Baj-Kur) have been founded respectively in 1950 (with law 5434) and 1971 (with law 506). (Özkan, 2010).

These three institutions had been operating separately which resulted in difficulties and problems about coordination. One of the biggest problems emerging was one person would be insured by different institutions separately. Girgin (2015) states that, in order to eliminate such problems and boosting the coordination, the three institutions serving depending on five different laws has been united under the roof one institution called Social Security Institution under the Ministry of Labor and Social Security in 2006, with law 5502 issuing the establishment, tasks and authority of Social Security Institution.

Social Policy Coordination, Cooperation and Consolidation in Turkey

Definitions of the concepts in the context of the social policies and their boundaries vary and generally it is not possible to draw solid and clear borders separating the branches of the social policies. As can be seen above, from the definitions and concepts covered by the social service, social assistance and social security, all of them concern improving the prosperity of society somehow from closely positioned perspectives. Similarly, institutions and organizations for serving social service, social aid and social security either voluntarily or established by governments have been conducting activities and targeting the sections of the society highly overlapping with each other. It is stated by the Soydemir (2005) that, social services differ from social assistance for its relevance of any section of the society even if they do not need to social assistance stemming from poverty. But as in the case of the SSCPA, which was constituted for social service purposes, social assistance is provided to the poor people for supporting social services. Social services and social assistance should be presented with a holistic approach in many cases because; risks rooted from unemployment and inequality of income touch to not only social aid but also social service related institutions.

Similarly, Credit Union of Retirement established as a social security institution had also been responsible for applying the law number 2022 concerning the Pension Payment for Those Over Age 65, Poor and Helpless People as if it is a social assistance institution. (Yılmaz, 2006). Another institution actively functioning in the area of social aid and scholarship for students is the Directorate General of Foundations.

Health sector is also closely related with the social services for some aspects. Law number 2022 disabled people pension and disabled care at home salaries paid by MoFLSS for disabled people, based on the proportion and the kind of the disability stated on the Disability Reports given by the licensed government hospitals of Ministry of Health.

Social service is a profession as a complementary of health services at home due to the psycho-social support, social assistance consultancy and case management roles. Because of that, social
service requirements of the citizens that are beneficiaries of health service at home should be determined, provided and improved (Aydemir, 2003). In order to increase the coordination of social services concerning care at home and home health services, MoFSP and Ministry of Health have signed a protocol in 2015.

Another example of the multi-attribute services which can be both qualified as social service and social assistance is the green card. In this case, poor citizen is not directly given money but, health expenditures are paid in the name of the poor citizen (Yılmaz, 2006). After the last changes in the legislation in 2012, determining the income level is a task of Social Assistance and Solidarity Foundation; social security insurance registration is made by Social Security Institution and health services are presented by Ministry of Health as free of charge.

One of the main problems about social assistance and social services in Turkey is the repetitiveness of social aids for the same beneficiaries, which means helping the same people or family by different institutions. Diversity of the institutions that are responsible for social services and assistance complicates the coordination of the social services against the repetitiveness.

Any institution being applied by citizen for social aid or social service firstly determines the income level of the applicant. Determination of income level basically is based on the salary/pension, ownership of vehicle and real estate property. This information is generally based on the official documents requested from the related government institutions such as Social Security Institution and General Directorate of Land Registry and Cadastre.

Secondly, information about the aids and services given previously by other government institutions to the citizen is an important parameter. According to Çetinkaya (2012) distributed structure of the social assistance and social services including many government institutions, non-profit and private institutions in addition to local governments and municipalities makes it difficult to prevent repetitiveness due to the lack of coordination.

Besides the social aids, some types of the social services require specific official documents or official records that are produced by another government institution due to the legislation. For example, services presented by MoFSS for children and women to be protected require working together with the Ministry of Justice and Directorate General of Security. Some types of services such as shelter for women provided by MoFSS depend on the verdict of the court for those to be protected. That is explicit that there are good opportunities and requirement for coordination and interoperability between social service, justice and security related institutions.

Pandemic which has globally affected all countries which initially saturated the health-care systems of almost all countries including the developed ones. Moreover, there were little information about characteristics of the disease such as rate of date, infection behavior. Additionally, no vaccine or drug has been developed or proved to be effective against coronavirus. All those unknown factors and being caught unprepared for such a global threat, governments felt themselves to take severe precautions for protecting lives.

Consequences of severe precautions have been immediately reflected on other social areas: As soon as the curfews being applied, many of the small business administration had to put up the shutters expecting it to be temporary situation. Many of the people lost their jobs or forced to unpaid vacation. At this point, Turkish Government has taken action against to the newly and instantly emerging social crisis from the perspectives of social security, employment and finally social assistance.

In brief, social policies have a complex and comprehensive structure with all components of it, both in terms of academically and organizationally. So, it is strictly required to flourish the coordination, cooperation and integration of the participants of the social policies, and this has been experienced and proven deeply during pandemic conditions.
Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services: Constitution, Tasks and Information Systems, Activities during Pandemics

Approach and the participation of the government in the area of the social policies and its sub components have been evolutionary during the last century. Many laws have been issued and renewed concerning different aspects of the social policies. Similarly, institutional structure has been re-organized many times. One of the notable steps of the near past is the establishment of the Ministry of Family and Social Policies in 2011.

Diversity of the government institutions which are mainly responsible for conducting social policy related issues have led to ineffectiveness of the services, decline in the service quality, rooted from the lack of coordination of services and policies. MoFSP has been founded in 03.06.2011 in the context of the Decree In the Power of Law 633, for the purpose of increasing the coordination and effectiveness of services in the area of the social policies by aggregating the government institutions, general directorates and managerial units under the same roof for developing, applying and monitoring to the polices and strategies concerning social aids and social services.

In 2018 summer, "Ministry of Family and Social Policies" and "Ministry of Labour and Social Security" has been consolidated and unified as "Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services". Central units of these two Ministries are almost same in size, in terms of number of central unit personnel and general directories. But, the provincial units of the "Ministry of Family and Social Policies" had been quite large. About 50,000 staff and 2000 foundations have been inherited to new Ministry.

By constituting the Ministry of Family Labor and Social Services, main focus had been to strengthen the relation between employment and social security polices inherited from Ministry of Labour and Social Security with the social service and assistance aspects of Ministry of Family. There had been many speculations about why such an action had been taken by the Government. Because even if the employment and social security are the natural components of social policies likewise social services and social assistance, it could be asserted that the relation is not strong enough to unify two Ministries. But, just after the one and half year since the constitution of MoFLSS, it has been proved that it had been a good step against such a once-in-a-lifetime global pandemics.

General directorates and departments directly related with social services and social assistance, tasks given to them and the services provided by these units can be classified mainly in six groups explained below.

Directorate General Family and Society Services (DGFSS) has been constituted in order to determine the national strategies and policies for protection of structure and integrity of family against the social and cultural erosions, inheritance to the next generations in a healthy way and increase the prosperity of the family. Some of the activities conducted by DGFSS are Family Training Programs via online platform and publications, Social Service Centers and Family Social Support Program (ASDEP). In the context of the ASDEP project, it is planned to visit families in their homes and closely taking care of the problems of the family with a dedicated ASDEP expert to the family similar to Family Doctor of Ministry of Health. (Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, Directorate General Family and Society Services, 2018).

Purposes and the tasks of Directorate General Child Services (DGCS) are; preparation of laws and strategies concerning protection of the children from every kind of abusing and negligence, assuring the children growing healthy. Main service type of the DGCS is the Care at Dormitory Services, but the purpose is declining the number of children staying at dormitories by developing new service models which encourage the children stay and cared at family environment. For this purpose, Social Economical Support is given to the families for caring their children in their own home. Similarly, 'Adoption of Children' and the 'Protective Family Service' that base on...
economic support service models are presented for supporting children cared at home. (Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, Directorate General Child Services, 2018)

Directorate General Statue of Women (DGSW) has been constituted for determining the national strategies and policies aiming the protection and improvement of the human rights of the women, fighting against the sexual discrimination, providing the women equality at rights, opportunity and facilities in the all aspects of the society. In this context, daytime and shelter services are provided by the General Directorate. (Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, Directorate General Statue of Women, 2018)

Directorate General of Relatives of Martyrs and Veterans has been constituted for determining the national strategies and policies for maintaining the memories of our martyrs, protecting martyr relatives and veterans from any deprivation and victimization. Application and assessment processes of the employment of the veterans and the martyr relatives as civil-servants by law number 3713 and distribution of the cost-free travelling cards are conducted by this department besides cultural and social activities such as tours and dinners. (Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, Directorate General of Relatives of Martyrs and Veterans, 2018)

Directorate General Disabled and Old (DGDO) has been constituted for developing strategies and policies for protecting the rights of disabled and/or old people against negligence, exclusion and discrimination in the society. Similar to the children services provided by the DGCS, shelter and rehabilitation services are provided to the disabled and old people. Additionally, Disabled Identity Cards are given by DGDO for free travel right and other rights. (Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, Directorate General Disabled and Old, 2018)

Directorate General of Social Assistance (DGSA) is responsible for making regulations, developing and applying strategies for conducting social assistance and aid activities regularly and efficiently to the citizens and refugees requiring social assistance. DGSA actively conducts diversity of social assistance programs covering many disadvantaged and poor sections of the society by providing financial resource. Citizens apply to the Social Assistance and Solidarity Foundations constituted in each and every district governorate. DGSA provides to the SASF’s financial source and web based centralized information system, SAIS. Some of the aid types can be listed as (Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, Directorate General of Social Assistance, 2018):

- Food aids and food houses
- Coal aids
- Shelter aids
- Health aids
- Education material aids
- Conditional health and educational aids
- Project support for employment
- Social residence aids
- Disabled & Old People Pension with law 2022
- General Health Insurance Support
- Disabled Care At Home Pension

DGSA has the most important role after the constitution of the MoFSP. Great difference between the years 2011 and 2012 is rooted from the General Health Insurance payments formerly implemented by Ministry of Health in addition to Disabled and Old People Aids by Law 2022 formerly implemented by the Social Security SSI (İcedal, 2012).

Besides providing social services and assistance, all of the related government institutions are assumed to coordinate the activities and operations of other government and voluntary organizations that are providing services in the context of social policies and cooperate with them.
This means it is strongly required to implement the rules of the interoperability particularly, organizational interoperability for coordination and cooperation. Information systems are strong means of establishing and empowering the integrations and interagency information-sharing.

In addition to the sub-institutions inherited from Ministry of Family, there have been General Directories that are responsible for regulating the labor area such as Directorate General of Labor and Directorate General Business Health and Security. Additionally Related Institutions such as Social Security Institution and Employment Institution has been part of the newly constituted Ministry of Family Labor and Social Services.

This has given the opportunity of governing all social crisis from single point. This has been a quite obligatory power, in order to coordinate all aspects of the pandemics including social security, employment and social aids.

**Information Systems of Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services**

Information systems are configured in order to support different levels of organizational requirements for planning and decision making processes. These levels are categorized as high, middle and low level management. (Caputo, 1988, p. 19-20; Laudon & Laudon, 2011, p.18-19, as cited in Öngen, 2014). Anameriç (2005) states that high level is the strategic level representing the long term planning and decision making by top managers of the organization. Tactical level corresponds to the mid-level management concerning current operations and decisions. Operational level focuses on decisions about planning and the application of current operations in daily and weekly basis.

Different type of management levels and planning types requires different types of information, so information should be managed efficiently in order to provide access to the required information. This yields different types of information systems to be used for diversity of planning and management purposes. Ministry of Family Labor and Social Services has a number of Information Systems in the area of the social assistance and social services having variety of characteristics such as size, complexity, technology and versatility.

SOYBİS project has been developed as an E-Government project by DGSAS for the purpose of prevention of unfair distribution of social assistance by querying the income and wealth factor related information of the citizens applied for social assistance from the data bases of other government institutions. First integration has been established with Identity Information Sharing System (KPS/MERNİS) of Ministry of Domestic Affairs in 2008. After that, many other government institutions have been integrated with SOYBİS using XML Web services. In order to accelerate the integrations, official prerequisite of data integrations, process of signing the protocols has been conducted as parallel with technical process including secure network connection between data centers and development of software code. Software development phase of the project has been implemented by IT human resources of DGSAS. Especially due to the devoted struggle and support of the top level managers up to the Ministers, progress of the project has been very fast and within 2 years about 10 other government institutions has been integrated with SOYBİS project.

Reputation of the SOYBİS project have gone beyond its scope and size; even the project is considered as a comprehensive Social Aid Database, in fact the project consisted of snap queries to the data bases of other government agencies. Yet, it was a visionary project due to the number of integrations and gained interest of other government institutions. Some of the government agencies listed above have started to use the SOYBİS by signing protocols with DGSAS. "Service via Single Step Bureaus constituted in 2006 for facilitating application for social services from single point has been transformed to the "Service via Single Button" with the advent of the SOYBİS" (Yılmaz & Bozkurt, 2014, p.305).
An action named as “Integrated Social Assistance Services” has been included in the 2006-2010 Action Plan of Information Society Strategy prepared by Government Planning Institution [GPI] (2005). In the context of this action, social aids given by Government would be unified, databases related with social aids would be integrated including disabled people data base and household approach would be applied when distributing aids for citizens. Guidance to the social aid related information would be accessed from single point.

At the beginning of the 2009, Integrated Social Assistance Information System Project (SAIS) has been initiated by the Turkey Science and Technology Research Institution [TÜBİTAK] and DGSAS. It is planned to complete the project by the end of 2013, but during the development phase, original contract has been modified in accordance with new module requirements due to changes of the law and new tasks given to the DGSAS/DGSA. SAIS is an information system by which social aid applications of citizens are accepted, house record files are composed, income, wealth factors and socio-economic information are inquired from central data bases of other government institutions, reports of social investigation derived from house visits are recorded, decision of poverty level and aids given by Board of Trustees (Vakif Mütevelli Heyeti) within each SASF, bank payment orders are given and all payments are accounted by the system automatically. System is a means of transparency and accountability, because any of aid detail can be inquired from the system based on National Identity Number. Integrations with other government institutions contributed the prevention of repetition of the social aids and ensured legitimacy and fairness about distribution of social aids in addition to providing efficient use of public resources due to the removal of official writings. Çinar (2013) stated that, by 2012 February, 9 million aid applications has been taken by the system and 3.5 million of applications have been accepted and concluded by 4800 active system users. As the system used actively by SASF’s, robust social assistance data base has been composed providing statistics for development of social policies.

In the research of the Öngen (2015) concerning the information systems used in MoFSP, 87% of the users accepted the SAIS as a facilitating factor to overcome their work load and they could do their job fast and efficiently using this single integrated system. SAIS has played an important role about taking quick action against pandemics in terms of social affairs with its strong and robust structure. It has become quite straightforward to quickly create payment lists from formerly recorded poverty data, and moreover has made it possible to create a brand-new E-Government service with a strong back-end readily being used by SSF’s.

Management Information System (MIS) is the name of the specific information system developed for SSCPA. (Name is same as the general concept of Management Information Systems, but this is a concrete system). Development of the MIS project has been started at year 2000 for the purpose meeting the requirements of the SSCPA consisted of both enterprise resource management such as personnel affairs, official writings, audit, law, financial management modules and social service specific processes. In this context, social service specific modules being developed are:

- Children to be Protected Module
- Disabled Citizens Module
- Old Citizens Module
- Women, Family and Society Module
- Public Relief and Financial Aid Module

After the establishment of the MoFSP, which is mainly based on the SSCPA, some of the modules have been re-organized in order to meet the new requirements until the advent of planned FIS. Besides, Personnel and the Official Writings Modules has been excluded from the project and newly developed for MoFSP with relatively new web technologies.
In the analysis document of the TÜBITAK (2012), it is stated that the success and effectiveness of the MIS project has been affected by two main problems; user unfriendly and relatively old technology, complex end user screens and hard development process due to lack of an advanced IDE for software development. Moreover using the web services presented by other government institutions was not straightforward and required tricky and hard to implement techniques. Another problem stated in the TÜBITAK analysis document about MIS was about analysis process and determining the requirements. The structure of main processes had been requested to change by mid to top level managers that resulted in inconsistency about collected data by the system. MIS was mainly configured for meeting the constantly changing statistical requirements of the central units of the General Directorate and too much data entry was requested from Provincial Organizations that is being considered by end user as useless staff. Consequently MIS has been considered as an insufficient solution for both General Directorates for accessing right statistical data for policy making and auditing purposes. Additionally, provincial organizations of MoFLSS cannot use MIS effectively for managing and organizing their daily back-office operations.

MIS, as the main information system of the MoFSP, have been insufficient about meeting the requirements of the MoFSP including producing healthy and reliable statistical data and covering the business processes operated by the central and provincial managerial and service units. Development of the FIS had been planned by the SSCPAs, even before the establishment of the MoFSP in 2011. After the establishment of the Ministry in 2011 based on the SSCPAs as the core institution of MoFSP on the social service side, requirements and planning phase have been rearranged and a preliminary analysis project have been conducted by TÜBITAK in 2011-2012. But due to the managerial issues and some other factors, project has been initiated in 2015.

Main purposes of the project are monitoring the social services from ‘single point’ conducting all social service specific processes of the diversity of managerial units including provincial institutions, combining the social service based processes with enterprise resource management processes of the MoFSP, increasing efficiency and producing reliable statistical data for strategic and tactical policy making and planning purposes (TÜBITAK, 2012). During the 2016, requirement analysis of modules, development of software infrastructure and main service modules were implemented.

Main difference of the FIS from MIS is that, FIS is expected to provide strong integrations and interoperability with other government institutions using the means of information technologies. It is expected that the heavy work load of the end users about data entry will be diminished by appropriate use of the integrations and this will increase both data quality and reliability of data acquired by system and give more time to end users that are mainly constituted by social workers to focus on the human and social service presentation rather than “fighting against” the information system. By 2017 summer, development stage has started and is to continue.

ASDEP (Family Social Support Project) module of FIS is planned for supporting and facilitating the field work of social workers which have been assigned families for social services, similar to the “Family of Doctor” structure of Ministry of Health. ASDEP is planned as a mobile platform based project in the technical side and will provide the social worker all information required about the family visit, based on the integrations and formerly collected data via other modules of FIS. Çinar (2013) states that, after the establishment of MoFSP, three pilot works has been applied for the project with different technical bases. Finally, tablet based solution has been considered as the best option.

In 2016, ASDEP module was implemented technically for the fourth time as a survey-like, web based mobile application proper for tablets. By 2017 summer, test and pilot was completed and the System is planned to be in use by the end of 2017.
Other Systems: Women Violence Database, Martyr & Veteran Affairs Information System, National Disabled Citizens Data Base

DGWS and the Software Department of the MoFSP have started a project for constituting the Women Violence Database at 2012. In this context, a web application has been developed for recording the protective and preventive verdicts given by courts, Law Enforcement Forces and Governors. Just after the development of the system, an integration process has been started with the Ministry of Justice for querying the court verdicts automatically using web services. Verdicts given by courts constitute the highest ratio of the verdicts given by all Authorities, so it is expected to facilitate and decline the workload of the social service expert and social workers to provide them more time for social work rather than manual data entry which is also prone to error. Moreover, this integration would accelerate incredibly (from weeks to hours) the delivery of the Court verdicts to the MoFSP for taking precaution for emergency cases. Integration processes has taken much more time than the planned and finally close to be qualified as mature enough. Second phase of the integration with Directorate General Security (DGS) has been initiated after the completion of Ministry of Justice integration. This data which is manually gathered by 2017 is also actively being used by DGSW for policy making and reporting purposes. The next phase of the project is planned as delivering the Confidentiality Verdicts to all other government institutions via web services over E-Government Gateway. Currently all process about delivering those important verdicts is implemented via official writings resulting in considerable latency. Development of this system has been initiated as an independent project, but, by 2018, project is included in the Fis.

Employment of veterans and martyr relatives in government institutions and ‘Free of Charge Identity Card’ application and delivery services are two main services of the MoFLSS. Both of these services are operated using the ‘Martyr & Veteran Affairs Information System’ since 2013. Rights given to the veterans and martyr relatives by the MoFLSS are based on the information that whether there exists a pension payment by SSI to veteran himself or at least one relative of the martyr. These conditions are queried from the data bases of SSI and MERNIS system. In case of the exceptional cases such as change at identity register which cannot be easily detectable from the services provided by MERNIS, citizens are redirected to the related government institutions for manual application.

Disablement rate of the citizens is decided by the Health Council Reports prepared by authorized hospitals, but there is not any central data base within the Ministry of Health that holds the data of all disabled people in Turkey. Institution of Disabled People has initiated a project for combining the disability data from a diversity of government institutions such as SSCPA, SSI and Ministry of Health presenting services to the disabled citizens and gathering their disability data.(Candemir,2012) Yet, it cannot be claimed that there exists a reliable data base containing all disabled citizens due to the possibility of citizens which have never applied to Disability Report or used his/her report for any state service. After the constitution of MoFSP, most of the source databases of the project have been included in the context of MoFSP except the disability reports data gathered from Ministry of Health. In fact the project has not been accepted as successful and never been used for facilitating the lives of disabled citizens in practice except some statistical purposes. Main obstacle in front of the disabled people for benefiting from government services that depend on disability report via E-Government Gateway is the lack of the reliable database including all disability reports. Ministry of Health has a database that is compiled from the information systems of hospitals that are authorized to give disability reports. But even the Ministry of Health does not regard those records reliable enough to be attributed for official processes such as ‘Disability Care Pension ’. Because of that reason, it has not been difficult to deliver an integrated service on the E-Government Gateway.
During 2018 National Disabled Citizens Database project has been reorganized and developed within the FIS and also included the data of the Ministry of Health with web service integration. But it is still not possible to verify the validity of the Disabled Report with this system with 100% certainty, unless Ministry of Health would provide verified and e-signed data. This data has not been provided by Ministry of Health by the end of the 2018.

Discussion: Interagency Information-Sharing In the Context of Social Policies
Use of ICT within social service agencies is no longer the issue. Rafferty (1997) states that “the extreme positions of whether ICT should or should not be used within social service agencies are no longer the issue. It is clear that social welfare work requires the support of ICT to progress in an information rich environment. The concentration now is on how this can best be achieved.” Social services and aids differ from many other sectors; because it touches to the human. Moreover target section of the society is generally socially excluded.

Collaboration at Child Care and Other Social Areas
Since the beginning of the new millennium, collaborative case management has become a hot topic in the context of social services. Complex nature of the social problems and policies require the collaboration of many government agencies, each responsible for a different section of the problems such as health, poverty, social security, education, employment and so on. According to the Kunkel & Yowell (2001) collaborative case management is the cooperative delivery of social services to common clients. In this sense, collaborative case management which means working in coordination and closely implies that every institution working on a case of an applicant should share information about the case in order to build a monolith approach. It requires a fundamental shift from policy-based decision making to information-based decision making. Information sharing is a critical tool for collaboration and cooperation and most elegant way of information sharing is integration of the well-structured information systems. Kunkell & Yowell (2001) explain the vision and the future of the collaborative case management using a fictional social worker and the daily working schedule. Besides the other ICT stuff such as scheduling and time management, eligibility determination and other tools including hardware and software, it is strongly emphasized that it is very important accessing and using the information that are kept on the collaborative partner agencies’ databases including legacy systems related with the cases on which social worker is working. In this way, it is expected to increase efficiency both in time and effort for social worker and citizen to be served. Collaboration requires a strategy for sharing information among existing information systems. When the social worker was given the capability of viewing information across agency lines, she was both encouraged and concerned. Increased accessibility to information allows a holistic approach to providing services to a family.

Sensitive and touching to the disadvantaged portion of the society necessities sensitive work both in practice and academically. But, sensitive work should not mean share any information with any other partner. Richardson & Asthana(2006) emphasize the overlooked importance of the interagency information-sharing in the area of the social services such that:

A substantial body of work has explored the role of different barriers to partnership working both professional and organizational at different stages of the collaborative process, from joint decision making to commissioning and provision. However, within this field surprisingly little attention has been paid to the specific issue of inter-organizational information exchange. Following a number of high profile cases in which inadequate information sharing across public service organizational boundaries has contributed to the death of individuals, issues around the keeping and sharing the service user information have come to the fore. Indeed there has been a tangible sense of urgency about the need to improve the way information is exchanged. Against
As stated by the Öngen (2014), one of the most well-known high profile cases is the Victoria Climbie Inquiry and the related report prepared by Lord Laming in 2003. Death of Victoria Climbie who was abused and then killed has become a striking example which inflamed the debate concerning collaboration and information sharing between different Government Agencies and resulted in development of integrated systems such as Risk of Offending Generic Solution (RYOGENS) and Integrated Children’s System (ICS). Child care is one of the most sensitive areas of the social services in which cooperation and information sharing is inevitable. Expectations from collaboration is quite high, but the planning and the implementation phases should be designed carefully both from managerial aspect, official infrastructure and also technical infrastructure. Van & Baum (2002) states that “Interagency collaboration has many challenges such as trust, for being a new concept. Besides the other factors, mostly based on human relations and professional barriers, poor information flow and sharing of information are critical barriers in front of collaboration.” (p.264) In fact, information technologies provide many opportunities in the era of the internet for some of those challenges. But, benefiting from IT opportunities has also its own difficulties and critical points.

**Legal Issues and Drawbacks about Privacy and Information Sharing**

ICT is an enormous potential facilitator mechanism for cooperation, collaboration and particularly information sharing. It is stated by Hudson that, “Integration of services clearly requires a freer sharing of data between agencies and it is here that ICT are fulfilling a crucial role.”(2002, as cited in Garrett 2002, p.525). But, risks and reluctances are also considerable. According to the Keymolen & Broeders (2011), besides the explicit advantages and issues that make almost compulsory, there are some controversial points about use of ICT for storing and information sharing between agencies. In the UK, scholars have critically analyzed the introduction of information sharing and reporting systems, especially since the 2004 Children Act.

In general, interagency information-sharing and cooperation require a legal basis such as laws and protocols. On the other side, information and the way information stored are also criticized issues. As stated by Garrett (2005), in the context of the “Every Child Matter” green paper published by UK Government, the aim is for every locality to have its own database or electronic which will include a list of all the children living in their area and other basic details. However, the plan for local information hubs a new system that will facilitate electronic collating and sharing of information about children and families, has been subjected to a good deal of criticism from children’s rights groups and organizations as diverse as the Women’s Aid Federation and the British Medical Association. Indeed, one respected child care organization, the British Association for Adoption and Fostering (BAAF) has claimed that the databases will amount to the “virtual electronic tagging of families.”

In Turkey, every Ministry and institution hold its own child database depending on the service it provides. For example, Ministry of Education has its own student database. MoFLSS also records the children for paying periodic conditional education aids. Success and attendance information continuously flow between two Ministries for checking whether the aid conditions are met. For UK, Garrett (2005) states that; The long term vision is that information will be stored and accessed electronically by a range of agencies. The databases will be based on national data standards to enable the exchange of information between local authorities and partner agencies, and be capable of interacting with other data sets.

(p.537)
In Turkey, Law for the Protection of Personal Information is a hot topic and claimed to be a preventive factor for interagency information-sharing between related agencies. According to the Wallace (2007), cases such as Climbie led UK government to legislate to improve inter-agency co-operation and hence, implicitly, information sharing and inter-agency reporting arrangements. Section II of the Children Act (2004) for example, created a new statutory duty for a range of bodies to safeguard and promote the welfare of children. In giving effect to this, the Government has created the legal capacity to develop information sharing databases.

In Turkey laws regulating social service area does not explicitly or strongly emphasize the interagency information-sharing and reporting. In general, institutions send an official document to the related government organizations. But all those statements are as if just to ‘inform’ the counterpart organizations officially rather than taking action in a collaborative way. Wallas (2007) notes that ‘about the legal infrastructure for sharing information, some of the countries like USA, Australia and Canada have mandatory reporting laws about child protection and abuse. Some other countries including Denmark, Finland, Sweden and Israel have been working on adopting such mandatory reporting legislation’ (p.4)

Opportunities provided by the Information Technologies enormously facilitate to access the private and sensitive data especially when not designed accordingly. Data is not stored anymore in vaults or well protected secure rooms at a specific single location. Keymolen & Broeders (2011) state that ‘using ICT in social policy is not just a power-neutral digitalisation of existing processes, but that it alters the character of these processes and brings along unforeseen functions and risks’ (p.58)

Extraordinary conditions posed by the pandemic has deeply affected the approaches about information sharing. First of all, citizens that are threatened by poverty and unemployment have begun to search for a way for applying any kind of assistance. ‘Open Gate’ portal of the Ministry of Domestic Affairs and ‘Social Economical Support’ E-Government service of the Ministry of Family consisted the first resort for citizens. In fact, at the beginning of the pandemic, there was not a dedicated and central service for social assistance. ‘Social Economical Support’ service (https://turkiye.gov.tr/ashb-sosyal-ekonomik-destek-on-basvuru) which promised much about social assistance application due its name was only a specific type of social services and had strict rules for acceptance such as having children and an income level below some level. But this service has been applied by over 500,000 citizens (almost 10 times before pandemics) at first few weeks of pandemics.

Under the lead of the Minister Mrs. Selçuk with high level participators from Directorate General Social Assistance, Employment Institute and Social Security Institutions consecutive meeting have been hold to take urgent actions. One of the first few actions taken by the Ministry was using the data readily existed within the Ministry information systems. Primarily, SAIS has been used to determine which citizens would benefit from initial social support. Depending on some rules such as benefiting from specific social aids within last one year pandemic social aid lists have been composed and immediately sent to citizens via PTT. Additionally, beneficiaries of Care at Home for Disabled Aid which is one of the most known social services of the Ministry has been selected for another social aid list.

Aforementioned two social aid lists have been directly extracted from existing databases. After this first quick action, application lists provided by other government organizations such as
- Open Gate applications (Ministry of Domestic Affairs)
- ‘Social Economical Support’ E-Government service which is intended for only children support applications, (Directorate General Children Services)
- List of citizens that have been paid unemployment salary for the last month but currently completed (Employment Institution)
Are imported in to the SAIS database and presented to the Social Solidarity Foundations (SSF) for evaluation which are main users of the SAIS and core structure of the social assistance in Turkey. IT department of the Ministry has developed minor features on SAIS for the new situation for making possible to access and operate on the list of citizens that are settled within the related SSF. Rest of the evaluation process was relatively standard and supported by strong abilities of the SAIS such as central investigations (web service queries for income, ownership of car, estate, social security information and some other information from a diversity of government organizations.) Moreover, some of the appliers had already been in the context of Social Solidarity Foundations and readily contained in SAIS database. Especially in small counties, SSF\textsuperscript{c} are supposed to know which applicant is eligible for social aid. While the urgent actions being taken told above, planning and design of a new brand E-Government service that citizens could apply without going to the SSF. This was very crucial and basic requirement under the pandemic conditions; because citizens are prohibited to go outside due to curfews and even if occasionally curfews took brake, it is not desired to canalize the citizens to the physical locations of SSF\textsuperscript{c} constituting crowds. It has taken almost 2 weeks to prepare the service infrastructure over SAIS, integration with E-Government Gateway and design a batch process to pre-evaluate the applications. As soon as the Pandemic Social Support Service (https://www.turkiye.gov.tr/ashb-pandemi-sosyal-destek-on-basvurusu) has become available at 20 April 2020, citizens overloaded the service immediately. Required technical optimizations have been implemented and applications are rapidly filtered by batch process within two days and redirected to the SSF in which the citizen is settled in compliance with the official address records.

One of the most noteworthy facilitators in this process has been the structure of the MoFLSS. The automatic process of pre-evaluation of applications heavily depended on information hold by Social Security Institution and Employment Institution. Normally, it was expected to take much time to determine criterion, technically access and integrate the for elimination process. Before the pandemic era, DGSA had struggled too much to integrate social security information both semantically and technically. But, being under the same roof, decisions have been taken easier and data transfer is implemented and kept fresh using batch data transfer using FTP rather than web services.

**Information Sharing Model Proposition by Richardson & Asthana (2006)**

Four level information sharing model has been proposed by Richardson and Asthana (2006) in order to find a compromise between the pressures for exchanging information in the interest of service user and the pressure to protect the privacy lead to four possible outcomes with regard to information sharing. In the **Ideal Model** information is exchanged and shared appropriately and when there is a good reason, but equally withheld if necessary. This level provides low risk of breaking confidentiality and low risk of neglecting to pass on important information. **Over-open Model** implies that the information is withheld appropriately when there is a good reason but shared without requiring a good reason. This model may cause the high risk of breaching confidentiality and low risk of neglecting to pass on important information. In the **Over-cautious Model** information is shared when there is a good cause, but withheld without a good reason, resulting a low risk of breaking confidentiality but high risk of neglecting to pass on important information, in contrast to the **Over-Open Model**. Finally, in the **Chaotic Model** neither the important information is shared appropriately with a good reason, nor it is withheld when required due to a good reason which results in breaching confidentiality and neglecting to pass on important information.

Implementation of these models is affected by many factors including, legislation, professional culture, information system infrastructure, organizational structure of the government.
Social Exclusion, Digital Exclusion

E-Government, digital and the social inclusion & exclusion are closely related concepts. Phillips defines social inclusion in contrast to social exclusion, the degree to which citizens are, and feel, integrated into the different relationships, organizations and sub-systems that constitute everyday life. (Phillips, 2006, as cited in Chirara, 2016). Seale, Draffan & Wald (2010, as cited in Chirara, 2018) defined digital inclusion as a phenomenon where marginalized citizens have equal access to and meaningful participation in social and civic activities using digital technologies. According to the Chirara (2018), it is argued that E-Government adoption improves and contributes to the broader goal of improving social inclusion through digital inclusion. It is also noted that the link between digital and social exclusion was more pronounced when a citizen was poor or lacked the requisite skills to use the Internet. Taşçı (2007) also relates the social exclusion with poverty via social assistance by stating that: social assistance is regarded as a means of the prevention of social exclusion. In the definition of the social assistance, one of the constituents of the target groups of social assistance is stated as people who has the danger of socially exclusion.

Chirara (2018) exposes the risk of digital & social exclusion such that:

In the UK, there is a Digital by Default (DbyD) strategy where the government aims to deliver public services through the Internet. One such DbyD services is the Universal Credit (UC) that is UK government's Social Welfare Reform where social welfare benefits are claimed online. For those offline citizens, this has the potential to reinforce social exclusion due to the unintended consequences of digital inclusion (p.15).

Turkey is also struggling to provide social services in a digital way over E-Government Gateway, exposing the risk of augmenting social exclusion. Although it seems still far away such a scenario that citizens can access some government services only via E-Government Gateway, trends are going towards such a point within the Turkey. This may reinforce social exclusion due to the unintended consequences of digital inclusion.

Target groups of the MoFLSS are more prone to be socially excluded. MoFLSS tries to find ways of providing its services to the disadvantaged citizens using ICT opportunities. Two of the ways of realizing this goal are integrating with other government institutions and using E-Government Gateway for providing Government-to-Citizen services. In the area of the social policies, interagency information-sharing via system integrations are prone to errors that would result in failures about distribution and delivery of social aids and other rights given to the citizens. In many cases, citizens that are socially excluded cannot understand and object to such a system failure resulting cutting off their aids. That is why, it is critical to be more and more meticulous while working on integrations both for G2G interagency information-sharing and also G2C services provided over E-Government Gateway.

During the pandemics, especially curfews has urged the citizens to somehow break the digital barriers, if they still exist. Pandemic Social Support Service has contributed to the increment for the number of E-Government Gate users. Service has been applied by over 15.000.000 citizens since April 2020. It is still arguable that the amount of the payment to the citizens (1000 TL for each application) is satisfactory. SAIS has provided great contribution for delivering the aids evenly.

Pandemic Social Support Service had been designed to support only one specific type aid named as pandemic aid paid once as 1000 TL. But, DGSA have implemented a new E-Government service named as Social Service Application Service that is inspired from the Pandemic Social Support Service and initiated at 15.10.2021. This new service supported almost all types of aids readily presented by SSFs. Role of the SAIS as the back-end of this new service is to guide the SSFs to the right type of the aids by automatic web service queries from related government institution for verifying the validity of citizens' declarations when filling the application form.
example, if the citizen has declared that there is disabled person living with him, then the SAIS asks to the web service presented by Ministry of Health, if it is true. There have been over 200,000 applications since the activation of service and vast majority of the applicants has already recorded in the SAIS due former aid applications.

**Conclusion**

We hope this inquiry provides information and insights on implementation of social support services with the use of information technologies with respect to Turkish context before the pandemic. The related discussions shed light on related issues with respect to interagency information sharing and information privacy of the beneficiaries. Accordingly we hope the resulting work be useful for the development of new generation services to address the emerging needs of a society in the post-pandemic era.
AN ACTION RESEARCH INTO AND MODEL DEVELOPMENT FOR SOCIAL SERVICES PROVISION*


Tunç Durmuş Medeni,
Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Turkey, tuncmedeni@gmail.com

Ali Demiröz
Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Turkey, alisdemir33@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
Based on the review of academic and practical information in the article entitled as Social Services and Information Systems: An Inquiry into Turkish Context, in this work the findings from an action research into social services area in Turkey and a model development based on these findings are provided. The resulting work could be useful for related issues with respect to interagency information sharing, as well as quality of services and information security of the beneficiaries of the provided supports in Turkey as well as other countries all around the world.

Key words: Social Services, Information Technologies, Model Development

Introduction
Based on the review of academic and practical information in the article entitled as Social Services and Information Systems: An Inquiry into Turkish Context an action research into MoFLSS and model development was implemented for social service area. Action Research is selected as the primary methodology during the research. Action research methods have been accepted as valid research method in many applied fields such as organisational development, health and education. According to the Gilmore et al. (1986), Action Research aims to contribute both to the practical concerns of people in an immediate problematic situation and to further goals of social science simultaneously. Thus, there is a dual commitment in action research to study a system and concurrently to collaborate with members of the system in changing it in what is together regarded as a desirable direction. Researchers, unlike in other disciplines, makes no attempt to remain objective, but openly acknowledges their bias to the other participants. The term 'Action Research' covers a number of related research approaches but all have in common that they should act as a path to generating knowledge and empowering stakeholders (Bradbury, 2010, p.3)

As the information science related researches are more relevant to practice, Action Research methodology is convenient for information systems related researches (OBrien, 2002). Research by Bolivar, Munoz and Hernandez states that Action Research methodology has been used in technological innovation and modernization in public administration management, e-services and accountability, transparency and dissemination of information subjects related to E-Government (2010). Information technologies and Action Research methodology are expected to converge; ICT is a facilitator for action research for providing better work group opportunities and also being used for employing Action Research techniques to facilitate large-scale changes to their information systems.

In this research, Researcher and the other actors included in the research are also member of the MoFLSS. Researcher has the title of head of software department during the research and also is one of the developers of SOYBIS project. Researcher have also participated and contributed the integrations of the SAIS and Family Information System. Total experience of the Researcher about integration is about 9 years starting from 2009 and covers the terms of DGSAS(2008), DGSASA&MoFSP(2011) and MoFLSS(2018). Other participants of the research have all participated in the integration processes either with managerial/business or technical roles.
Action Research does not limit or impose a specific data collection technique. Different methods can be used by the researcher to solve the problem that action research concerns. According to the O'Brien, these various methods, which are generally common to the qualitative research paradigm, include keeping a research journal, document collection and analysis, participant observation recordings, questionnaire surveys, structured and unstructured interviews, and case studies (1998). During this research, qualitative data collection techniques will be used. According to the Yıldırım & Şimşek qualitative research is defined as a technique in which qualitative data collection techniques such as observation interview and document analysis are used, events and perceptions are revealed in their natural environment in an integrated and realistic way.Ö (2008, p.39, as cited in Karataş, 2015). In this research, data has been collected via in-depth interview technique by using the semi-structured interview form including open ended questions concerning problems, benefits and key factors about the interagency information-sharing, E-Government interoperability and integration processes of the MoFLSS. In-depth interviews are suitable for different purposes such as understanding and unveiling the habits, beliefs, attitudes and emotions in addition to reveal the experience and wisdom of the expert of the subject in depth. Semi-structured interview form has been composed based on the literature review and also field experience of the Researcher that is an employee of the MoFLSS. After the composition of the interview form, pilot interviews have been applied and interview form has been revised accordingly. Besides the data derived from interviews, Researcher has examined official documents, data sharing protocols and also participated and observed the integration processes.

Interview form includes 10 questions concerning the technical, managerial and legislation aspects and the benefits of the integrations. Besides that, personal information of the interviewee related such as position and experience are also included. Semi structured interview form has been applied between 2017 August and 2018 April, to 13 personnel of the Ministry working for diversity of divisions including IT department, core service units such as child, women and poverty affairs. Interview has taken from ten minute to about half an hour. Answers given by interviewees have been recorded and transcribed by the Researcher.

Findings
Findings about the Case Management and the Contribution of Integrations & Information Systems
In accordance with the definition of the Case Management in the literature such that ‘cooperative delivery of social services to common clients’ Case Management is regarded as an important concept and approach by almost all interviewees. One of the interviewees stated that;

Case Management is important; area of the social service requires a multi-stakeholder environment in many times. (5. Interviewee: 32, Expert, Head of Department)

It is stated that Case Management Approach yields more benefit and performance in comparison with other approaches. Especially in social service area including women and children affairs require multi-stakeholders implementing their own responsibilities within the case management. An expert working on violence against women emphasized that

There is a service loop between police force, Ministry of Health, MoFLSS and Ministry of Justice in the case of violence against women. These four institutions work on the same case almost simultaneously. (3. Interviewee, Expert, Head of Department, Social Service)

Similarly, children affairs require the collaboration of MoFLSS, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Justice and Ministry of Health.
It is also stated that many government institutions are working on service areas intersecting with each other. Same house/family is possibly visited multiple times via a diversity of government institutions and findings about the risk factors within the house are required to be shared with other government institutions. Especially, in the social assistance branch of the social policies, house visits take an important role for determining the poverty level and are applied strictly. Furthermore, poverty is very closely related with other social problems. Sharing of the information and the impressions gained about the family, during the family visit would facilitate taking the precautions by the most convenient government institution as early as possible and prevent the cases growing further. An expert stated that;

If we detect a women detained by her husband, then we cannot say that ‘let’s write an official document to the Ministry of Domestic Affairs”. It would yield better results to send a notification over system to whom is responsible for such cases within the Ministry of Domestic Affairs. (2. Interviewee, 35, Expert, Social Assistance)

Moreover, it is stated that, citizens could be disturbed multiple times for just identification of a diversity of social risks. Visit of each family separately by each organization also increases the cost for the Government. Implementing the case management via official writings, which is still very common in social services, would result in the risk of causing latency about intervening the case. Information flow between the government institutions should be very fast and this could be provided by using automatized and online information sharing between the systems of the case-related government agencies. This provides more efficient and effective involvement for the case. According to one of the interviewees, technically, this effective information sharing could be achieved by using the E-Government Gateway of the TÜRKSAT.

Another interviewee working as technical adviser for the Ministry stated that;

Design of the information systems by which information is shared and consumed, is an important factor for the success of the information sharing. Without providing user friendly screens and filtering options, end users of the system would not benefit thoroughly from the information provided by partners of the managed case. (9. Interviewee: 46, Technical Adviser)

Information sharing in the context of the Case Management between government agencies poses the information security issues besides its expected benefits. Boundaries should be drawn very carefully and the awareness about the confidentiality and privacy must be enhanced within the personnel of the government agencies sharing sensitive personal information. It is stated by one of the interviewees working as social service expert for many years that

Not every information can shared with everybody; information you have shared would devastate the rest of the private life, may cause social exclusion and return back to disadvantaged position, even result in a murder. (11. Interviewee: 47, Social Worker, Head of Department, Social Service)

In conclusion, Case Management via online information sharing is regarded as a vital and important approach provided that the privacy issues are regarded properly.

Findings about the Contributions of the Integrations for Reducing Bureaucracy, Increasing Efficiency and Assessment of Level of Success

In general, it was stated that integrations and the interagency information-sharing contribute for reducing the bureaucracy and implementing the social services more effectively and time efficiently. Especially, interviewees working on social assistance area emphasized repetitively the benefits of the integrations implemented within the SAIS and the SOYBIS. Formerly, citizens that
were applying for social aids has to collect many official documents from a diversity of other government institutions for proving their income level which took much time, effort and monetary cost. After the advent of the SOYBIS and SAIS that have many integrations with other government institutions, citizens does have to collect almost no documents; instead, personnel can easily access the social security information, salary/pension information, vehicle and estate ownership, and some other auxiliary data owned by other government institutions using SAIS within a few minutes. Moreover system automatically repeats those queries periodically and can take action or warn the end users of the systems, when it finds any change about the situation of the aid beneficiaries. An expert working on disability and old pension stated that:

It has been taking almost one year to conclude an application for disabled & old pension, but after the usage of SAIS with the integrations, all those processes have been reduced to 19 days approximately. (1. Interviewee, 32, Expert, Head of Department, Social Assistance)

According to the interviewees, women services against violence and murders have also benefited from integrations deeply. Before the integration with Ministry of Justice, court verdicts had a long way including posting and classification before being delivered to MoFLSS. After the integration established between Ministries, data flow is implemented almost instantly; the data has been entered to the system of the Ministry of Justice, then proper action is taken by the MoFLSS as soon as possible, which also reduces bureaucracy.

Child related services also require data from other government institutions that have services related with the children. Gathering family information, education related information and also information about social services applied formerly to the children is expected to empower the decision making mechanisms for specifying what actions will be taken and which services will be applied. But, the integration provided by the current information systems has been found not adequate due to some technological and managerial issues and far from meeting the expectations of the expert providing children services. It was stated that:

IT department is trying to conduct integrations with different units in the area of the child services. But there is not a thorough integration yet, especially regarding MIS. (4. Interviewee: 43, Social Worker, Social Service)

New IT project named as FIS conducted by IT Department of Ministry is expected by interviewees particularly working on child services to provide all integrations required for providing better service delivery for children.

While evaluating the sufficiency and maturity level of the integrations, different remarks have been stated by the interviewees. Experts working on social assistance area generally found the success level of the integrations enough. It has been stated that the SAIS Project has been praised and being exemplified in many reports. Many other country authorities visit and inquire about the SAIS and there had been a presentation of the system in Washington in an organization of World Bank. Yet, some of the social assistance experts have expressed there is much to do with integrations. For example, an expert working on disability pension service said that:

We do not require any official document from our disabled citizens for the disabled salary/pension procedures except that the Disability Report ironically. If we are able to access this data from the systems of the Ministry of Health, we will be able to conduct all process without requiring any document from disabled citizens. Moreover, we will be able to prevent the forgery cases utterly and have robust statistical data for further policy making efforts. (1. Interviewee, 32, Expert, Head of Department, Social Assistance)
Women service experts have stated that they have been working on similar integration issue for accessing the data with other government institutions related with security, as they are doing with Ministry of Justice currently.

In conclusion, there have been good examples of integrations especially on social aid and women services areas, but still there is some more work to do about new integrations. Child services area is the weakest chain of the ring currently and it is expected to step forward with the advent of the FIS. Success level is expected to boost via the sponsorship of the high level managers.

Findings and Suggestions about the Difficulties Encountered Concerning Interagency Information-Sharing and Establishing Integrations

Answers given for this issue mainly focus on absence of standardization of data between different government institutions, technical infrastructure incompatibilities, coordination problems, and accessing documentation and right person for right information when using the counterparts data. As the first problem, it is stated that, required data from another government institution has not been always recorded in a database, or, data is not regarded as reliable enough to be shared via technical integration. As stated by some of the interviewees, Ministry of Health does not provide a service for sharing Disability Report data with other government institution due to the data reliability issues. Similarly, Ministry of Food Agriculture and Livestock has not shared the animal ownership data for a long time, until the recent completion of the new database and system project.

Another problem stressed by the interviewees about the integrations is the data structure. In the social area data is classified and structured based on the person and so, National Identity Number. But in some government institutions related with the social area, data is stored as based on file and event record. Even if the National Identity Number is included in the database, it must be processed first, before recording it into the databases of the MoFLSS.

Data entry process is an important step for providing reliable data to another government institution. When the data is not entered to the information system correctly and on time, it affects the integration based on that data. According to an interviewee, MoFSP has encountered such a problem while integrating NJNP system of Ministry of Justice. MoFSP has suggested and requested from Ministry of Justice to increase the awareness of the data entry operators by organising extra training programs. When the data is entered false, to the NJNP system, this data has to be re-entered by the personnel of the MoFSP. Moreover categorization of the data has not been fully compatible with the requirements of the MoFSP. An interviewee working on this area said that:

Basic and the biggest problem we had to cope with was that, every institution use different systematic for keeping data; some keep data based on National Identity Number, another based on case number and one another use the file number. (3. Interviewee, Expert, Head of Department, Social Service)

Ministry of the Justice has categorized the data as defendant and the plaintiff in all cases mainly, whereas MoFSP has expected to differentiate as ‘appliers of the violence’ and ‘victims of the violence’. NJNP system kept records based on verdicts, but not persons. For standardizing data, cooperative work has been done and even the data entry screens have been changed in order to meet the requirements of the MoFSP. This requirements and the extra work have extended the integration period over years. As it can be clearly seen from this example, for reliable integration, beyond understanding and standardizing data, intervention to the internal operations of counterpart is required, such as suggesting and compelling counterpart government institution for improvement about the training level of their personnel.

Another striking example stated by the interviewees is the Social Security Institution integration. Due to the large and distributed structure of the SSI, integration process has also become complex.
and hard as it has been explained in detail in the light of the experiences of Researcher in section
3.3.1.3 of this research. An interviewee also verified and expressed such that;

SSI is a huge institution. There is nobody that knows all distributed data within the institution. There are many different software systems and databases for different units. Data has been stored in different areas. We want to get all these data for determining social security status. In fact they give the data, but when we ask that ‘What is the meaning of this data?’ then they redirect to another unit, and sometimes the redirected unit also do not have the answers. We are generally struggling too much to overcome such problems (2. Interviewee, 35, Expert, Social Assistance)

It is stated by one of the interviewees that, because of such problems, as the consumer of the data, they have to run the risk of using data with their perceptions by taking initiative. As a consequence, corrections have been made via feedbacks from field. This causes the risk of stopping the regular aids of the citizens, which is then very difficult to compensate.

Interviewees working at technical level stated that problems encountered at the technical level generally composed of secure network infrastructure and the software development phases. Mostly, government institutions prefer to set up a secure network connection for sharing information and not to publish directly to the internet. According to an interviewee working on network area;

Diversity of the types and models of network devices and also firewall technologies being used by government institutions causes some problems while setting up secure network connection (VPN) between the systems. Experience and specialty of the technical personnel is another problem at this point. If they do not have enough experience on the network devices that they manage, access problems are encountered and cannot be solved quickly. Some of the government institutions stipulate point-to-point dedicated secure connection isolated from the internet for increased security. This type of connection requires procurement process besides the technical work, and so prolongs the integration time. Kamunet project which is a closed secure network infrastructure that combines and connects the network infrastructures of all government institutions is regarded as a solution to network connectivity problems. MoFSP is also working on to be included in Kamunet. (6. Interviewee: System Programmer, Head of Network Department)

Different software technologies used for developing the web services or consuming those web services may also result in problems. Although there are standards for data sharing such as SOAP and WSDL, implementation of the standards may vary from platform to platform. An interviewee working as software developer stated that

We had some difficulties when we first used the Restful web services provided by Ministry of Health. It took some extra time to use, because we had not been familiar with Restful services. (8. Interviewee: 32, Assistant Expert)

Restful services are a relatively new web service technology and data structure is less standard compared to SOAP. Adapting the new technologies also extend the time required for integration. Additionally, some government institutions use extra security layer at the service level. Central Bank web service had some extra security certificate issues which took almost one year to solve how to consume service technically.

Coordination problems have also been emphasized by many of the interviewees. Integrations have multiple steps from beginning to completion and every step is conducted by different units of the
organizations. Both technical staff and social/business units have to work in coordination for a successful integration. When there is not a dedicated coordinator who controls all steps of the integration, problems may stay unsolved and nobody is aware of that there is a bottleneck. An interviewee stated that integration process was not a one time work, in contrast it was a continuous process; even if everything was completed successfully and data flow was succeeded between counterparts, any of the steps that had successfully passed before might change and data flow might stop or distorted. He also stated that due to such a data change performed by SSI, some of the regular social aids/salaries had been stopped.

Government institutions which have a high level of institutionalization are good at this point; they always notify when there will be planned network access failure or their service will be changed. Personnel circulation within the government institutions is another problem at this point. Organizational memory is lost via this circulation due to the weak knowledge management and this factor affects the success level and continuity of integrations.

As a result, interagency information-sharing and integration of systems of the different government institutions have some challenges, including data quality stemming from data entry and other problems, insufficient documentation of the web services and the data itself, standardization of the data between organizations, finding the right colleagues at other organization due to fast circulation of personnel within and between organizations, and technical level problems. All those problems result in prolonging integration processes and inevitable data interpretation errors, causing citizens’ victimization.


In this question, interviewees were asked to evaluate the information sharing approach of Ministry in terms of a four level information sharing model proposed by Richardson and Asthana. According to Richardson and Asthana, with respect to the interest of the service users and the pressure to protect their privacy leads to four possible outcomes with regard to information sharing, in order to find a compromise between the pressures for exchanging information: Ideal Model, Over-open Model, Over-Cautious Model, and the Chaotic Model. Characteristics of these models have been explained in more detail in previous section (2.5.3) in this research.

Almost all of the interviewees stated that the information sharing approach of Ministry is consonant with the Ideal Model. Information to be shared with other government institutions or voluntary organizations are classified, evaluated and filtered carefully. Private information belonging to the Ministry is not exposed directly; protocols are signed to clarify which data will be shared and which techniques such as web service, FTP. In fact, even if the social assistance data is not regarded as critical to yield an infringement of confidentiality, it is still very valuable for private sector to have the database of disabled citizens, which is a part of the social aids database. An expert stated that;

If we consider the SAIS, we are trying to conform to the Ideal model. We approach to decrease the risk. If you act over-cautious, then you may obstruct the information sharing process. (12. Interviewee: 36, Team Leader)

As an exceptional case closer to the Over Open Model, SOYBIS application which is still extensively being used within the Ministry in social service area rather than the social aids, to determine the income level of the social service applicants, has also been allowed to be used by the Directorate General of Foundations (DGF) affiliated to Ministry of Culture and Tourism. By using the SOYBIS application, DGF can access the information produced by MoFLSS and also other government institutions’ data such as social security, vehicle ownership and land/estate ownership. This was a managerial decision due to urgent need of the DGF and the insufficient technical infrastructure to integrate all other government institutions. An expert in the area of the social assistance stated that;
In fact, we are sharing quite serious information with other government institutions; we both take and also share much. Mostly with DGF, because we have given them SOYBIS. In fact, this is beyond the information sharing; we directly gave the system. (13. Interviewee, 35, Expert, Social Assistance, Head of Department)

In the area of the women and the child services concerning violence/murder and child abuse, confidentiality is more prominent due to the risk of death, social exclusion and other social risks. So, it has been stated by some interviewees that Over-Cautious Model is also preferable to minimize the risks. As a conclusion, there should be good balance for information sharing such that neither any citizen would be the victim of the careless information sharing nor, poor information sharing as in the case of the Victoria Climbie.

**Assessments and Model Suggestion**

During the research, it can be easily seen that social policy is a very complex and intricate area in compliance with the complex nature of the social sciences. There is a diversity of branches such as social services for children, women, disabled and olds, social security, health services, employment and social assistance. All those services are provided by different government institutions, local administrations and voluntary organizations. In general, MoFLSS is responsible for providing many of the social services and collaborates with other stakeholders to do so. Even if there are not exact boundaries between the services of the MoFLSS, it is notable that social assistance is more prominent in terms of the information systems and the interagency information-sharing.

As it is stated in the limitations of the research (section 1.4, page 7), answers to the interview questions depended on the titles, experiences and the positions of the interviewees. Benefits, gaps (future expectations) and the results of the possible problems of the integrations are more explicitly emphasized by the personnel working on the managerial/business side and area experts. In this context, integration requirement for disabled health report, and similarly, aids being stopped due to integration failures are strongly stressed by the interviewees working on managerial/business area. In turn, technical and technological problems, such as network problems, software standards, and technical capability of counterpart organizations were stressed by interviewees that have in the technical title.

In the light of the answers given to the interview questions, experiences and the observations of the Researcher, use of the information systems both in the social assistance and social services areas is regarded as inevitable, especially when considering the high volume of service beneficiaries compared to the limited number of employees. Particularly, SAIS of the DGSA was told as the prominent information system of the Ministry, by which about 40,000,000 citizens were recorded and almost millions of citizens were supplied regular aids. Total number of the SAIS users was about 6,000 by 2017, which can be considered as quite low compared to large number of citizens being served.

On the other hand, intelligent systems that are ‘deciding’ instead of the social workers are not fully welcomed and they were expected just to support decision making. Using intelligent systems for analyzing the data, collected from the social service beneficiaries by using survey-like techniques such as ASDEP Project of the Ministry, would facilitate the detection of social risk. But, using a fully automated process for deciding social security status that is prerequisite of some type of regular aids had resulted in unintended stoppage of those aids. Even if the information systems are very beneficial in the area of the social services, they must be carefully planned, organized and implemented in such a sensitive area.

Collaborative Case Management heavily depends on the interagency information sharing of the institutions working on the same incidents from different, but related aspects (Kunkel & Yowell, 2001). It is known and found beneficial by the social service workers, but not implemented in a structural way in our country. Only one type of the sub-institutions of the Ministry named as Child
Support Centers apply case management for children. In general, Case Management implies the cooperation of a diversity of government institutions on the same case and can be best achieved via effective interagency information-sharing. Still, it is quite common to use old style bureaucracy and official writings even in such a sensitive area in which latency is very unacceptable and occasionally ending up with death cases. Interviewees expect from the newly developing FIS to provide integrations with other government institutions and also with the SAIS of the DGSA. Poverty is very closely related with other social problems and many of the houses recorded within the SAIS is visited by the social workers of the SASFs and have the chance of detecting other social problems besides the poverty. Moreover there exists a Case Management Module within the SAIS at least for last four years, for notifying other government agencies over E-Government Gateway for the cases inspected during house visit records. But this module has not been used with full functionality and remained in the test phase due to legislation and managerial issues. Because, as it is stated by an interviewee, current legislation does not support initiating the social services without explicit application of the citizens (except some criminal cases) in general and such information sharing between government institutions.

Interagency information-sharing activities of the MoFLSS have been generally found very beneficial and especially actively used in the area of the social aids. SAIS has been providing strong integration opportunities to its end users for reducing bureaucracy and boost efficiency. Citizens do not have to collect many documents from other government institutions anymore for proving their income level. For now, many of the information required by the social aid workers are provided by SAIS such as identity information, address information, social security status and salary/pension amount for both working actively and retired citizens, estate and land ownership, tax payment status, vehicle ownership, care at home payments for disabled & old citizens, children care at home payments, the number and type of the owned cows or ships, other social solidarity foundation aids, unemployment payments, scholarship payments. By accessing all those critical information, aid applications are evaluated and concluded quite earlier compared to past. For example, concluding the disabled & old pension applications has been declined to 19 days, which is formerly taking almost 1 year, due to aforementioned integrations provided by SAIS. This is a quite short time compared to the Universal Credit (UC) system of the United Kingdom which is an electronic gateway for social welfare applications. Chirara (2018) states that, “Between registering for UC payments, providing documentary evidence and getting the first payment, there is a six-week waiting period (soon to be reduced to five-weeks). Although there is a credit called as ‘advance payment’ that the government can give while awaiting the UC payment, this can trigger spiraling into debt and subsequently lead to social exclusion” (p. 114). Other social service areas such as child, disabled & old and women also require all those income level determining related information and use SOYBIS for accessing those information. SAIS also shares information with other government institutions that need social aid information. Additionally, SAIS supports organizational interoperability as in the case of sharing General Health Insurance related income level test results with SSI. Similarly, health insurance registrations of disabled & old pension beneficiaries are implemented via web service integration with SSI.

Women services related department of the Ministry, DGSW, also use interagency information-sharing especially with the Ministry of Justice. DGSW also work on actively for integrating with the DGS in the same way. Child services also deeply require integrating with other government institutions especially with Ministry of Education and Ministry of Justice, but there is still much to work on this issue.

SOYBIS is also well known for aggregating a lot of information from other government institutions and also information from different departments of the MoFLSS. But MIS is notorious for its old technology that is hardly supporting web service integrations. Expectations
from the new brand FIS in terms of integrations are very dense in the area of the women, children and old & disabled services.

In general, as an answer to the first research question of this research asking for the remarkable integrations and their benefits, it can be summarized briefly such that, in the area of the social aids, there are many good examples of integrations providing diversity of benefits. But, in the area of the social services, there is still a lot of work.

In the context of the second research question of this research, it can be understood that interagency information-sharing has its own specific difficulties and risks besides the provided benefits. It is notable that, many of the interviewees has common ideas for much of the interview questions, but especially answers for the “problems and difficulties” part varied depending on the speciality and business area of the interviewee. One of the mostly highlighted difficulties has been stated as the data quality and standardization. Women services of the DGSW had struggled much to overcome such difficulties over years while integrating with Ministry of Justice for transforming the data format about violence against women and even had contributed redesigning the data entry screens of the NJNP system of the Ministry of Justice.

Disability health report information is critical and required by DGSA and DGDO both for pension payments and institutional care; but it has not been provided by the Ministry of Health due to the insufficient data quality. In fact, there exists a web service providing individual disability reports citizen by citizen for statistical purposes. This data has been readily used in the context of the constitution of National Disabled Database (As a module of the FIS currently) project of the DGDO. But this data cannot be used for concluding disabled & old pension or institutional care applications. Ministry of Health promises a new brand web service that will provide validated data via E-Sign in 2019. But, formerly given reports would not be validated using this new service. So, even after the advent of this new service, disabled citizens currently having a valid disability report will also have to be proceeding in old way when they apply the services of the MoFLSS.

Another critical information required by the Ministry is the social security related data which is provided by SSI. Usage of the social security information provided by SSI via web services requires being meticulous when interpreting the data to determine the social security status of the citizens and also net salary. Lack of documentation of service data and finding the right counterpart within the SSI that could give the right information for service interpretation has been strongly stated as really challenging problems. Additionally, business rules of the each type of aid may also regard and evaluate the social security information in a different way due to the legislation. Some type of the aids such as old & disabled and conditional education aids exactly imply the stoppage/refusal of the regular aid with ‘some type of social security’ but in turn, some of the aid types regard only the amount of the social security pension impacting total income.

In addition to the data quality problems, technical infrastructure and capability of the IT staff may cause latencies at web service integration. Lack of a dedicated coordinator for integration process results in unexpected latencies for integration process; because data being shared between the systems of the two institution travels through many technical and logical layers such as networks switches, routers, firewalls, web service proxies, data consumer software and database. Integration with the Turkish Coal Institution has taken almost one year on the technical side due to coordination problems. Finally, the Researcher have intervened and coordinated the whole integration process starting from coal aid related sub-division of DGSA to the IT Company supporting the software and network infrastructure of the Turkish Coal Institution. After this strict coordination, problems have been solved in a short time and integration has been established. Time required for integration is determined by total time spent for both official processes and the technical work. Managerial processes such as signing protocol, official writings and technical problems such as VPN and service development are important factors extending the integration time. ‘Reusing’ the official processes generally shortens the integration time and this can be
The International Scientific Conference of Librarians
Western Balkan Information and Media Literacy Conference 2021
& 10th International Summit of Book

provided by full coordination the official processes of the General Directories of the Ministry. In fact, Strategy Development Headship is responsible for such coordination, but they have not fully participated in integrations in such a way. At this point, Researcher has always suggested that the signing of the data sharing protocols should be at Ministry level rather than General Directorate level, when he has been officially asked as the Head of Software Department of the IT. Because, information being integrated is always prone to be required by multiple departments of the Ministry sooner or later. For example, graduation information of the citizens is required for both employment of the children protected by Ministry and also martyr relatives and veterans. The Protocol, requesting this information from High Education Council has been signed via DGCS in the name of the just DGCS in spite of the suggestion of Researcher. Directorate General Martyrs Relatives will have to repeat the official process.

In the light of the experiences of the interviewees, required time for integration from starting to end may take from one month to a few years, but in average about 6 months. Top level management is expected to solve possible deadlocks during integration process and so, awareness of the top level management about the importance of the interagency information-sharing is critical. Fortunately, new generation managers within the Ministry are quite well aware of the importance of this subject and also more familiar with information technologies related notions. As a striking example, Head of the Old&Disabled Aids department of the DGSA is quite familiar with web service technologies such as WSDL and SOAP due to the participation in integrations of the Ministry, even though he is graduated from social sciences. Importance of the high level management on integrations has also been most notable and prominent result of the contingency analysis conducted over interview transcriptions.

Third research question of this research is about the E-Government Gateway and its role in the integrations. E-Government Gateway is well-known by almost everyone for G2C services. But, G2G services are only appreciated by the employees who have participated in a G2G integration process. It is generally found very beneficial to use the E-Government Gateway for sharing information with multiple counterpart government organizations. Especially, income level related information of the citizens and the aids provided by SASFs formerly or actively are very precious information for many other government institutions and local authorities. Moreover, Disability Report data and Disability Identity Card data are frequently asked by other government institutions and some private sector companies for providing additional advantages and discounts for disabled citizens. Similarly, martyr and veteran data are asked from Ministry for providing advantages similar with the disabled citizens. Finally, MoFLSS is on the way of gathering all information centrally about the women to be protected and it is expected to share this critical information with all other government institutions. Rather than integrating point to point to each requester, all those information are planned to be provided over E-Government Gateway centrally over web services and can be consumed easily just by defining access credentials. Currently, some of the government organizations such as DGF, SSI, Credit and Dormitory Institution and voluntary organizations such as Turkish Red Crescent use the social aid information service over E-Government Gateway readily, or, are working on integration. Moreover, network infrastructures of all government institutions are unified via Kamunet project that is expected to increase efficiency and security.

Another key point about the E-Government services is the trend of the Whole-of-Government. In this manner, Ministry provides a good example of G2C WoG service for accepting the applications of Free Travel Card for martyr relatives and veterans; after the application of the citizen, data is validated online and simultaneously by accessing the MERNIS and SSI web services in the background. Of course, there is still much to do for benefiting from the opportunities of E-Government Gateway concerning WoG. One of the most important steps forward for providing WoG is considered as the Disability Report validation from Ministry of Health. Current G2C services of the Ministry, related with disability report information do not
truly facilitate the lives of the disabled citizens; because, these services are designed to be appointment/preliminary application services and citizens should still bring their disability report physically, to the locations of the Ministry for their real application. As soon as the Ministry of Health provide validated disability report data, this service is planned to be integrated within the G2C services of the MoFLSS and transform those services to the Whole-of-Government manner.

Law for the Protection of Personal Data is known in general and found beneficial although there has already been laws concerning protection of personal information. Advent of the new law has contributed to the augmentation of the awareness. In the area of the social aids, necessities of the law have already been implemented strictly for last 10 years by requesting a signed document from applicants of the aids stating that they permit that their personal data could be queried from other government institutions. All of the citizens recorded in SAIS database and the citizens queried using SOYBIS are assumed to give wet-signed permission. But, there are also some apprehensions in the area of the social services, which is more sensitive and prone to the actions that could be taken without application of the citizens in some cases. It is stated that it would be very beneficial and relieving that social service area could be stated as exceptional when it is inevitable to access and query personal data to fulfill the tasks given by laws. In fact, when the Institution of the Protection of Personal Data has been asked opinion via official writings asking whether the citizens that are planned to be served and queried by Ministry, but have not signed any permission document. According to answer to this question citizens could be queried if the citizen is going to be given some right or benefit. But it would be far better that related law explicitly had stated the situations conforming to this interpretation of law.

Interagency information-sharing approach of the Ministry is evaluated against the model proposed by Richardson & Asthana (2006) and generally stated as close to the "ideal model" in which information is exchanged and shared appropriately and when there is a good reason, but equally withheld if necessary.

![Figure 1: Application of the Academic Model by Richardson & Asthana (2006) to the MoFLSS](image)

According to the application of the academic model proposed by the Richardson & Asthana (2006), Ministry has recently experienced the A, B and C sections of the model. Information sharings in the area of the social assistance over SAIS project are quite compliant with the A section of the model. But in turn, it has been stated by one of the interviewees that, SOYBIS
project poses the risk of driving the position of the Ministry to the B, and even to the D section of the model by sharing the information with another government organization (DGF) as a proxy system. At this point, the Researcher also proposes and suggests to the high level management that the SOYBIS should be closed to DGF, and not to be opened for other government institutions such as SSI and local administrations (SSI and diversity of municipalities have requested many times to access SOYBIS and rejected by the Ministry). Instead, only the part of the information that belongs to Ministry should be shared over web services using E-Government Gateway. In the area of the social services, particularly women and child services, Ministry tries to find a compromise between A and C owing to the more sensitive nature of these areas. This is because, the information being shared uncarefully resulting in death or loss of privacy is more severe and less accountable compared to the situation in which information is not shared and resulted in victimization.

Heavy conditions introduced by the pandemic have partly changed the perspective to information sharing, namely some of the barriers have been surpassed. Although being under the same Ministry, information sharing between DGSA, Social Security and Employment Institutions had not been so easy and some bureaucratic steps such as signing protocols must have been strictly followed. But as soon as pandemics have begun to affect social conditions, barriers have been minimized and some quick official writings between parties have become sufficient. Moreover, after the citizens have been included in the SAIS database and ready to be evaluated by SSFs, only the direct applicants of the Pandemic Social Support Service has been approved to be queried from other government institutions' databases. But the structure of the SAIS and also standard procedures of poverty evaluation implemented by SSFs have had household approach; which means any application to any social aid is evaluated with all households. Members of households are determined by MERNIS queries and declaration of applicants. After the members are determined, all members are queried from web services. Normally, when the citizen physically applies to the SSF, wet-signed documents for all family members above age 18 is a must. But during pandemic conditions that was fairly difficult if not impossible. Fortunately, Institution of the Protection of Personal Data has declared that the personal information queries during pandemic conditions are exemplified.

In this context it can be said that information sharing model of Ministry of Family and some other government institutions have converged back to the Over Open Model and B section of the figure. In compliance with the nature of the action research, the Researcher has participated in a lot of interagency information-sharing work during the research. General Directorates of the Ministry about to initiating integration process and signing protocols have been suggested and redirected by the Researcher to sign the protocol Ministry level rather than General Directorate level. They are also advised to include a matter in the protocol stating that changes in data format and context would be handled by official writings rather than changing the original protocol to reflect the change. Problems about ongoing integrations and establishment of the new ones have been coordinated by the Researcher many times. In this context, many of the integrations requests coming from other government institutions have been provided over E-Government Gateway.

Observations and the experiences of the Researcher that are expressed in the first section of the ‘Research Section’ under the ‘General Analysis Over Experience and Observation’ title are quite well coherent with the results of the interviews conducted and contingency analysis. Additionally, experiences and the findings of the research have been presented to the Chief Information Officer of the Ministry via official writing as a seven page report. As a compilation of the issues stated by the interviewees and experiences of the Researcher, success and failure factors that are affecting the integrations and interagency information sharing are listed in the table below.
Table 1: Summary of the Success and Failure Factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Success Factors</th>
<th>Failure Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strong sponsorship of the high level management (SOYBIS/SAIS cases)</td>
<td>Long running and repeating bureaucratic official processes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT oriented and visionary new generation managers</td>
<td>Lack of coordination between/within institutions at technical and managerial level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficient use of opportunities provided by E-Government Gateway and Kamunet</td>
<td>Insufficient data quality and documentation of some of the government institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experienced and technically qualified personnel</td>
<td>Complex business rules of the counterpart institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong communication and coordination between counterparts</td>
<td>Technical bottlenecks when large amount of data is transferred.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service presentation on application of the citizen(easy to take consent)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion
This research has focused on the benefits and problems of the integrations, interagency information-sharing and E-Government concepts in the area of the social assistance and social services. Interagency information-sharing opportunities in these areas are quite wide and each of these areas deserves to be investigated deeply. Child care, violence against women, social aids and others can be evaluated from the perspective of collaboration with other related government organization and local authorities. Particularly, child care section of the social policies is not at a satisfying level about collaboration and interagency information-sharing. This research has just concluded the insufficiency; What can be done in the child care area about collaborative case management and information sharing? Could be quite a good research subject candidate. Similarly, use of the mobile devices and technologies supporting the instant information sharing in the area of the social assistance and social services could also be as a complementary of this research besides Çinar (2012) and Kunkell & Yowell (2001) researches. Moreover, technical aspects and technological innovations are also convenient for further research. Because, amount of the data being exchanged between the organizations via batch queries is sometimes quite large and processes encounter with technical borders. Information security and the judicial aspect of sharing sensitive information are also possible further research subjects.

References
Karataş, Z. (2015). Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri, Manevi Temelli Sosyal Hizmet Araştırmaları Dergisi Vol. 1, No 1, p 62-80. Retrieved From: https://www.academia.edu/33009261/Sosyal_Hizmet_E_Dergi_SOSYAL_B%C4%B0L%C4%80MLERDE_N%C4%80TEL_ARA%C5%ABIRMAY%C3%96NTELME%C4%B0.

EVALUATING THE INFORMATION LITERACY TEACHING USING CLASS ACTION RESEARCH APPROACH: A CASE STUDY AT THE DEPARTMENT OF ISLAMIC HISTORY UIN SUNAN KALIJAGA YOGYAKARTA, INDONESIA

Marwiyah*, Labibah, Nur Riani, & Thoriq Tri Prabowo
UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Jl. Marsda Adisucipto, Yogyakarta, Indonesia (55281),
*marwiyah.mlis@uin-suka.ac.id

ABSTRACT:
This research aims to find out how the course of Information Literacy enables the first-year students of the Department of Islamic Culture and History to acquire information literacy competence, and how it can help them be prepared for the on-line learning. This research is a class action research, in which the component of information literacy competence is used as material for class action involving 34 first-year students of the Department of Islamic Culture and History. Data collecting is done in 4 steps, they are: 1) planning, which is a step for developing a learning plan functioning as the research instrument; 2) acting, this is when the learning plan is implemented and the components of information literacy are taught; 3) observing, which is a step when we observe the teaching of information literacy in the class; 4) reflecting, which is to evaluate the learning of information literacy based on the results of assignments and observation. The research result shows that the teaching of information literacy in the class enables the students of the Department of Islamic Culture and History to improve their competence on information literacy, although some other aspects such as information source evaluation, particularly concerning information source from the webs and the use of information need more attention.

Key words: Information literacy, higher education, class action research

1. INTRODUCTION

The purpose of higher education as stated in the Indonesian Higher Education Constitution No 12, 2012 article 5 is to develop the potential of students to become faithful believers of God, people with great characters, healthy, capable, creative, independent, skilled, competent, and cultured for the benefit of the nation (Republic of Indonesia, 2012). In addition, the purpose of higher education is to create graduates who master branches of science and/or technology to fulfil the nation’s interest and raise the nation’s competitive value. Therefore, higher education becomes a means to prepare for the future. Through attending university, students are expected to be able to improve and have a higher level of learning ability. The different learning process and method of secondary school compared to higher education will provide their own kind of challenge to students, especially new students. The ability to reflect on existing knowledge by connecting with new knowledge is one of the characteristics of learning in university (Lokse et al., 2017, p. 3). The inability to elaborate on these two types of knowledge can prevent students from efficiently participating in the learning process within university, especially in producing scientific papers related to lecture assignments. According to (Dochartaigh, 2007, p. 1), the 2004 survey shows the fact that 42% of professors in the US agree that the quality of students’ assignments has decreased because of the internet. This means that students have yet to gain the ability to choose the correct source of information from the internet and use them effectively. Moreover, there are currently various types of information on the web and have been the mainstay of students during the pandemic. According to data from the APJII, there has been an increase in internet usage during the COVID pandemic and the majority of its usage is to access educational content as a result of online learning during the pandemic (voi.id, 2020). Therefore, students need to be equipped with the ability to search for information appropriately, choose relevant and reliable information and sources of information as well as use information ethically and responsibly as these are important elements of information literacy.
On the other hand, Owusu-Ansah said that education in universities is designed not only for students to acquire knowledge but also to ensure that students learn the process of generating new knowledge and accept various ways and means for lifelong learning (Lokse et al., 2017, p. 3.). Therefore, students must be equipped with the ability for lifelong learning through information literacy. Information literacy creates individual awareness concerning effective information search in all aspects of life such as personal life, politics, and business (Derakhshan et al., 2017, p. 571). Information literacy is a basic and vital element of general education requirements (Freeman & Lynd-Balta, 2010, p. 109). Therefore, information literacy is very commonly applied in teaching and learning activities in universities, especially for new students who have not yet gained basic knowledge in using libraries and the information sources they have as well as skills in searching for information, especially online information sources. Even according to Wakimoto in Huang et.al. (2016, p. 287) without having and using information literacy skills appropriately, a person cannot achieve educational and professional goals/targets. Huang further stated that with the increasing awareness and importance of information literacy, information literacy is widely included in the curriculum structure at both undergraduate and postgraduate levels in universities in the world. In some countries, this program was implemented successfully. For example, the University of Washington provides course-embedded information literacy instructions including course material guidelines and collaborative assignments. Further examples can be seen at the University of North Carolina Chapel Hill which provides literacy information class to introduce learning tools for information literacy (Huang et al., 2016).

In the state Islamic University Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta (UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta), information literacy is a compulsory subject for the Library Science program which studies the different aspects that relates to information access. However, since 2016 information literacy has been included as a compulsory subject for the History of Islamic Culture program. This subject is given in the second semester with the expectations that it will equip students with literacy skills that will support their studies in university as well as help them become independent lifelong learners. The History of Islamic Culture program is the only program that has included information literacy in its curriculum. The History of Islamic Culture students also have distinctive characters, namely the diversity of students who come from various regions (villages, cities, and big cities), and from various types of schools (Highschool, Vocational School, Islamic School, Islamic Boarding School). Based on this background, evaluation is necessary to find out the extent to which this course can assist students in preparing themselves to take part in the learning process.

2. THEORIES

2.1. Information Literacy

In a traditional sense, literacy refers to the ability to read or to understand a certain word (Thompson & Henley, 2000, p. 1). In its development, literacy not only refers to the ability to read but to also write or convey an idea as a result of the ability to understand the meaning of words or even information. If the meaning of literacy is related to information literacy, then it can simply mean the ability to understand information. Certainly, the meaning of literacy is not as simple as this because before we can understand information then there must be information first. Therefore, the more detailed meaning of information literacy covers the ability to access information, evaluate and use information from different sources (American Library Association, 2000, p. 2). Information literacy is related to the ability to show awareness on how to collect, use, manage, synthesize dan create information and data ethically, and also have the informational skill to do it effectively (SCONUL Working Group on Information Literacy, 2011, p. 13).
2.2. The Importance of Information Literacy in Learning

Information holds an important role in people’s lives. Even at the beginning of the 20th century, the information age emerged where information became the key in business development (Perdew, 2017) to the point where information became a valuable asset in the business world which then has an impact on the use of information technology. Currently, the dissemination of information through the web allows everyone including students to access information easily. And to know how to find, understand, manage, and use information is covered in the scope of skills of information literacy, which will lead students to success in the academic field and the professional field. The importance of information literacy is also stated by UNESCO as followed:

> Information literacy enables people to interpret and make informed judgments as users of information sources, as well as to become producers of information in their own right. Information literate people are able to access information about their health, their environment, their education, and work, empowering them to make critical decisions about their lives, e.g. in taking more responsibility for their own health and education (UNESCO, 2017).

Information literacy skills will increase the chances of independent learning where students are expected to be able to use different sources of information to extend their knowledge, convey questions, and sharpen their critical thinking (American Library Association, 2000, p. 2). Therefore, teaching information literacy is important. In some developed countries, they even develop regulations that encourage the promotion of information literacy, either in the form of formal regulations or policies or in the form of developing information literacy standards or guidelines to support their national education goals (Thompson & Henley, 2000). Information literacy is also integrated into the curriculum through coordination with libraries (Freeman & Lynd-Balta, 2010) therefore students will have the skill in collecting and critically analyzing to ascertain the depth of content used to support learning.

2.3. Information Literacy Competency Standards

Information literacy builds the foundations of lifelong learning that apply to all disciplines of science, all learning environments, and all levels of education that enable people to learn independently (Sales & Pinto, 2016, p. 69). Therefore, to be competent in information literacy is important to support learning. Thus, several standards of information literacy skills were developed by several institutions. In the year 2000, the American Library Association through the division of the Association of College and Research Libraries (ACRL) published a standard competency in information literacy for higher education. In the standard it is stated that an individual who is information literate is an individual that is able to:

1) Determine the required information needed
2) Effectively and efficiently access the information needed
3) Evaluate the information and the sources of information critically
4) Combine selected information with pre-existing basic knowledge
5) Use information effectively to accomplish a specific goal
6) Understand the economic, legal, and social issues surrounding the use of information, and access and use information ethically and legally (American Library Association, 2000).

Then the SCONUL Working Group on information literacy also issued the Seven Pillar of Information Literacy Core Model standard which includes skills for:

1) Able to identify a personal need for information (Identify)
2) Can assess current knowledge and identify gaps (scope)
3) Can construct strategies for locating information and data (plan)
4) Can locate and access the information and data they need (gather)

89

WBIMLC 2021
The research on information literacy focuses on 3 main skills, namely: being able to identify information needs which are then expressed in terms of search, the ability to search and find information effectively and efficiently, and use the information found ethically and responsibly.

3. METHODS

This research aims to assess the level of literacy skills and efforts to see changes in students' information literacy skills during the learning process. And because this research will conduct trials in the learning process, the research here uses class action research. Classroom action research is practical research that aims to improve learning practices in the classroom by taking several actions (Purrohman, 2011). (Sudaryono, 2009, p. 65) adds that class action research is research that is conducted in a class to know the effect of an action that is applied to a research subject in that class. This research refers three important components, namely (Arikunto et al., 2021).

1) This research refers to an activity of observing an object by using certain methodological rules to obtain useful data or information. In this study, it is related to the act of researching students in improving their literacy skills.
2) Action refers to an activity that is intentionally carried out with a specific purpose. Actions in this study emphasize activities to improve literacy skills by using information literacy standards.
3) Class which means classroom in a more specific sense. In this study, the class is limited to one information literacy course class.

The subjects of this research are 34 students of the History of Islamic Culture program (SKI) class of 2020. Whereas the role of the researcher is also as the facilitator because according to MacDonald (2012, p. 39), participatory research allows researchers to act as participants, facilitators, and learners during the research process.

Table 1: History of Islamic Culture Students' Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Sub-Category</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Area</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Town</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>City</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Former School</td>
<td>Highschool &amp; Vocational School</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Islamic School</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Islamic Boarding School</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.1. Data Collection Procedures

The research procedure used in this research is Kemmis & Taggart's theoretical model which includes four components, namely:
a. Planning
In this stage, the researcher prepares several things that are needed in carrying out the action research class, namely the lesson plan for the Information Literacy course which contains learning...
objectives, learning outcomes, lecture materials, learning methods, task descriptions, and assessment indicators as well as the weight of the assessment for each task. The course material uses a combination of AASL and ACRL standards that focus on information literacy skills, namely the ability to find information, evaluate the information found and use information ethically and responsibly. The three standards are then elaborated into several more specific materials as contained in the lesson plan. The lesson plan is then used as an instrument in this action research. Lecture materials, teaching methods, and forms of learning can be seen in the table below:

Whereas the task descriptions and assessment indicators that will be used as an instrument are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Task Description</th>
<th>Criteria-Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Overview Lesson Plans and Pre-test</td>
<td>1. Lecture material description and evaluation  2. Pre-test</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Searching for information on Google</td>
<td>Do an information search on Google</td>
<td>1. Accuracy of search terms  2. Accuracy of strategy use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Evaluate the information and use information ethically</td>
<td>Compile a short paper (4-5 pages) on specific topics</td>
<td>1. Writing citations  2. Use of referencing  3. Using valid sources of information</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b. Execution of actions (Acting)
This stage is the implementation of all the plans that have been made. In this research, during the lecture course of fourteen meetings, the action is carried out in five (5) sessions according to the information literacy material contained in the lesson plan (see table 2). However, before it is carried out, students are given a simple pre-test to determine the baseline of their literacy skills. The stages of implementation, are as follows:
1) Pre-test as a baseline to determine students' initial information literacy skills.
2) Teach both electronic and printed sources of information.
3) Introducing search strategies that are used in the informational retrieval facility, followed by an assignment to measure the ability to search by conducting searches in 3 types of information retrieval facilities, namely: Google, OPAC, and e-journal databases.

4) Introduction to citation styles and referencing using APA style. The assignment for this material is to write papers using valid and authoritative sources and use these sources ethically through citation and referencing.

c. Observation of actions (observing)

This activity is carried out simultaneously with action implementation. The data collected at this stage contains the action implementation based on the plans that have been made and their impact on the process and instructional results collected with the help of observation instruments. Observational data can be obtained or collected regularly from students as part of the daily administration of the school and normal processes in the classroom (Baumfield et al., 2011, p. 87). In this research, observations were made according to the type of assignment given to students. For written and take-home assignments, observations were made by looking at the assignment results such as searching reports (OPAC and Google) and preparing short papers. As for the search task, the researcher observed students who practiced searching in electronic journal databases to assess students' searching abilities.

d. Reflection of actions (Reflecting)

In this research, reflection on actions was carried out by using student assignments results and observations to then see changes in student literacy abilities that occurred during the learning process and to find problems faced by students in the process of improving their information literacy skills. From this, it is hoped to identify the gaps that occur, parts that have not been mastered by students, and the learning strategies that may have to be maintained, and ones that must be modified.

Data analysis in classroom action research is the same as data analysis for field research. However, the analysis process is carried out from the start using available data such as observations. According to Daryono (2014, 214-220), the analytical steps carried out in the study are as follows: data editing, data coding (descriptive code), categorization, and data reduction. This process is then carried out from the observation of the first task to the last task.

4. RESULTS

4.1. Baseline/Pre-test

1) Internet Usage

In this stage, the researcher emphasizes two aspects namely internet accessibility and internet usage intention by students. According to the result of the pretest, a majority of the students (97%) have devices to access internet through cellphones, laptops, or personal computers, and only one person does not have access to the internet, therefore, having to use public facilities to access it. Meanwhile, internet usage also varies, but most students use the internet for entertainment purposes such as games, YouTube, and chatting (41% (14), and 38% for using the internet for communication via email. Whereas, only 9% of students use the internet to search for information. While the remaining 12% accesses the internet for different purposes. This shows that the History of Islamic Culture students is already familiar with accessing the internet, however, only a small percentage of students use the internet to find information and this is an important focus in evaluating the ability to search for information on the internet.
2) Sources of Information and Use of Retrieval Tools to Find Information
Three things are emphasized in this aspect, namely the use of OPAC to search for book titles, search engines, which in this case is Google, to search for general information (books, scientific articles from various sources and domains, and general information) and scientific articles through e-journal databases. In general, students (73%) understand that information sources are used to support scientific writing and scientific journals. However, students still use Google to find various kinds of information, both general information, and to find book titles in the library. Only 44% use OPAC. Essentially, students understand that to find the latest information they have to use information sources from the internet. A majority of the students (77%) also understand that using scientific information sources has to be supported by a clear reference source.

3) Use of Search Terms and Search Strategies
One failure in finding books on OPAC is the use of inaccurate keywords. The result of the pre-test shows that only 23% of students understand the importance of using search terms in searching. A majority of students still use natural language in finding information (85%) and only 14% use accurate phrases as search terms.
For search strategies, the researcher focuses on the strategies that are usually provided in the retrieval tools, namely exact phrases, Boolean AND, OR and NOT, and truncation. For phrase searches, 32% of students have used the exact phrase strategy with quotation marks (“…”). For the Boolean operator, 53% of students understand the use of AND well but only 23% of students understand the use of OR and NOT. As for the use of truncation, no students are familiar with this facility. This shows the need to teach searching strategies.

4) Use of Information
Ethically using the information found is the last basic competency in information literacy. Three things that the researcher uses as competency standards in this study are citing, referencing, and the use of authoritative sources. The result of the pre-test shows that 65% of students know how to quote direct statements from writers, namely by using quotation marks on the direct statement. As many as 73% of students also understand the reasons for using citations when using works or ideas from others. However, students still do not understand bibliographic writing, especially writing article titles and journal titles. Only 59% of students understand how to reference correctly.

4.2. Implementation of Actions and Observations
Based on the results of the pre-test, the researcher then provided information literacy material and continued by providing training to students through independent assignments. The result of the pre-test shows that their searching abilities are still unsatisfactory, with a score below 50% except for the Boolean strategy. Therefore, materials and assignments for searching cover 3 retrieval tools, namely Google, OPAC, and database e-journals. From the result of the assignments, the researcher can then see the development that the students experience after attending this lecture.

1) Searching in Google
The next assessment of literacy skills is the ability to find and evaluate information by using various information retrieval tools. In this section, we will start with Googling skills as a means of information retrieval (retrieval tools), the search engine that is most widely used by the public. From baseline findings, many students use Google to search for information, some even use Google to search for various information such as books and articles. This shows that students do not know a lot about Google, both its search facilities and how to use them. Therefore, in the early stages of lectures, students are introduced to the types of searches (simple and advanced searches) and various facilities owned by Google by showing the Google search help menu. The next step is to give assignments to students to search for information on Google with the following assessment criteria:
a) The ability to use the appropriate keywords
b) The ability to use the right strategy
c) Evaluating search results

Next, students are given the task to search for information (about the chosen topic) through Google. And the results of the searching task via Google can be seen in the table below:

Table 2: Google Search Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Search Term</th>
<th>Type of search term</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Broad terms</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Phrase</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Factual search</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synonym</td>
<td>Relevant</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not relevant</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategy</td>
<td>Truncation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Accurate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inaccurate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exact Phrase</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Accurate</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inaccurate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Boolean</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Accurate</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inaccurate</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advanced search</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Without strategy</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a) Use of search terms
Searching on Google, many students (71%) still separate search terms and then set single words as search terms such as: History, Occurrence, War, World. In the search process, the search term will be combined with the Boolean operator AND (History of AND occurrence of AND world AND wars). The search is ineffective because a search term in the form of natural language will automatically be processed by Google with Boolean AND. Furthermore, in searching for information through Google, the researcher found that several students used synonyms as alternative search terms. However, 35% of students use synonyms incorrectly, namely synonyms that are less relevant which in turn generates a lot of irrelevant search results. Even so, 23% of students used the search term correctly by using phrases, such as "Child development" and "early childhood." By looking at the comparison between students who use the correct search terms and the incorrect ones, it appears that the students' ability to search for information on Google is not optimal.

b) Searching Strategies
Searching on Google can be done through simple and advanced searches. The simple search menu also allows using various search strategies such as Boolean operators, phrase search, and some limitations (year of publication, document format, domain, etc.). According to the table above, only 6% of students use advanced search whereas 94% of students use the simple search menu.
Students who used simple search also haven’t optimally used the available facilities, in fact 27% of students don’t use any strategies at all. This means students searched by only using natural language such as the practice of press freedom in Indonesia. Meanwhile, the strategies that are generally used are only phrase searches (15%) and Boolean operators (48%) which are not all done properly. For example, in the Boolean operator, students use OR to connect unequal search terms. Generally, the Boolean OR is used to search for search terms that contain synonyms or quasi-synonyms. Furthermore, students also use the strategy AND to combine single search terms such as History AND Civilization AND Dynasty AND Utsmaniyah.

For the use of phrases, only 15% of students used phrase searches. This possibly happened because students mostly use single search terms which are broad terms that are then combined using Boolean AND. From those 5 students, only 9% of students used it correctly, for example, "child development" and "early childhood." Meanwhile, 6% of students still use it incorrectly, for example by putting quotation marks on search terms such as “politics”.

2) Searching on OPAC

Next, the students practiced searching for information through OPAC. In this search practice on OPAC, there has been a general increase in the students’ search skills both in the use of search terms and in the strategies used, as can be seen in the table below. The use of the strategy is of course adapted to the facilities owned by OPAC.

Table 3: Searching on OPAC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Search Term</th>
<th>Type of search term</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Synonym</td>
<td>Relevant</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>irrelevant</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural language</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Truncation</td>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incorrect</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exact Phrase</td>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incorrect</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boolean</td>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incorrect</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Select Field</td>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incorrect</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Without strategy</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a) Use of search terms

Searching on OPAC, students are starting to use accurate search terms, namely by using phrases for specific searches. As much as 50% of students use phrases as search terms such as "Islamic civilization" and "Indonesia." Only 29% of students still use broad terms as a search term such as typography, psychology, and reforestation. Broad terms are generally used to produce a lot of
results. Therefore, it is incorrect to use it in specific searches. Furthermore, 15% of students use natural language as a search term, however, the search terms used are more specific than before, for example, the history of Islam in Indonesia (still including the stop word in). Fewer students also do not force synonyms in search terms. Only 2 students or 6% of students still use inaccurate synonyms. Whereas, 26% of students do not use any strategies and these are students who use broad terms in their searches.

b) Searching Strategies
The students’ ability in using the correct search strategy has also experienced an increase shown by the specific searches they made according to the available facilities. The search using phrases has been done by 50% of students by using quotation marks (“…”). As much as 29% of students also use Boolean operators correctly in the advanced search menu, for example: biograph AND (Sultan Muhammad al-Fatih). Some students even do more specific searches by using the limit facility. To limit search results, 29% of students also use search terms with a certain category like writer, subject, and title. In addition, students limit the search for information based on certain types of collections, for example, books, monographs. This shows an increase in the students’ searching ability.

3) Searching in the Database
Searching in an e-journal database is the last material for information searching. In this search, a lot of students use the JSTOR database because this database provides the most articles and book parts about history and the like. Students did better in searching for information in this e-journal database compared to their searches in Google and OPAC, both in determining search words and using search strategies. Students even do a lot of refine searches when they have not found the appropriate results as shown in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Search Terms</th>
<th>Type of search terms</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Broad terms</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Phrase</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Natural language</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Basic Search</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Boolean</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exact Phrase</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Truncation</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>34</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Refine search</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Limit</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New search</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>34</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advanced Search</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Truncation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exact Phrase</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Boolean</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Specific field</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(authors, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Limit/narrow result</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>97%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
a) Use of search terms
In this JSTOR search, only a few students (18%) used broad terms such as: arts, education, terrorism. Usually, students start their search with broad terms but continue to narrow the search, for example limiting it to certain disciplines such as arts and music so that the search results obtained are more specific. Meanwhile, a majority of the students (70%) have done their search using a more standard search term, using phrases such as: 'History of Islamic civilization', 'history of Islam in Europe' (history of Islam, Europe), and 'History of the Umayyads'. The use of natural language has also been reduced to only 12%. One example of natural language use is the history of the development of Islam in America in a simple search. When using natural language, students will evaluate the search results, and almost all students will do a refine search to limit the search results so that the results obtained are more specific.

b) Searching Strategies

Simple search
This search strategy facility is available in 2 search menus, namely basic search, and advanced search menus. Essentially, almost all students use search strategies in both simple and advanced searches. In a simple search, there are 3 search models carried out by students, namely:

1) Search using more than one strategy, namely Boolean and phrase. Students use more than one search term concept, both single words and phrases which are then combined with Boolean AND, for example: 'Islamic history AND Europe'.

2) Students break phrases into several search words which are then combined with Boolean AND, for example, 'the history AND development of AND Islam AND America'.

3) Students that don't use any strategy use broad terms which are common search words (15%). However, they then do a refine search by limiting certain fields such as access type, year of publication, type of work, language, and disciplines.

Refine search is carried out by all students, both those who use the searching strategy and those who do not.

Advanced Search
In this search, students use the Boolean AND operator to combine search words in different search fields. There were even some who chose certain search fields, namely keywords (18%). In addition, students also used the limit search facility, namely: type of access (only access I have), type of publication (a majority chose books and journals), year of publication, and document language. There were also 3 students who limited their searches to certain disciplines or subjects as well, for example, the discipline "history of music" because they happen to be looking for the history of music in the Middle East.

From the data above, it shows that students can perform specific searches using the available search facilities.

4) Scientific Writing: Citing and Referencing
Writing short scientific papers is one indicator to see the students' ability to ethically use the information found based on three important aspects, namely: accuracy in citing sources used to support their writings following citation standards, accuracy in writing references following the standard, and the use of valid or authoritative sources of information. APA style is the citation and reference standard used in this assignment. The general result of the assignment can be seen in the table below.
Table 5: Citation & Referencing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>According to standard</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Referencing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>According to standard</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>valid</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invalid</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For the first aspect, specifically citation, 65% of students did the citation correctly. Some students are even able to use automatic citations from Microsoft Word. However, some students have not written citations and paraphrasing properly, specifically by not including the sources used to support their writings. For reference writing, half of the students have written correctly, especially those using the automatic citation system. Writing references manually has the potential to cause errors in writing. There are three types of errors in writing references, namely:

a) Writing journal articles as sources of information. Some students write the title of the article in italics, even though it should be the title of the journal.

b) Writing from sources taken from the web and not including the time of access to the web.

c) The list of titles is not sorted alphabetically

The last aspect is the selection of information sources used to support the student’s works. Most students use information sources from books and scientific journal articles. Therefore, the usage level of authoritative information sources is as high as 82%. Sources of information that are not authoritative are sources taken from websites that do not meet standards, for example, websites that have no author name (anonymous) in their articles and websites that are unscientific or even biased.

DISCUSSION

This section is a reflection of the observation result which is the last step in this class action research. According to the pre-test, students are familiar with accessing the internet, however, only a small percent (23%) use it to search for information. As a result, this affects the students’ abilities to search for information on the internet. From the pre-test done at the start of the class in which students have not attended the action class, it shows that the History of Islamic Culture students is not information literate enough, both in understanding sources of information and in using information retrieval as tools to find accurate information such as using OPAC to find book titles. Google is a place to find all kinds of information, both general and academic information. The introduction of information sources and sources of information in the action class has a fairly good impact, as shown from the post-test results in table 6.
Table 6: Comparison of Pre-test and Post-test Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Information sources and retrieval tools</td>
<td>Source of scientific information</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>OPAC</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Google</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Search Term</td>
<td>Importance of Search term</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Use of phrases</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Search Strategy</td>
<td>Boolean AND</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Boolean NOT</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Boolean AND, OR, NOT</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Phrase (&quot;…&quot;)</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Truncation</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Use of information</td>
<td>Direct quote</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Citation</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Referencing</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Likewise, in comparison to the pre-test and post-test results when searching for information, there was a very significant increase. However, this result was achieved through the class action process in quite a large portion, namely by searching on Google, OPAC, and e-journal databases. Searching on Google becomes the most difficult search for students even though many people rely on Google as a source of information. However, searching for scientific papers requires the right strategy and search terms. Observation results show that students use Google like they are looking for general information and are quite satisfied with the many and mostly irrelevant search results. This becomes an important note for the researcher to put more emphasis on Google searches, considering that Google is the most widely used tool for students and the general public in searching for various types of information. However, students have already experienced a significant increase in searching on OPAC and database e-journal. The insufficient searching exercises and materials that were given on Google becomes the basis to provide a larger portion of searching exercises on Google and OPAC. This in turn gives better results. The only searching strategy that needs to be improved is truncation because students still don't understand this operation well. However, this strategy is not always needed in the search. Another aspect that needs to be emphasized is the citation and referencing skills. In terms of technical citation skills, some students are excellent at using Microsoft, thus the error or inaccuracy rate of their citations was very small. While some students who still use the manual method often do not follow the standard and still need more practice. More importantly, there are still students who have not paraphrased theories from other works, increasing the potential for plagiarism. This also highlights the need for more paraphrasing and citation exercises. A similar pattern also occurred with referencing, especially for students who still use manual methods for their citations.
The evaluation aspect in this study includes two things, namely evaluating search results and evaluating the information sources used to support the student’s writing. Evaluation of in-depth search results was not done by many students. Usually, students will see too many results, indicating that their search has not been successful. Thus, refining is necessary even though some students have evaluated the search results in the e-journal database. Searches in OPAC and e-journal databases did not have a significant impact on the inaccuracy of search results. However, searching on Google requires higher evaluation capabilities, to evaluate the reliability and authoritativeness of the website used. This can be seen in the result of the last assignment, where 3 students used unreliable sources because they did not evaluate their information source for their short papers.

CONCLUSION
Information literacy skills are very important in supporting learning activities and therefore need to be taught to new students. This study shows that teaching information literacy impacts the students’ information literacy skills. Although there are still aspects that need to be improved, specifically in evaluating information sources, especially information sources from websites. Likewise, it is also necessary to strengthen the aspect of using information to avoid the issue of plagiarism.

LITERATURE

100

WBIMLC 2021


Abstract
The youth of today are exposed to various new media channels especially those who are privileged and have access to digital tools and technologies. Young individuals' access to social networking sites is an avenue to be informed, use their voices, and empower themselves in virtual environments. Youth civic engagement including political participation transcends online and continues to be present during the pandemic particularly with the use of social media platforms as they share their thoughts and influence other people. Every youth use their citizen rights to exercise freedom of speech in support of democracy. This survey research intended to provide an overview of how select undergraduate library and information science students from three library schools in the Philippines behave and engage online given that misleading political information and fake news continue to proliferate as part of their daily lives.

Keywords: civic engagement, youth participation, fake news, false information, misinformation

1. INTRODUCTION
Social media has emotionally and socially influenced our daily lives. It also took a toll on our physical, spiritual, and intellectual well-being as people tend to be overwhelmed with an abundance of information. The youth of today are very much exposed to information overload. They represent an adept group of individuals who are not novice in using various technological tools and apps. In the United States alone, young adults aged 18-29 use social media at high levels with 84% said they use at least one social media site (Pew Research Center, 2021). In the Philippines, 86.8% Filipinos 10-30 years old who were enrolled in school in 2019 surfed the internet through social media (Philippine Statistics Authority, 2020). As information increases rapidly in social media, they become vulnerable evaluators as to what differentiates opinion, advertising, and news content. We also acknowledge that social media acts as a potential information source, though it is mixed with unverified content. Nevertheless, with the democratization of information across all platforms, youth's voice is empowered and can stir up societal changes. The role of youth in social media civic engagement including political participation or with the pandemic response, to cite some current phenomena, influences both their peers and the community at large. Every youth uses their citizen rights to exercise freedom of speech in support of peaceful progressive government and democratic society. We should also consider the immediate roles of library practitioners and Library and Information Science (LIS) educators as information experts are strengthened to advance critical information literacy. New skills and competencies are needed to shape the understanding of the youth especially those who are aspiring librarians and those who have a desire in protecting accurate and authentic information.
2. OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY
Given that social media has strikingly been part of citizen’s regular lives, whether they personally use them or not, it will continue to evolve in sharing content and information and will affect people’s perceptions and opinions in varying levels. The rising use of digital platforms and services becomes an unavoidable circumstance as these tools appeal to the taste of the young and they target them as significant users. Given these scenarios, how does digital civic engagement work for the youth? How does youth respond and react to the overwhelming social issues that confront them? This survey research intends to provide an overview of how select undergraduate library and information science students from three library schools in the Philippines behave and interact online given that misleading information and fake news continue to proliferate as part of their daily lives. The focus will be on their experiences in online political participation and their behavior when engaging in social media. Their social media participation was observed in the context of misinformation shared during the pandemic. Specifically, the paper will provide details on the following:

A. Frequency on Facebook usage
B. Primary reasons for using Facebook
C. Advantages and disadvantages of using Facebook
D. Other social media sites being used by youth
E. Forms of engagement

3. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE
The goal of every democratic society is to have an informed and active civic society. Thomas Jefferson once mentioned that common people, not aristocrats, should influence a democratic, open, and inclusive government (Mandarano, Meenar, & Steins, 2010). There is a sense of community involvement if we know what is happening on the ground especially with local politics. Political information from news sources is one of the common reasons why adults use social media sites. As Rowe (2015) and Ruth (2018) mentioned, two thirds of this group access and seek news through social networking platforms. The activities that can be done in social media include information processing (eg. news surveillance), entertainment activities (eg. watching motivational shows), and social connection (eg. social surveillance) (Heinonen, 2011). But how does youth digitally engage and use their own platforms to participate in the virtual environment? Just like adults, the youth use and access social media for various reasons on a regular basis (Rose-Wiles, 2018). As they are exposed more often, they can build their own public opinion on social matters but need to skillfully practice critical thinking and evaluate all information received and communicated.

3.1 Civic Engagement and Participation
Young people may invest or neglect their civic duties if they don’t see and feel the need to participate. Although, social media may bridge the gap and be a catalyst for political engagement (UNICEF, 2020). Civic engagement is defined as the individual or collective actions in which people participate to improve the well-being of communities or society in general while digital civic engagement refers to civic engagement activities specifically done by young people and involving digital media of some kind (UNICEF, 2020, p. 6). Both these concepts are tied up to becoming a digital citizen. If these citizens can participate online and be able to utilize technology to express their civic duty to address, process, understand and disseminate political information, they adhere to the qualities of digital citizenship. Moreover, another kind of literacy needs to be developed. One way to enact digital citizenship is to practice digital literacy. Digital literacy consists of knowledge, skills and attitudes that allow citizens to
flourish and thrive in an increasingly global digital world, being both safe and empowered, in ways that are appropriate to any age and local cultures and contexts (UNICEF, 2020, p. 7). Digital literacy involves various skills such as formal operational skills, information retrieval and analytical skills, digital communication skills, and creation skills (Moon & Bai, 2020). Communication skills will be emphasized in this paper as one core skill of digital literacy. These digital natives expand their social media network by gaining friends and followers if they meet new people online or offline. Online public discussions on social issues available in social media are hard to miss. We shall see how much interest is given in the context of socializing online.

To strengthen civic participation and engagement, social media increases collaboration among stakeholders (Roengtam, 2021). Social media's role is to engage the public with the affairs of the government. It finds a way to communicate to its citizens by informing them about current events and to facilitate interaction. Any citizen may inquire, criticize, or freely express opinions without prejudice to what they say. If the government will consider all suggestions and comments, including hateful ones, people will not be afraid to participate in social issues circulating online. This is the essence of a democratic society. As Roengtam added, social media may resolve social problems and promote positive change.

Being exposed and involved in civic engagement activities will allow the youth to explore the standards of the society and help them build a network outside of their comfort zones. To become valuable contributors to society, they should go out to the real world (Bird, Bowling, & Ball, 2020).

There are also different forms of social media engagement as described by Waterloos, Walrave, & Ponnet (2021). Latent forms of engagement refer to different behaviors that could be considered as cognitive engagement through information-seeking and consumption. They are considered ‘pre-political’ actions that are often not directly or visibly aimed at influencing others, but they nonetheless signify a form of involvement in political and social issues. Follower Engagement reveals how a person collaborates or interacts online by merely showing interest in a post by sharing, commenting, inviting, re-posting, or commenting without forcing others to be part of it. Expressive Engagement is a behavior wherein information shared may provoke or incite an action or course and entice others to do the same.

3.2 The Philippine Scenario
In a study by Bringula et al. (2021), social media are used to keep Filipino students updated on national political issues. They are active users of Facebook. Being aware of national issues are important thus they dedicate some of their time to be aware of these issues. They also practice neutrality in social media when they are faced with political information.

Trust is also a big issue in social media. Building online trust makes us believe in what others are sharing and posting. The level of online friendship defines how much the youth will share or comment associated with political posts.

Being caught by fake news is another issue in the country. In a recent study conducted by Boses, Opinyon, Siyasat, at Siyensya para sa Pilipinas (Boses Pilipinas), young supporters of the current administration who rely on Facebook for news believe in fake news. To gauge their knowledge, a 10-item fake news quiz was administered and 52.5% of youth respondents only got six to eight correct answers (Mendoza, 2021).
4. METHODOLOGY
This research determines how select undergraduate library and information science students from three library schools in the Philippines behave and interact online given that misleading information and fake news continue to proliferate as part of their daily lives. As the title of the paper suggests, this survey research intends to capture representative samples and describe their behaviors, attitudes, and experiences in their social media civic engagement.

The questionnaire designed for this survey research was adapted from the Social Media Political Participation Scale authored by Waterloos, Walrave, & Ponnet (2021) which underwent a rigorous validity process using exploratory factor analysis (EFA) and confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). An exploratory factor analysis was conducted to specify the main factors of our instrument. Convergent validity is described as the evidence of similarity between the constructs measured by the developed instrument. The scale could be especially useful if combined with observed behavioral data, to further establish the validity of the instrument as well as increase our understanding of political behavior through social media.

The focus will be on their experiences in online political participation and their behavior when engaging in social media. Their social media participation was observed in the context of misinformation shared during the pandemic.

Three groups of Bachelor of Library and Information Science (BLIS) students from three universities participated in the study. Respondents came from all undergraduate levels from first year to fourth year students. Quota or convenience sampling was applied in this study and participation was purely voluntary. We considered the effects of virtual learning to the youth and online surveys may be an inconvenience.

A 5-point Likert scale measuring frequency containing the options always, very often, sometimes, rarely, and never were used.

An online survey questionnaire was used as the tool for data gathering and was distributed to the students for them to answer in a specified time with options to answer it in their free time. The results of the survey were tabulated, getting the mean and standard deviation. A total of 55 students (32%) accomplished the survey from a possible population of 171.

5. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1 Frequency on Facebook usage of the respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do you use Facebook?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 indicates that all 55 respondents are using Facebook. Facebook is the second widely used social media platform gaining 96.8% internet users in the Philippines after YouTube with 97.2% (Statista, 2021).
Table 2 Primary reasons for using Facebook

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons for using Facebook</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contact and communicate with family and friends</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>93.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interact with a larger network of people</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In order not to be left out with the new trends and topics</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>29.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To be updated with all sorts of news</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>79.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To spread awareness and give my opinion</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>31.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To organize events</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>22.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To share posts of others</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>56.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 indicates the primary reasons for using Facebook. With multiple responses, the respondents’ top primary reason for using Facebook is to **contact and communicate with family and friends** with 41 responses (93.2%). Their next reason is to **be updated with all sorts of news** with 35 responses (79.5%), and the third is to **share posts of others** with 25 responses (56.8%).

Table 3 Personal advantages of using Facebook

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Advantages of Using Facebook</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staying connected with my network</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>84.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gather information from Facebook sources</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>65.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn new ideas and gain new skills</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>65.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>77.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>68.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share common interest</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>47.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 shows how the students perceived the advantages of using Facebook. Out of 55 respondents, 37 or 84.1% students identified *staying connected with my network* as the main personal advantage of using Facebook, second advantage of Facebook as determined by the respondents is *for entertainment* with 34 or 77.3%, some 30 or 68.2% of the students use Facebook for their *educational needs*, 29 or 65.9% of students also use Facebook to gather information from its sources and to learn ideas and gain new skills. Meanwhile, 21 or 47.7% of students said that they use Facebook to *share common interests*. For the students, this is the lowest personal advantage of using Facebook. This significantly shows that respondents mostly use Facebook to stay connected with their networks and peers.

Table 4 describes how respondents view the disadvantages of using Facebook. *Fake news circulation* received the highest response with 40 or 90.9% of the respondents choosing it as the major disadvantage of using Facebook, followed by *cyberbullying and online bashing* with 37 or 84.1% responses. The 26 or 59.1% respondents believed that Facebook *causes depression and anxiety* and that it increases the *presence of scammers*. Furthermore, data *privacy issues* were chosen by the 25 or 56.8% respondents as a bad effect of Facebook and that 23 or 52.3% respondents say that the social media promotes *less physical interaction*. Distribution of *pornographic content* received 22 or 50% responses, *tarnishing the reputation of others* received
20 or 45.5% responses, identity theft and catfishing and the spread of clickbait received 18 or 40.9%. The increase of propaganda gained the lowest response rate with 15 or 34.1%. Nonetheless, all of them constitute disadvantages of using Facebook.

Table 5 Using other Social Media Sites

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Media Sites</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instagram</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>79.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twitter</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>40.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TikTok</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snapchat</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>38.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YouTube</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>88.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telegram</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discord</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tumblr</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If forums are considered as SNS</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Messenger for educational purpose</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 shows that most of the students aside from Facebook watch YouTube content with 39 responses or 88.6%. As explained in table 1, most users from the Philippines have access to this video-sharing platform. While 35 or 79.5% of the students used Instagram, 33 or 75% downloaded TikTok, 18 or 40.9% read Twitter posts, 17 or 38.6% enjoys Snapchat, 5 or 11.4% use both Telegram and Discord, 4 or 9.1% reads blog in Tumblr and the rest use other available social media sites. This data shows that the respondents are using different social media sites aside from Facebook for different purposes and it only conveys how the respondents are aware of the social media sites accessible in their country.

Table 6 Facebook Usage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One hour</td>
<td>21.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two to Three hours</td>
<td>27.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four to Five hours</td>
<td>10.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than Five hours</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6 manifests how long the respondents used Facebook regularly. It indicates that most of the respondents (40%) used Facebook for more than five hours daily. The data signifies that respondent are allocating almost a fifth of their time. It also means they have a stable internet connection or that they allot this specific amount of data connection to access Facebook.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I read posts linked to the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>3.236</td>
<td>1.185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I read news articles or other kinds of information (e.g. an opinion piece) linked to the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>3.181</td>
<td>0.944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I read comments linked to the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>3.254</td>
<td>0.966</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I watched videos linked to the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>2.981</td>
<td>0.971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I visited pages or profiles of politicians or public figures in the context of the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>2.781</td>
<td>1.012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 shows that mean scores suggest that BLIS students’ latent engagement or political information-seeking borders rarely to sometimes and their interest is low. Students’ way of political participation remains to be reading comments, posts, or news articles linked to Philippine national elections. It should be noted that this survey was sent nine months prior to the Philippine national elections that is soon to happen in May 2022. There was also no question related as to whether the student is eligible to vote although age was asked in the questionnaire.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I shared, spread a Facebook event or invited people for it in the context of the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>2.418</td>
<td>1.100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I indicated that I would attend or was interested in a Facebook event in the context of the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>2.563</td>
<td>1.166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I signed a petition on the upcoming Philippine national elections after I saw it on Facebook</td>
<td>2.054</td>
<td>1.078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I shared a petition on the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>2.218</td>
<td>1.100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The International Scientific Conference of Librarians  
Western Balkan Information and Media Literacy Conference 2021  
& 10th International Summit of Book

Table 8 indicates that mean scores suggest that BLIS students’ follower engagement is even lower than latent engagement and they do not find Philippine politics interesting. The average mean scores in this theme of follower engagement suggest that students rarely participate online when the topic of interest is about national politics.

Table 9 Expressive Engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I posted or shared something (status, meme, link, etc.) concerning the upcoming Philippine national elections in a closed Facebook group</td>
<td>2.345</td>
<td>1.235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I commented on something concerning the upcoming Philippine national elections in a closed Facebook group</td>
<td>2.145</td>
<td>1.177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I sent something relating to the upcoming Philippine national elections to someone in a private message on Facebook/Messenger</td>
<td>2.309</td>
<td>1.152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I trolled in the context of the upcoming Philippine national elections</td>
<td>1.909</td>
<td>1.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I posted, shared, commented on something (status, meme, link, etc.) concerning the upcoming Philippine national elections in a way it was publicly visible</td>
<td>1.981</td>
<td>1.062</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 proves that mean scores suggest that BLIS students’ expressive engagement is the lowest among other two engagements. They are less participatory in expressing opinions in social media. There are items that received almost never (ie. trolling or expressing their political views openly in social media).

6. CONCLUSION

Youth’s presence in social media may strengthen their digital civic engagement and may increase their digital citizenship in the advent of local political activities. Their exposure to social media may lead them to engage in the political process and develop critical consciousness as it is part of a socio-cultural phenomenon. Unfortunately, they have less interest and participation in Philippine politics.

The youth’s low interest in social and political issues as manifested in their online civic engagement may not be surprising if they see this as a personal attack, surveillance, or harassment when they try to engage (Mirra & Garcia, 2017) with friends or strangers. The students are informed and are receiving a modest amount of political information online but may not have the strong digital civic participation. They may either bypass these kinds of information as they believe fake news is rampant in social media. As presented in the results, 40% of the youth use
Facebook for more than five hours a day and that already provides an idea on how much engagement happens. The study revealed that LIS youth have higher latent engagement than follower engagement and they have the lowest expressive engagement.

To further strengthen the digital civic engagement of the youth, libraries should take initiatives and design political literacy skills training in collaboration with various stakeholders to prepare the youth and help them participate and engage effectively in democratic politics. They should also include critical information literacy as a library program to entice the interest of the youth in civic engagement whether online or offline.

Acknowledgement

The conference participation was subsidized by the Talent Support Council of ELTE Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest

References


Linguistics Training as a Part of Lifelong Learning for Law Professionals

Phd Amela Ćolić
Associate Professor
University of Bihać, Faculty of Law Bihać
caloamela@hotmail.com

PhD Nikola Findrik
Assistant Professor
University of Bihać, Faculty of Law Bihać
findrik_nikola@yahoo.com

Phd Ratko Knežević
University of Bihać
ratkok@hotmail.com

PhD Božana Tomić
Associate Professor
Slobomir P. University Doboj
tomicbozana@gmail.com

Abstract
Lifelong learning is not just a form of education but must become a guiding principle in the context of knowledge acquisition. The paper provided insight into the meaning of the concept of lifelong learning according to the Law on Adult’s Education, as a positive legal regulation in force in Una-Sana Canton, Bosnia and Herzegovina. Neighbouring countries have recognised the importance of specialisation and training of lawyers with the aim to train them in acquiring special competencies for the work of transposing the acquis communautaire into home legislation. The relationship between formal and non-formal education through the program of acquiring additional competencies in the law profession can be realised at a higher education institution which was prescribed as a possibility by the Development Strategy of the University of Bihać for the period 2017-2022. It prescribed the strategic task of Lifelong Learning as a competence to be realised not only by students but also by the academic staff. Additional training in linguistics for law professionals is necessary for the legal and linguistic editing of legislation, for the translation of legal texts at the European Court, court decisions and documents into the official languages being used in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Lawyers with excellent knowledge of foreign languages and translation skills have an advantage when looking for an employment in a number of positions within the legal profession in the country or in the EU institutions. The paper pointed out the need to respond to modern challenges of lifelong learning, the basics of European lifelong learning policy and the level of European trends being followed in BiH, especially in Una-Sana Canton, the University of Bihać and how lifelong learning policy was shaped. The European Council held in Lisbon in March 2000 was a turning point in the European Union’s lifelong learning policy. The conclusions reached at that session confirmed that the improvement of lifelong learning was necessary for a successful transition to a knowledge-based society.

Key words: lifelong learning, key competences, law professionals linguistics training, EU lifelong learning policy, acquis communautaire
1. INTRODUCTION

In recent years, in Bosnia and Herzegovina, there have been demographic changes, the departure of young and middle-aged people from B/H and the aging of the population. Access to education and lifelong learning emerges as a real necessary activity to improve skills and knowledge. Lifelong learning (LLL) is not just a form of education but it must become a guiding principle in the context of knowledge acquisition. Respecting all forms of learning, the focus of this paper is a form of lifelong learning in the form of specialist language training for law graduates who want to improve their skills needed to work in EU institutions with knowledge of English, French or German as well as European law. The same implies to the adoption of EU legal terminology, the study of European Union law and the translation of legal texts. The quality of work at the law faculties of the universities in B/H must be adapted to the needs of the state and offering opportunities to individuals as active users in the educational process. Certainly, in this way the interest in the professional vocation and the choice of a suitable job will increase. Man is the greatest wealth of the society in which is necessary to invest, therefore the development of the state/society depends on the quality of specialist training. LLL is to develop a society based on the principle of a "learning society". Continuing professional development implies that a lawyer should maintain and develop its professional knowledge and skills, taking into account the European dimension of that profession. Keeping up with professional development in law is a professional obligation. It is particularly important that lawyers are aware of the growing impact of European law on the field of practice.

2. LLL ACCORDING TO THE LAW ON ADULT EDUCATION OF THE UNA-SANA CANTON

LLL is an overall lifelong learning activity, with the aim of improving knowledge, skills and attitudes within a personal, and social perspective. It includes acquiring knowledge in all periods of life in the forms of formal and non-formal learning as a continuous process. The legislator defined formal education as learning directed by teachers in educational institutions according to a curriculum approved by the competent educational authorities leading to the acquisition of a qualification. In terms of the specific Law on Adult Education in Una-Sana Canton, the publicly valid educational program was adopted and approved by the Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports of Una-Sana Canton.

As key competencies needed by each individual, the legislator referred to the European Reference Framework and listed the following competencies: communication in the mother tongue, communication in a foreign language, competence in natural sciences and technology, digital competence, learning competence, social and civic competences and others. The term competence meant the use of acquired knowledge, skills, attitudes, values and abilities. Non-formal education is aimed at improving, specialising and supplementing competencies in the profession according to special programs, independent of formal education, without obtaining official diplomas and qualifications. Non-formal education can be realised by educational institutions, language learning centres, educational ones, citizens' associations, economic entities and other legal ones that have stated non-formal adult education as their activity.

Specialisation is education and training within the same occupation in order to acquire special competencies or parts of competencies necessary for certain jobs. Professional competencies in terms of the legal profession would be the ability to use knowledge, skills and attitudes to perform work tasks and duties. Training is a form of education after completing formal education that

---

should help a lawyer to perform activities more efficiently and effectively in accordance with the requirements of the profession and on the basis of special programs for acquiring additional competencies in the profession.

3. LLL AS A COMPETENCY FOR STUDENTS AND ACADEMIC STAFF
The concept of LLL is an important segment of higher education within the implementation of the Bologna Process. Informal organising can be realised by public institutions, schools, language centres, citizens’ associations, economic entities according to their own bylaws, with an appropriate work program, spatial, material and personnel conditions. In terms of the Law on Adult Education of Una-Sana Canton, the program of specialisation and training is subject to the obligation of program accreditation by the Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports of Una-Sana Canton.
The public state higher education institution, the University of Bihać, has ensured the availability of LLL in all study programs as a general competence that students achieve. It has been envisaged that the faculties, as scientific-teaching units within the University of Bihać, would develop the provision of LLL and training services to their graduates and the wider community in order to acquire additional competencies and additional qualifications for the labour market. However, the academic staff of the University should be more active in creating and participating in LLL programs. The LLL of the academic staff has been focused on didactic and andragogic training, but also professional training in the field of science in which it deals. Knowledge, skills and attitudes have been learnt, improved as general, systemic and professional competencies. B/H’s growing rapprochement with the European Union opens the need for a new profile of legal experts. Demanding legal affairs require the ability to collect information from various sources, analysis and synthesis of data for editing legal texts and legal terminology, the ability to work in teams, communication in an international environment, language skills in legal affairs to translate legal texts into official languages of international institutions and organisations, firstly English, and then French and German. Demanding legal jobs require competencies in the form of knowledge, skills and attitudes, as follows:

- **General competencies:**
  - Instrumental - the ability to collect information from different sources, the ability to analyse and synthesise data from different sources needed for quality translation of legal texts
  - Interpersonal - effective teamwork, ability to work in an international environment, developing communication skills
  - Systemic - application of acquired language knowledge in complex legal affairs

- **Professional competencies:** identify, update and apply knowledge of EU law and institutions, apply acquired knowledge and skills of a foreign language in solving problems of legal translation and editing of legal texts, apply acquired knowledge and skills in legal terminology in translating legal texts into official languages used in B/H.

4. LINGUISTICS TRAINING AND SPECIALISATION FOR LAW PROFESSIONALS
At the Faculties of Law in the countries of the region, the Department of Foreign Languages and the Department of European Law organise and implement the LLL Program for Legal Linguists, accredited by the Senate as the highest academic body of the university valued as at 18 ECTS
The target group is law graduates who want to improve their knowledge of English, French or German as languages for specific purposes so that they can work in EU institutions, in law firms or companies that are export-oriented and international business contacts. The goal is to strengthen the competencies of lawyers and their competitiveness on the labour market of both, their country and the EU as well. The training is conducted by academic staff, professors of foreign languages and European law. As B/H approaches membership in the EU, there is a need for specialised lawyers and linguists to work in the EU institutions. The primary task of legal linguists is the legal and linguistic editing of EU legislation in all the official languages of the European Union. Legal linguists at the European Court of Justice in Luxembourg are in charge of translating court decisions and documents. Conditions for B/H Lawyers and linguists in the EU include a law degree (bachelor or master in law), excellent knowledge of the mother tongue, and a very good knowledge of at least two official languages of the European Union, primarily English, French or German. It is desirable to know European public law, how to organise the main European institutions, the types of decisions that are made and how to vote in the institutions, then a practical search of databases related to European law with instructions on the use of translation tools.

Neighbouring countries which are already full members of the EU, have recognised the need for one-semester professional training for lawyers with a focus on translating and editing legal texts, as well as EU legal terminology. It has been done through one-semester professional training within HEIs, i.e. law faculties with academic lecturers who have been engaged at the same institutions. The program was developed in consultation with legal linguists from the Council of the EU and the European Central Bank and is intended primarily for legal linguists, but also for all other lawyers who meet the need for communication in foreign languages and translation of legal texts.

A similar training program was organised in B/H by the Directorate for European Integration according to the adopted training plan in the field of European integration for 2021 with the prescribed academic hours of classroom training and training in the form of webinars. The duration of classical training in the classroom envisages from a minimum of 7 to a maximum of 16 academic hours, depending on the type of module. The duration of the training in the form of webinars envisages from a minimum of 4.5 hours to a maximum of 10 academic hours depending on the type of module. The number of ECTS credits awarded for both classical classroom training and webinar training varies between 3 and 4 ECTS credits, respectively, according to the type of each module.

The annual work program envisaged about 45 general trainings in the field of European integration done by certified lecturers. The training plan for 2021 was based on projections of the number of trainings in the Work Program of the Directorate and the Council of Ministers of B/H, and according to the results of the Training Needs Analysis and the dynamics of realised trainings in previous years. The syllabi of training in the field of European integration prescribed the content of the training, the duration in the form of academic hours, the description of the training with objectives, the target group of participants, learning outcomes and methods of implementation for each of the active modules.

The trainings were financed from the Directorate budget. The trainings were planned for the professional development of civil servants in BH institutions, and the B/H Civil Service Agency has determined that each training is to be evaluated by the appropriate number of credits for classroom training or webinar training. The target group for trainings are members of bodies in the system of coordination of the European integration process, civil servants employed in

---

2 Study of the Professional Development Program for Legal Linguists within the Concept of LLL, University of J.J. Strossmayer, Faculty of Law Osijek, 2012. Proof of attendance, success in tests, and the amount of tuition fees were prescribed by internal acts of HEIs.
institutions at all levels of government in B/H who directly perform tasks related to European integration and coordination of the process of B/H accession to the EU. Training on the European integration process is conducted through the e-learning module, which is accessed by a registered user through a username and password assigned by the Directorate to the institution upon request, and used by all employees of the institution. The module Communication skills in English is currently in the process of European integration.

Table 1: Training in the field of European integration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of training in the field of European integration</th>
<th>Number of trainings in 2021</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>European Union law</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods, ways and techniques of harmonisation of legislation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European economic integration</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic planning in the context of EU pre-accession assistance programming</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project cycle management and project preparation for the purposes of EU pre-accession assistance programming</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation and editing of legal regulations in the process of European integration</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reporting skills for the needs of the European integration process</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicating the process of European integration</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication skills in English in the process of European integration</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiation in the process of accession to the EU</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Territorial cooperation programs</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL TRAININGS</strong></td>
<td><strong>45</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. CONCLUSION

Bosnia and Herzegovina's approach to the EU indicated the need for professional training of lawyers to work in EU institutions. This implies a good knowledge of domestic law, then European public law and EU institutions, with a good knowledge of English, German or French. The European Strategic Framework for LLL in Practice was discussed and adopted in Lisbon in March 2000 by European Council. B/H is expected to apply in practice a continuous approach to learning in order to acquire knowledge and skills, to further invest in own citizens, to develop learning methods through HEIs, to create continuity in LLL, to improve and evaluate participation in this type of training, to provide access to information and all that at the level closest to the citizens. The legal system and legislation of the EU are very specific and complex, with the transfer of competences of the member states to the EU (exclusive, shared and coordinating competences). The organisation of individual European institutions and the decision-making process within them, as well as understanding the basics and significance of the Stabilisation and Association Agreement with B/H are issues that have been more or less studied at all law faculties in B/H, with analysis of EU case law. There is a lack of practical knowledge and work to achieve competitiveness and seize the opportunity to work in and for the EU institutions. Therefore, it is important to improve new knowledge and acquire skills in the field of methods, ways and

---

3 Taken from the European Integration Training Plan for 2021. Directorate for European Integration, p. 4. DEI, December 2020.
techniques of harmonisation of B/H legislation with the *acquis communautaire*, as well as translation and editing of legal regulations for the needs of the European integration process. There are terminological specifics in these areas, the appropriate translation methodology and professional editing of legal regulations and translations are used in order to harmonise with the *acquis*.

6. LITERATURE
https://epso.europa.eu
Zakon o obrazovanju odraslih Unsko Sanskog kantona (Šlužbeni glasnik Unsko Sanskog kantona, broj: 15/21)
WE’RE GETTING ENGAGED! FOSTERING STUDENT ENGAGEMENT IN A VIRTUAL LIBRARY INSTRUCTION

April R. Manabat
Nazarbayev University, Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan, april.manabat@nu.edu.kz

ABSTRACT
Keeping students engaged can be considered one of the most challenging tasks in a one-shot library instruction. Given the limited time for these kinds of sessions (usually 50 mins to an hour), it became even more apparent when librarians were forced to teach these sessions in a virtual setup as the pandemic substantially changed the mode of instruction. Fostering student engagement through introduction of various tools and applications as well as implementing some teaching strategy during the session is now the name of the game and librarians are now expanding their horizons to incorporate these new strategies into their sessions. This presentation documents how students were kept engaged in an online library session conducted at Nazarbayev University (NU) Library. Use of various tools and applications such as Padlet, Quizziz, and Slido were implemented to ensure student engagement. In addition, the experiences of Subject Librarians including the challenges encountered and the ideas for improvement in teaching the sessions were also shared in this presentation.

Key words: student engagement, virtual library instruction, information literacy, one-shot sessions

1. INTRODUCTION
One of the most challenging tasks of the librarian in a one-shot library instruction is keeping students engaged. Given the limited time for these kinds of sessions (usually 50 mins to an hour), it became even more apparent when librarians were forced to teach these sessions in a virtual setup as the pandemic substantially changed the mode of instruction. Fostering student engagement through introduction of various tools and applications as well as implementing some teaching strategy during the session is now the trend and librarians are expanding their horizons to incorporate these new strategies into their sessions.

1.1. Online One-Shot Library Sessions
One-shot library sessions or instructions are single session of library instruction that usually 50 to 70 minutes in length (Buchanan & McDonough, 2021, p. 2). In the embedded librarianship model where librarians found themselves engaged in numerous activities in support of lifelong learning and information literacy, one-shot library instructions are also referred to as the delivery of library resources and information literacy skills typically taught at the beginning of a content-specific course to assist students with research-oriented assignments or projects (Phelps-Ward et al., 2015). Being a service-oriented arm of any educational institutions, libraries provides these kinds of session to foster user education and enhance lifelong learning experience to library patrons.

With the advent of technology to access information (Walker & Pearce, 2014) and now, with the obvious reasons bought by the COVID-19 pandemic (Joe, 2020), one-shot library instruction would entail some level of effort from the librarians to ensure that students learned from the session. The challenge to achieve a certain level of engagement and keeping it throughout the session became even more apparent as the librarians found themselves conducting the session in a completely online and synchronous setup. Unlike the face-to-face library sessions wherein librarians can determine if the students learned from the session through their gestures, online one-shot library instructions calls for the librarians to be more creative and innovative in their instructions to ensure that students understand the session (Yap & Manabat, 2021). With the change in the modality of instructions, some librarians still find it hard to position themselves as a valuable asset in the instructional landscape not just due to the limited time given to a one-shot session (Walker & Pearce, 2014) but also due to some frustrations and limitations such as its...
difficulty to assess, limitations set by the course instructors’ syllabus and assignment, and its repetitiveness to teach the lessons (Kong & Powell, 2017, p. 5). And with that limitations, issues on how to keep students engage will always be one of the challenges librarians are facing in conducting one-shot library instructions.

1.2. Constructivism, Active Learning, and Student Engagement

Designing and developing a sound and engaging online library instruction is indeed a resource-intensive task (Turnbow & Roth, 2020, p. 3). One of the challenges in a one-shot library instruction is keeping the students engaged. Learner-centered strategy is a best teaching approach as it encourages conversation, reflection, and application since it establishes connections between the learner and the content through inquiry and discovery (Buchanan & McDonough, 202, p. 57). As noted by Lacy and Chen (2013), learner-focused approaches can be seen in an outcome-based instructional design and learning is attained when the students can demonstrate their knowledge.

To help achieve a more learner-centered and engaging online library instructions, librarians need to inject some active learning activities, thus, encouraging students to be engaged and to willingly participates in the discussion (Joe, 2020).

Active learning is an umbrella term that encompasses a variety of student-centered activities (Buchanan & McDonough, 2021). Used interchangeably with experiential learning which literally means learning through experiences (Buchanan & McDonough, 2021, p. 62), active learning encourages students’ involvement in doing things and be more aware with what they are doing (Lacy & Chen, 2013). As an effect of constructivism which highlights that learning happens best when learners are instructed to work on the provided information (Joe, 2020, p. 58), active learning can be applied to library sessions by incorporating activities that are in line with the objectives of the session and that would encourage participation from the learners through various activities that invigorates engagement.

Incorporating learner-centered and active learning activities in a one-shot library instruction has been observed as a great way to foster student engagement. This has been evident in some studies that highlight ways on how to keep students engage whether in a face-to-face or online setup. For instance, the use of clickers or web polling applications as an engagement tool to generate audience responses created changes in the classroom setup wherein the clicker-enhanced instructional sessions has been observed to be effective in exploring concepts and facilitating discussions (Walker & Pearce, 2014). Employing the use of Web 2.0 or internet-based tools such as social media platforms (e.g. Facebook, Instagram, YouTube), LibGuides, online quiz software (e.g. Kahoot), Blackboard Collaborate, spatial tools for digital humanities-related sessions, and Mentimeter (Kong & Powell, 2017; Joe, 2020; Shire & McKinney, 2021; Yap & Manabat, 2021) were also highlighted to encourage student engagement in a one-shot sessions. As noted by Emmelhainz (2019), both faculty and librarians can benefit from engaged students in discussion and demonstrations on doing their own research.

Keeping learners engaged will always be one of the challenges in an online instruction. All the more in a virtual setup where the learners are asked to participate through online videoconferencing platforms such as Zoom, Microsoft Teams, and GoogleMeet, some learners felt exhausted and extremely tired as it requires some level of emotional effort to participate in online meetings, otherwise known as Zoom fatigue (Messner, 2021). The study conducted by Yap and Manabat (2021) revealed that subject librarians at NU Library need to create more opportunities for interaction by employing more interesting virtual activities to retain attention of students who easily get bored in an online session. This further signify that employing these kinds of activities will help ensure that learners will be able to learn the lesson. Especially if these activities are fun and elicits interests, learners will be able to understand the concepts and retained what they have learned as well (Markey et al., 2014).
I.3. The NU Library’s Information Literacy Program

With the mission to develop active lifelong learners and critical thinkers, the Nazarbayev University (NU) Library and Information Literacy (LILY) Program was launched to achieve student success across all schools of the University (Zvonareva & Yap, 2018). Launched in 2018, the program aims to help improve the students’ abilities to search, access, evaluate, apply, and acknowledge the right information they need (Nazarbayev University Library, 2021). The study conducted by Emmelhainz (2019) highlighted how it can improve the library instruction offered at NU by inviting the librarians to conduct a session as research coaches and work collaboratively with the professors to develop lifelong learners and critical thinkers. The NU Library Information Literacy Program is comprised of five (5) modules that helps to achieve student success. Table 1 below describes the modules as well as their expected learning outcomes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Module</th>
<th>Learning Outcome</th>
<th>Sample Topics (but not limited to)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Module 1: Searching for Information</strong></td>
<td>Identify the need for information and find the right resources by exploring various search strategies to be able to answer research questions.</td>
<td>Database searching, Keyword formulation/development, Searching strategies, Developing research topics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Module 2: Evaluating Information</strong></td>
<td>Discern diverse sources and formats of information and distinguish the appropriate level of publication types by its currency, relevance, authority, accuracy, and purpose in order to evaluate and use these resources to support arguments and hypotheses.</td>
<td>Applying evaluation methods (e.g. CRAAP, SIFT, BEAM, ACT UP), Sources of information, Popular vs. Scholarly sources, Avoiding predatory journals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Module 3: Citing Sources</strong></td>
<td>Search, collect, manage, refer and cite reliable information as evidence.</td>
<td>Citing and referencing, Citation styles (e.g. APA, MLA, Chicago, etc.), Citation management software (e.g. Mendeley, Zotero, EndNote).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Module 4: Avoiding Plagiarism</strong></td>
<td>Differentiate own ideas and the intellectual property of others to demonstrate academic integrity and use information ethically.</td>
<td>Academic integrity, How to avoid plagiarism, Ethical use of information, Research ethics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Library Orientation</strong></td>
<td>Familiarize with the resources and services offered by the Library.</td>
<td>Library collections, Library services, Library programs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Faculty members can request all modules or selected modules depending on their course requirements. Each module can be conducted as a one-shot session where librarians are invited to conduct a library session for 50 to 70 minutes. Before the session, the librarian, in collaboration with the faculty, plans out the session. This includes identifying the preferred schedule, determining the expected number of participants, as well as pointing out the necessary topics or specific contents that the librarians should focus on.
during the session. A usual session may have 5-25 participants depending on the number of students per class. There are times that the professors invite other professors who have their classes on the same time so at most, the participants may reach up to 40 to over a hundred. It is also in this stage that the librarians should think of creative ways on how to make the session more engaging and interesting for the learners.

During the session, the librarian is expected to facilitate the entire session and make sure that the objectives of the session were achieved. Classroom management even in the online setting should also be carried out. Carrying out the necessary activities towards the achievement of the session’s goal such as the active learning activities should also be considered during this time.

After the session, the librarian should also make sure that the learning outcomes has been achieved and that an assessment of the session has been carried out. This includes providing a feedback mechanism or post-session evaluation form for the learners to accomplished or even by just asking for some comments or reactions not just from the learners but also from the professors as well.

2. OBJECTIVES

The abovementioned literatures highlight the importance of keeping the student engaged in a one-shot library session whether in a face-to-face or online setup. The more learner experience the lesson whether through applied or gamified approach, the better chance that the learner understands the lesson and retained what they have learned. With the change in the modality of instructions, this became a very challenging task for instructional and embedded librarians who are taking the lead in facilitating a class session in a limited time.

This paper documents how students were kept engaged in an online one-shot library session conducted by a subject librarian at Nazarbayev University (NU) Library. Use of various tools and applications such as Padlet, Quizziz, and Slido were implemented to ensure student engagement during the session. In addition, the experiences of subject librarian including the challenges encountered and the ideas for improvement in teaching the sessions were also shared in this paper.

3. METHODOLOGY

This paper employs a personal narrative approach of the qualitative research to document how students were kept engaged in an online one-shot library session conducted by a subject librarian at Nazarbayev University (NU) Library by incorporating some activities to foster student engagement. Personal narratives may serve many purpose such as to remember, argue, convince, engage, or entertain target audience to convey meaningful experiences (Reissman, 2001) and as Mishler (1995) noted and cited by Reissman, (2001), “we continually restory our pasts, shifting the relative significance of different events for whom we have become, discovering connections we had previously been unaware of, repositioning ourselves and others in our networks of relationships.” With regards to this paper, the personal narratives and observations of the researcher helped in understanding how she fostered student engagement in conducting one-shot sessions. The use of internet-based tools such as Padlet, Quizziz, and Slido in her library instructions has encourage the learners to participate and apply the knowledge and skills they learned from the session. In addition, the study only highlighted sessions that discussed three (3) modules of the NU Library Information Literacy (IL) program which includes Modules 1, 2, and 3 such as Searching for Information, Evaluating Sources, and Citing Sources (e.g. APA Workshop), respectively. These sessions were conducted separately from June 2020 to Oct 2021.

4. DISCUSSION

Keeping the learners engaged will always be a challenge for the librarians whether in a face-to-face or online one-shot sessions. Given the limited time, the librarian should make the effort and
think of creative and innovative strategies to ensure an engaging, fun, and interesting library instruction. The use of internet-based tools such as Padlet, Quizziz and Slido will help the librarians to encourage student engagement and in one way or another, help overcome boredom and Zoom fatigue in online sessions. This paper documents how students were kept engaged in an online one-shot library session conducted by a subject librarian at Nazarbayev University (NU) Library using the various interactive tools to encourage student engagement.

4.1. The Learners
The NU library sessions aims to target students across all schools of Nazarbayev University (NU). These includes undergraduate and graduate students. Undergraduate students are those enrolled in the 4-year educational program or bachelor’s degree in any of the NU schools. The graduate students are those enrolled in the Master’s or Doctorate (PhD) programs in any of the schools (Nazarbayev University, 2016). Since the researcher is the subject librarian of School of Sciences and the Humanities (SSH) at the time of the study, most of the learners were students who were taking some subjects under SSH such as those enrolled in WCS (Rhetoric and Composition) classes of the Writing Center Program.

4.2. The Interactive Tools
The subject librarian made use of Padlet, Quizziz, and Slido during her one-shot sessions to encourage student engagement in the discussion. These tools were used since it is customizable and easy to use. In addition, the learners do not need to install any applications to access these tools. However, a need for stable or good internet connection is a must to ensure functionality of the tool will not be compromised during the session. Given the same reason, the discretion to participate or use the tools during the session lies on the learners’ preferences.

Padlet. It is a software people use to make and share content with others. Somewhere between a document and a full-pledge website, it empowers everyone to make the content they want whether it is a quick bulletin board, a blog, or a portfolio. It is also easy and intuitive, inclusive, collaborative, flexible, portable, and secure (Sese, 2021). The link to each Padlet can be shared to the participants and they can start adding more comments or post freely. This can be used for free or with a fee (premium account).

Quizziz. It is a gamified student engagement platform that offers multiple features to make a classroom fun, interactive and engaging. Teachers can conduct formative assessments, assign homework, and other interactions with the students in a captivating way. It has instructor and student paced quizzes, customizable, shareable, and can generate reports if needed (Quizziz.com, 2021). This can also be used for free.

Slido. It is an easy to use Q&A and polling platform for live remote or hybrid meetings, classes, events, and webinars. This helps to bridge the gap between the speakers and the audience through a simple link or QR code (Slido.com, 2021). This can also be used for free or with a fee.

4.3. Incorporating Interactive Tools in One-Shot Library Sessions
The librarian incorporated the use of internet-based tools such as Padlet, Quizziz, and Slido in her library instructions to encourage the learners to participate and apply the knowledge and skills they learned from the session. This study only highlighted sessions that discussed three (3) modules of the NU Library Information Literacy (IL) program which includes Modules 1, 2, and 3 such as Searching for Information, Evaluating Sources, and Citing Sources (e.g. APA Workshop), respectively. These sessions were conducted separately from June 2020 to Oct 2021.
4.3.1. Module 1: Searching for Information.
Under Module 1, one of the topics being taught to the students is a search strategy of keyword formulation to help them generate a more narrowed and relevant search results. In keyword formulation, students were asked to generate more relevant keywords or synonyms from their research or assessment questions which they can use as an alternative or possible words to search for more relevant information. This is because some articles or resources will not be using the exact words in the research question but instead, will be using synonyms or related words. To formulate keywords, students can use thesaurus or dictionaries to see relationship of the words.
In this topic, the librarian asked the students to formulate or generate more keywords based on the given research question “How does social networks mobilize protest movements among teenagers?” A Padlet link was shared to the learners and they can add comments or post to the Padlet. Using Padlet, the librarian encouraged student engagement by adding more related keywords or synonyms. Picture 1 below shows how learners engaged in this keyword formulation activity.

4.3.2. Module 2: Evaluating Sources
For Module 2, students are being taught to assess sources by applying various evaluation methods or techniques such as CRAAP (i.e. Currency, Relevance, Authority, Accuracy, & Purpose). This includes critical thinking skills in evaluating various information sources such as websites on online contents and examining the details such as the credibility of the creator or the source; the comprehensiveness and accuracy of the data and statistics; and the motivation or purpose why the information exists among others.
In this particular topic, the librarian asked the students to evaluate the given scenarios and examples and asked their opinions and perceptions. This stimulated discussion and engagement among learners by thinking out of the box and applying the evaluation methods. The Pictures 2 and 3 depicts such discussions.
2. A Padlet exercise on how to evaluate the source of information in terms of Purpose. (CRAAP)

Picture 3. A Padlet exercise on how to evaluate the source of information in terms of Authority. (CRAAP)

Aside from Padlet, the librarian also used Quizizz, a gamified student engagement platform to incorporate an interactive quiz at the end of the session. Even the professors took part on the 10-item quiz and eagerly joined the students in answering the questions about evaluating sources. The questions were in multiple choice format and requires learners to click the right answers.
Quizziz also provided a very straightforward analysis of the scores from the participants and the collective class accuracy percentage based on the scores of the participants. Picture 4 provides an overview of the Quizziz platform while tables 2 and 3 shows the quiz details of two sessions conducted incorporating Quizziz as well as the number of participants and the class accuracy percentage based on the learners’ scores.

![Quizziz platform with scores of student and accuracy percentage](image)

**Picture 4. Quizziz platform with scores of student and accuracy percentage**

**Table 2. Quiz summary for a one-shot library session on evaluating sources (1st session)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Game Started On</td>
<td>Thu 26 Aug 2021, 02:07 PM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Game Type</td>
<td>Live Quiz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Attempts</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class Accuracy</td>
<td>92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Game Ends On</td>
<td>Thu 26 Aug 2021, 02:36 PM</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3.3. Module 3: Citing Sources
Citing and referencing as well as the specific citation styles such as APA, MLA and Chicago were being discussed in Module 3. This includes determining which sources should be cited or not. This also includes attention to details especially on following various citation formatting styles and guidelines. The use of various citation management tools like Zotero, Mendeley and EndNote are also being taught in this session.

For this one-shot sessions, the librarian asked the students to determine which sources should be cited as well as identifying the missing elements in an APA or MLA sample reference entries. Pictures 5 to 7 shows how students were engaged in answering such questions on references and citation styles.

![Picture 5. A Padlet exercise on determining which sources should have a reference](image_url)
4.3.4. Library Instruction: APA 7th Ed. Workshop
The NU Library also conducts workshops that are more focused on a certain topic such as the APA 7th edition workshops. This particular workshop was in partnership with the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Justice and Security of the NU Student Government and in celebration of the Academic Integrity Week. This includes teaching the students on how to be a responsible scholar by citing their sources using the APA 7th edition formatting style.
For this particular session, the librarian made use of Padlet and Slido to encourage student engagement during the workshop. At some point during the lecture, the librarian incorporated some ice breakers to ensure that the students would not get bored as session would require attention to some details such as punctuations and formatting. To provide a more practical applications of the APA referencing, the students were asked to create an APA entry for various source type. Pictures 8 shows participants’ interaction through Slido through world cloud, poll, and a short quiz while Picture 9 shows the Padlet activity on creating an APA entry for various source types such as book, master’s thesis, YouTube video, and a Facebook posts. However, due to limited time, the students wasn’t able to finish the task.

Picture 8. A Slido interaction report for the APA 7th ed. workshop
Despite some time limitations, it can be noted that students were kept engaged during these one-shot sessions. The interactive tools that were introduced and incorporated during the sessions has helped in making the session more engaging and fun.

4.4. Some Feedback and Observations
Keeping the student engaged during a one-shot session is indeed challenging. Aside from making sure that the librarians should know the topic to be discussed, there is a need for the librarians to be more creative in making the session more engaging and interesting. This also includes ensuring that the tools will work smoothly as well as the learners didn’t feel forced to participate or engage in the session if they don’t want to. Despite such challenges, it was overwhelming to know that some students and professors appreciated the librarians’ effort on making the session engaging by incorporating such interactive activities. One student expressed how she enjoyed using Padlet and how it helped applied the knowledge obtained during the session: “I liked the session. It was very informative and interesting. Especially, I liked the Padlet task; it helped me to practice and reinforce the gained knowledge.” A professor also expressed how she appreciates incorporating interactive activities in finding errors in an APA citation: “It was great! Appreciated the interactive nature of finding mistakes or omissions and parley was a creative approach.”

In addition, other subject librarians should be encourage to incorporate new, interactive, and engaging activities or tools to keep the students engage. Exploring more interactive tools as well as various teaching strategies should also be considered to help achieve students success across NU schools. The librarians should think outside of the box and be more collaborative with faculty and students to develop more critical thinkers and lifelong learners.

5. CONCLUSION
While this study documents how the students were kept engaged in a one-shot session and some learners found these one-shot sessions engaging, there are still so many areas that needs to be improved. This includes keeping more students engaged not just during the sessions but also after.
the sessions to ensure that the knowledge gained during the sessions will still be applied in doing their research or writing their assignments. As noted by Walker & Pearce (2014) in their study, with the very nature of one-shot sessions which is being conducted in a limited time only, engagement may not occur or if it will, it may not have such lasting effect. This seems to hint another important issue that needs to be rethink and revisit, which is the ineffectiveness of one-shot sessions in information literacy landscape (Walker & Pearce, 2014, p. 23).

This study is a personal narrative of one subject librarian only and it would also be good to know how other subject librarians are doing in their respective sessions. Furthermore, it would also be interesting to explore having full-time instructional librarians who will conduct library instructions as part of a general education subject or core courses for all students. This will help the librarians to hone their teaching skills and reposition their role as a valuable asset in the instructional landscape.

6. LITERATURES


